



SOCIAL SCIENCES UNIVERSITY OF ANKARA
INSTITUTE OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

ABDUL HAMİD CHOCHAN

**A COMPARATIVE DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF INDIAN VS.
PAKISTANI MEDIA COVERAGE ON THE PULWAMA ATTACK**

MASTER'S THESIS

2021

ANKARA SOCIAL SCIENCES UNIVERSITY

SOCIAL SCIENCES INSTITUTE

ABDUL HAMİD CHOCHAN

185411017

THESIS SUPERVISOR: DR. NEVFEL BOZ

**A COMPARATIVE DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF INDIAN VS.
PAKISTANI MEDIA COVERAGE ON THE PULWAMA ATTACK**

MASTER'S THESIS

2021

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

When I decided to go after my dream of improving my academic abilities and skills it was the time in my life when generally people settle down with whatever they already have. However, I was lucky enough to have a fully supportive family behind me. Being able to successfully complete a part of my postgraduate studies at one of the most prestigious and promising universities in the field of social sciences research, Ankara University of Social Sciences (ASBU) under the guidance of brilliant academic staff makes me proud and feel honoured.

I want to pay my special gratitude to my advisor Dr. Nevfel Boz for his kind guidance and 7/24 assistance because without his inspiration and timely cautions I would not have completed my thesis on time.

I will always be grateful to all of my teachers for their tireless efforts to make me what I was not before joining their classes. Especially, my heart and mind goes to Dr. Venessa Tinker whose wonderful way of teaching helped me to really understand and own the field of Peace and Conflict Studies. Dr. Tinker has been a great inspiration for me to pursue any role as a mediator and negotiator in future.

My special thanks and gratitudes to Dr. Hatice Çelik and Associate Prof. Dr. Memet Özey for their last minute life saving suggestions which have made my thesis even more meaningful.

Last but not the least, I thank my wife Sibel whose magic and sacrifices have always kept myself and our four daughters ready to continue with our academic quest.

ABSTRACT

This thesis aimed to find out the role played by the opposing media outlets in the evolution of the Kashmir conflict in the aftermath of the Pulwama attack in the Indian Administered Kashmir. I have tried to strictly adhere to the facts and figures published by the selected Indian and Pakistani English newspapers Indian Express and Dawn News respectively.

A comparative discourse analysis has been made of the news, columns and editorials of the newspapers Indian Express and Dawn News between February 14, 2019 and August 5, 2019. The analysis of different stories, columns, and news published in Indian express and Dawn News shows the blame game against each other's state. While analyzing the answering of the question i.e. 'Did they (Dawn News & Indian Express) show biasness during publishing news regarding the Pulwama attack? It has been revealed that Dawn News and Indian Express published stories in favor of their respective states or in support of some of the statesmen which showed a partially subjective attitude of these two English Newspapers.

Also, the deep analysis of the news of Indian Express and Dawn News showed that Indian Express used a larger number of words to blame Pakistan for the Pulwama attack. In this respect, the Indian Express used an aggressive approach to report the Pulwama attack and tried to prove India the victim in this incident. Dawn News and Indian Express have praised their respective governments while dealing with the incident of the Pulwama attack. Dawn News generally published the news based on denial of the Indian official claims by the Pakistan officials.

Key words: Pulwama attack, Kashmir conflict, Indian Administered Kashmir,

Comparative discourse analysis

ÖZ

HİNDİSTAN VE PAKİSTAN MEDYASINDA PULWAMA SALDIRISININ KARŞILAŞTIRMALI SÖYLEM ANALİZİ

Bu tez Hindistan'ın yönettiği Keşmir'deki Pulwama saldırısının ardından Keşmir çatışmasının evriminde karşıt medya kuruluşlarının oynadığı rolü bulmayı amaçlamaktadır. Bu amaçla Indian Express ve Dawn News gazeteleri seçilmiş olup Hindistan ve Pakistan kaynaklı bu iki İngilizce gazetenin yayınladıkları olgular ve rakamlara sıkı sıkıya bağlı kalınmıştır.

Araştırmaya teorik bir temel oluşturmak için çoğunlukla Barış ve Çatışma Çalışmaları alanındaki literatürüne ek olarak Keşmir çatışmasının tarihsel arka planı için çatışmanın tarihi ile ilgili literatür kullanılmıştır. Keşmir çatışmasını uzun süren ve önemli bir sosyal çatışma yapan olgular, tezde ayrıntılı olarak tartışılmıştır ve İsrail-Filistin çatışması ve Kıbrıs sorunu gibi diğer güncel çatışmalar ile karşılaştırılarak tartışılmıştır.

14 Şubat 2019 - 5 Ağustos 2019 tarihleri arasında Indian Express ve Dawn News gazetelerinin haber, köşe ve başyazılarının karşılaştırmalı söylem analizi yapılmıştır. Bu tezde son olarak Keşmir'de 14 Şubat 2019 - 5 Ağustos 2019 tarihleri arasında olan önemli olayları takiben yayınlanan haberlerin derin analizi yapılmıştır.

Anahtar Kelimeler; Pulwama saldırısı, Keşmir çatışması, Hindistan'nın yönettiği Keşmir, karşılaştırmalı söylem analizi

ABBREVIATIONS

GDP	Gross Domestic Product
ISI	Inter-Services Intelligence
LoC	Line of Control
BJP	Bhartiya Janta Party
FATF	Financial Action Task Force
NIA	National Investigation Agency of India
IED	Improvised Explosive Device
NSA	Non-state actor
MEA	Ministry of External Affairs of India
MFN	Most Favorite Nation
SCO	Shanghai Cooperation Organization
FO	Foreign Office
NSC	National Security Council
USA	United States of America
RAW	Research and Analysis Wing of India
ICC	The International Criminal Court
SC	Supreme Court
UNSC	The United Nations Security Council
JD	Jamat-e-Dawah
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
FI	Falah-e-Insaniyat

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	ii
ABSTRACT.....	iii
ÖZ.....	iv
ABBREVIATIONS.....	v
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	vi
LIST OF TABLES.....	viii
1. Introduction.....	1
1.1. The Role of Media in Conflicts.....	7
1.2. Effect of Media on Kashmir Conflict.....	8
1.3. Effect of Media on Peace and Conflict Studies.....	10
1.4. A Brief History of the Kashmir Conflict Between India and Pakistan.....	12
1.5. The Pulwama Attack and its Reverberations in Regional Media.....	16
1.6. Purpose of Study.....	23
1.7. The Importance of Study.....	24
1.8. Limitations of Research.....	25
2. Methodology and Theoretical Framework.....	25
2.1. Research Questions.....	27
3. Findings.....	28
3.1. The Analysis of the News.....	28
3.2. Micro Analysis.....	34
3.3. Macro Structural Analysis.....	36
4. Results and Discussion.....	41

4.1. Pulwama Attack and Blame Game.....	46
4.2. Is Pulwama Attack an Avenge of the State Terrorism.....	49
4.3. State Level Talks and Sharing of Evidence Regarding the Pulwama Attack..	50
4.4. Did Modi government use Pulwama attack to its Advantage.....	52
4.5. Pulwama Attack and Its Impacts on Kashmiri People.....	53
4.6. Article 370 and Article 35A of the Indian Constitution.....	55
4.7. Facts Sharing Regarding the Pulwama Attack.....	56
4.8. Pulwama Attack and Politicians' Perspective.....	58
REFERENCES.....	63
APPENDICES.....	72

LIST OF TABLES TABLE

Table No 01.....21

Table No 02.....28

Table No 03.....29

Table No 04.....30

Table No 05.....44

Table No 06.....45

Table No 07.....46



This page intentionally left blank

1. INTRODUCTION

This study titled “A comparative discourse analysis of Indian vs. Pakistani media coverage on the Pulwama attack” aims to discuss details of the background and factors leading to the Pulwama attack on February 14, 2019 and what happened until August 5, 2019. The role played of the Indian and Pakistani media in the escalation of tensions between India and Pakistan. A comparative discourse analysis of the Indian and Pakistani media is sought to draw a clear picture of the events that took place in the aftermath of the Pulwama attack. The sequence of the important incidents before the Pulwama attack and after the Pulwama attack have been mentioned in Table 1 and Table 2.

Communications are vital in the establishment of societies and evolution of conflicts and how they are shaped and executed. Mass media have a transformative effect on the nature of a conflict and its resolution. Mass communications generally act as a double edged sword. They inform and educate to empower and unite people as well as divide and turn them against each other. The mass societies are created by newspapers by helping them to educate and inform their citizens as well as create a literate public opinion. However, they fostered hatred, expressed one sided sentiments and aspirations and triggered the great wars of the twentieth century. When there are wars and conflicts public wants to hear what it likes to hear and rejects the other things whether true or false. It acts according to its own prejudices regarding the opposite side (Ramsbotham, et al, 2011, p. 360).

In the contemporary societies radio, television and newspapers analyze current news and manipulate them in line with their interests to make an impact on the society. This way they can fortify identity of their favorite party in the conflict because a realistic reporting would not be suitable for their purpose. So the critical role played by the media, either positive or negative, can be determined through the nature of their reporting (Bajraktari, 2007).

The journalists emphasize on the significance of a detailed and objective coverage of the events using more than one source. Despite all, they may deviate from their objectivity and can be overwhelmed by their nationalistic and religious sentiments. Their working environment is dominated by some special interest inclinations. Their own financial needs and desires may force them to bow before the paying hands of their own society for whom they work for. Even though popular media outlets believe in the principle of editorial independence and criticize their authorities, they have to be considerate of the sensitivities of the majority they assist to establish. This is why communities served by these contemporary media remain divided. This is the very reason atmospheres of conflicts are actually created and nourished by the media itself in which they are contested and resolved (Ramsbotham, et al, 2011, p. 360,361).

The same can be applied for the ongoing Civil War in Syria and the occupation of Palestine. The strained relations of the nuclear rivals Pakistan and India in the Kashmir conflict have also been affected because of so many different narratives. Each of these narratives are presented as a truth while these are built on propaganda and politically inspired agenda for which certain media outlets are being paid (Jayakumar, 2016).

The dominant actors would like the conflict to remain off-limits and away from the international public opinion while suppressed and weaker actors would like to bring the conflict to social level and would try to include their allies in their cause and increase perception of their suffering. Local media on the other hand provides an opportunity for the respective community members in the conflict to reduce animosity through media instead of fighting because it has a place in the grassroots of the society (Bajraktari, et al., 2007).

While making a comparative discourse analysis of the Indian vs. Pakistani media on the Pulwama attack in the context of the Kashmir Conflict we have to apprehend characteristics of the issue of Kashmir. Also it is imperative to understand nature of the Kashmir Conflict and other conflicts of the similar nature in the World to better understand what actually paved the way for such incidents like the Pulwama attack. The Kashmir conflict has led to a number of interstate wars between India and Pakistan. The Kashmir conflict has been ignored by the international community for a long time.

It engages the international agenda whenever any standoff between two nuclear rivals India and Pakistan takes place. By definition this conflict is one of the major conflicts in the World. The long dragged clashes between more than one countries or a country and a militant organization involving one thousand or more deaths in the battle ground are called the major armed conflicts while the Kashmir conflict is one of them (SIPRI, 1997: Ramsbotham, et al, 2011, p. 65).

The typology of the Kashmir conflict is both identity/cession conflict as mentioned by Singer and Holsti (SIPRI, 1997: Ramsbotham, et al, 2011, p. 65) and a territory conflict in which contested deprivations of the right to gain more share in land as well as separation and independence are demanded Then there are ethno-nationalist groups which have been sustaining their peaceful as well as an armed struggle to secure their independence or their unification with relatives in the neighboring countries. They have been using different militant tactics including terrorism and guerilla warfare (Gurr, 1995: Ramsbotham, et al, 2011, p. 66).

However, in this particular case of the Kashmir conflict Edward Azar's theory of protracted social conflict (PSC) has to be considered for the basis of the discussion The protracted social conflicts develop because of the surrounding reasons and actually do not exist among the countries beforehand. There are some hidden and obvious factors that are matured with the efforts of propaganda machines of some special interest groups. The co-ordinated network of 265 sites operates across 65 countries, according to a report by EU Disinfo lab, a Brussels-based NGO. The researchers traced the websites to an Indian company, Srivastava Group. The network was also found to involve groups responsible for anti-Pakistan lobbying events in Europe (Carmichael, Hussain, 16 December 2019).

Within a certain period of time these existing features of a clash turn it into an all-out conflict. When we discuss and analyze a protracted social conflict in a community we take race, religion, ethnicity, culture etc. of different groups into account. When analyzing a protracted social conflict, we concentrate on the groups with different characteristics knowing that interaction and nature of bonds between these groups and their governments establish root causes of a conflict.

Azar called it as a disarticulation between the state and society as a whole. The way of undertaking personal and social necessities like safety identification and

reputation of an individual is also an important determinant in the evolution of a conflict (Azar, 1985: Ramsbotham, et al, 2011, p. 99-101). It will be beneficial to understand the Kashmir conflict in the perspective of other Intractable and Contracted Social Conflicts in the world.

Another Intractable and Contracted Social Conflict is the Cyprus conflict. The Greek and Turkish Cypriots had been living side by side for centuries. Following the independence from the British colonial rule in 1960 both communities had a constitution to rule the island together. Starting from 1964 communal violence had erupted that prompted the United Nations to deploy a peacekeeping force in the island. A coup d'état took place with the support of Greece in 1974. As a result, Turkey intervened and controlled one third of the island establishing a Turkish Cypriot administration in Northern Cyprus in August 1974. During the fighting with Turkish troops between 20th July and 16th August 1974 many Greek Cypriots died in combat. So far as possible their bodies were recovered and identified by Turkish forces. There were very few deaths of Greek Cypriots civilians (MFA, 2015)

The Turkish Cypriots proclaimed their republic in 1983. The Turkish Cypriots and the Greek Cypriots went to vote on the Annan Plan presented by UN Secretary General Kofi Annan. The Turkish Cypriots voted “yes” to the plan but Greek Cypriots rejected the plan in 2004 referendum contrary to anticipations (Yılmaz, 2005). The protracted Cyprus conflict has been on the world agenda for a long time and has evolved as an important conflict with several stages that changed its course due to unimaginable events in the world politics. To exemplify, the failed UN plan presented by UN secretary General Kofi Annan can be shown that resulted in the permanent membership of Cyprus in the European Union in 2004 (Dölkeleş, 2021).

Another major conflict is the Israel-Palestine conflict in which the UN Resolution 181 laid the foundation of Israel in 1947 with a plan to divide Palestine into Arab and Jewish state of Israel. The State of Israel, the West Bank and Gaza Strip were the three regions emerging from the territories of Palestine.

More than 700,000 Palestinians fled or were expelled from their homes and more than 400 Palestinian villages were destroyed in events around the establishment of the Israeli state in 1948 (HRW, 27 April 2), on June 5, 1967 Israeli Air Force conducted pre-

emptive strikes on the air bases of Egypt, Syria and Jordan and destroyed their air power that followed the occupation of Sinai Peninsula, Gaza, West Bank of River Jordan and Golan Heights. Following the 1973 war Egypt and Israel signed a cease-fire and peace agreement at Camp David. This accord left Palestinians alone and their right of self-determination and self-rule was dealt a serious blow. The first Intifada began in 1987 to protest Israeli occupation. The Oslo Accord I was signed in 1993 that gave the right to the Palestinians to have their own government on the condition of mutual recognition. Israel had to withdraw from 6 cities and 450 towns in line with the Oslo Accord II signed in 1995 (Barron, Ellenbogen, Yaffe, 2019).

The peace process between Israel and the Palestinian Authority was stalled in 2014 (Telhami 2015) after the Palestinian Authority formed a government with Hamas that had been designated as a terrorist group by the United States in 1997 because of its affiliation with the Egyptian Muslim Brotherhood (Davidson, 2006).

In 1960 the same fate had been waiting for the Cypriot Turks and Greeks. The concerns of minority Turks were not addressed properly despite the fact that the majority could override rights of the minority a non-viable system of government was given to the Island that collapsed in a few year time. The Cyprus conflict has been continuing as an intractable and contracted social conflict. When the Republic of Cyprus gained independence in 1960 from the United Kingdom, a power sharing partnership agreement between the two communities was laid out in its newly-minted constitution. Three years later, however, Cypriot President Archbishop Makarios III attempted to change the constitution, and Turkish Cypriots were expelled from the government. This caused intercommunal violence to break out (Turkish Heritage Organization, 2021)

The purpose of outlining these two Intractable and Contracted Social Conflicts, the Cyprus Conflict and the Israel-Palestine Conflict, is to explain how the concerning parties to the conflicts act in line with their own interests regardless of the rights of the peoples of the territories involved in the prolonged conflicts. The role of the international actors in the conflicts is also obvious.

The Kashmir conflict between India and Pakistan has a place right alongside the Arab-Israeli Conflict as the two longest-running violent conflicts in an already conflict ridden region. Both emerged out of the growing pains of decolonization, both have existed

– explicitly – since the 1940s, both have come at an intolerable cost of civilian lives, and both have revolved around disputed histories of legality in the case of the Kashmir conflict legality of Kashmir's accession to India in 1947 (Hernandez, 2020, p. 1).

Definitely, there are certain other factors which have shaped these conflicts through the passage of time. However, the essence of the discussion of the Kashmir Conflict with other conflicts is that there were some external factors and organizations which aggravated this conflict or failed to resolve the issue. Some of the fueling factors in the Kashmir conflict can be counted as economy, historical claims, India-Pakistan relations, Indo-China and Pakistan-China relations, US-India relations and power imbalances (Islam, N., p. 7)

The intractable conflicts are largely affected by outside factors and meddling of other countries into the internal affairs of the newly independent states. These intruding countries play with the religious and ethnic sensitivities of different groups and incite hatred among them to divide them. This way they act upon their divide and rule principle. When NGO's are involved in conflict resolutions they are more effective in solving the basic issues than the official authorities (Saunders, 1990). There are several, monitoring, advocacy, dialogue, mediation and negotiation organizations in the world working for the establishment of peace and resolving complicated conflicts. International Centre of Conflict and Negotiation (ICCN), International Crisis Group, Communities in Transition, The Centre for Humanitarian Dialogue, Dialogue Advisory Group, European Institute of Peace, Institute of Multi-Track Diplomacy and United States Institute of Peace are some of the Non-Governmental Organizations (Short, 2018, p. 8,10)

Generally, in intractable conflicts rival parties accuse one another for the deprivations and inequalities. They try to spread hatred against each other and this situation is described as The 'Principled Negotiation' theory (Fisher & Ury, 1991, p. 182) while Human needs theory (Burton, 1990; Kelman, 1990, 1997; Ramsbotham, et al., 2011, p. 182) says that intractable and contracted social conflicts are created by deprivation of fundamental necessities whether it be physical, psychological, and social. Burton (1990) says that identity, security, recognition, participation, and justice are ontological needs. When talking about Cyprus, identity and security requirements are much argued problems as well as justice and recognition. Following the Turkish military

intervention, the Cypriot Turks made the Northern Cyprus as their homeland. There was a widespread feeling of relief as it was hoped that they would be able to live in safety in an area under the protection of the Turkish army (Moutsis, 2017, p. 8).

1.1. The Role of Media in Conflicts

Even though media are able to mold attitudes and public opinion towards peace they constitute mere a small segment of the conflict society. A collective and integrated planning is required to transform a violent conflict. In order to be productive, media need to accompany the other social and political institutions in their pursuit of peace building (Bratic, 2008, p. 501).

The interests of the opposing sides in a conflict are just perceived as threats. Therefore, news regarding them definitely concentrate on the level of threats they pose. The attitudes of the news desks reflect faces of the enemies in a conflict regardless of the nature of their editorials, opinions, articles, headlines, illustrations and cartoons even though they are written in an objective language. An important element of war reporting is to 'demonise' the enemy. The media tend to willingly participate in the demonisation of 'enemy' nations (Joseph, 2014, p. 231)

Generally, media are inclined to look at the conflicts from their own standpoint provided their own country is involved in the conflict. Analysts have documented this in the case of the media reporting of the Falkland War and western reporting of the Gulf War (Allan and Zelizer, 2004; Ramsbotham, et al, 2011, p. 361).

Depending upon the social, economic and geographic circumstances media have a critical position in the development and diffusion of conflicts. Historically media has been effective in the aggravation of ongoing conflicts and brought some unprecedented catastrophes to the people involved in the conflicts. Just to exemplify, radio became the main source of showing places of Tutsis to Hutus so that they could find and kill them (Rwanda Radio Transcripts). Serbian television incited hatred and prompted ethnic genocide through its propaganda. Border disputes were aggravated through nationalistic rhetoric adopted by the media controlled by Serbian President Slobodan Milosevic (Marquand, 1993).

International and local media sources make important contributions in the conflicts because they have an agenda-setting effect. For instance, BBC, CNN, Al Jazeera, Al Arabia and TRT World have this effect on most of the ongoing conflicts in the world. Especially TRT World has been playing a pivotal role in a detailed reporting of the world conflicts. TRT World has been trying to diffuse the effects of the reporting of the traditional western media. The Kashmir conflict is reported on by the dominant Indian media, the often-gagged local Kashmiri media, and a few foreign news outlets; the region remains a perfect laboratory to observe contending narratives and the battle for media spaces (Cherkaoui, April 2021, p. 137).

1.2. Effect of Media on Kashmir Conflict

There is an analogy between Kashmir conflict between India and Pakistan and Israel-Palestine conflict because these conflicts emerged at about the same time and created by the same colonial power of the time, the United Kingdom since late 1940's. A significant number of civilians have lost their lives and both conflicts have the historical issues of legitimacy as the annexation of Kashmir by India in 1947. Much of the coverage omits telling the audience about the general feeling of unrest against the Indian authorities and relies heavily on simply reporting on state sources and press releases by the armed forces on the events that unfold in Kashmir (Hernandez, 2020, p. 1,2).

Generally, media in Pakistan and India play a very negative role because of their warmongering attitude in favor of their respective governments as quoted by Calcutta based expert on the South Asian politics Garga Chatterjee. "Pakistani media is in denial mode while Indian media is in finger-pointing mode, both with absolutely no evidence to back up their claims," he told DW (Islam, I., 20 September 2016).

The U.S. media puts great emphasis on highlighting the Kashmir conflict sometimes as a "guerrilla" or "separatist war" but mostly as a conflict that has sparked wars in the past between India and Pakistan and has the potential of turning into a "wider war" or even a "nuclear war (Ray, 2004, p. 92).

The role played by Pakistani media helped by local Kashmiri media is to present atrocities and suppression in the hands of Indian security forces of the Kashmiri people

like human rights violations, killings and displacements in and out of the valley of Kashmir. Moreover, Pakistani media accurately calls on the international community to pay attention to the dire situation in Kashmir. On the other hand, Indian media reports and explains the situation with its specific style and point of view. As a result, a real reflection of the situation in Kashmir is not expressed which creates an ideological gap between India and Kashmir. These practices in conflict coverage have contributed to the growing sense of alienation among Kashmiris. Instead of questioning militarization, extremism and pro-freedom sentiments, Indian national media covers Kashmir issue purely as security issue, by following government's security-centric line that Kashmir is an integral part of India; the unrest is caused by so-called Pakistani sponsored militants. All in all, the biases and prejudices in Indian media and press are the root cause of being the biggest escalator in Kashmir conflict (Riaz, et al, 2018, p. 54,55).

Currently the Indian Sub-Continent is one of the most militarized zones in the world and because of the intractable and protracted conflict of Kashmir the region has been largely nuclearized. The reporting practiced by media is generally colorful and interest oriented in favor of their respective countries. The definition of terrorism differs as it is perceived as a war against one's integrity and a struggle for freedom for the other. Either side tries to demonise the opposite side. Heroes of one nation are the villains for the other. The media is 'expected' to endorse the government definition of who constitutes the hero status and the media is allocated the job of identification and demonization. However, in matters of national security and cause, mostly the media has been supportive of the government policies in both the countries (Hussain, 2008, p. 12).

When we look at the amount of coverage given to the Kashmir conflict by the print media it has been observed that a due attention and preference has not been paid. Since Pakistani, Indian and the world public opinions do not have any emotional attachment to the problem they do not show any enthusiasm towards the solution of the issue. On the other hand, negative press coverage creates frustration among the readers. Hence, press coverage of concerned countries can be the fearsome weapon in enhancing violence. Such media propaganda and disinformation shapes public opinion and feelings accordingly. It may push the state of affairs to more destructive and apprehensive situation (Zia, Seydah, 2015, p. 174)

In case of the Kashmir conflict international media as well as Indian and Pakistani media have also played their roles in line with the interests of the country they belonged to. However, the local media in Kashmir maintained its balanced approach for diffusing tensions and safeguarding the local public and its socio economic interests. In the current information era the world has become a small village. It is impossible to determine borders between the local and international media however, it largely depends on the preferences of the local public to what extent it depends and trusts its local print and audio-visual media. In conflict the provision of reliable information is crucial and is often difficult to provide. Even the international media can find themselves at the mercy of rumour and propaganda and the situation can be even worse for the local media. In the corresponding information vacuum, combatants will use information to cause the maximum confusion and to dehumanise their opponents. The media will become specific targets (Puddephatt, 2006, p. 12). War journalism is journalism about conflict that has an unwitting value bias toward violence and violent groups that usually leads audiences to overestimate violent responses to conflict by ignoring non-violent alternatives. (Lynch, 2005, p. 6).

1.3. Effect of Media on Peace and Conflict Studies

Media is a bridge builder because it can be used to establish relationships. Media can create strong bonds necessary for a cohesion and understanding among people for them not to feel different from others. Most excluded and otherized societies can find their voice in the media. Governance can be improved with the help of media. Fact-based, independent, transparent, accountable and impartial reporting can serve to hold officials accountable and make public administrations more transparent. It enables citizens to be active stakeholders, to understand policies and use the impartial information provided to exercise their human rights. All of these are critical for conflict prevention.

Media increases knowledge of complex issues such as corruption, political injustice, marginalization, lack of economic opportunity and struggles with identity that may drive violent extremism. Media creates critical thinking in people about issues to discuss them. Media is a motivator for peace because it can motivate people to take action and to participate in community events. (Idrees, 2020, p. 4, 5)

Media and journalism can be a great assistance in conflict management and peace building. However, the power they have is also limited, as they will never be able to eliminate armed conflicts altogether. The media can be a good tool in a healthy and functioning environment but more is needed than ethical and responsible reporting to ensure lasting peace and safety. The role of the media is twofold: on the one hand, the media report and reflect on pressing issues and can help to question established concepts and ideas (Kuusik, 2010, p. 2)

Media can be an instrument of conflict as it may spread hatred and aggravate violence. Media may fortify the politics of division and identity instead of creating social cohesion. Anyone, anywhere has the potential to play a role on a global scale with a local tweet or Facebook post or a blog. With that comes the obvious danger that irresponsible, ill-informed, inflammatory comment can ignite violence (Betz, 2017, p. 17)

Media can be an agenda setter by filtering issues and trying to maintain a balance of viewpoints. Media like to portray themselves as ‘balanced and fair,’ even when they privately seek to promote a particular ideological set of ideas and limit the public’s exposure to a wide array of information (Bratic, Schirch, 2007, p. 9)

Besides, it is imperative to have awareness of the limited effects of media. Media are not able to change the underlying causes of a conflict. The unjust distribution of land, jobs and income might be, an issue of intense reporting, but cannot be altered by the media, only by other means. Hence, media can create unimaginably bad effects. Intense reporting can instigate revenge or incite an outbreak of violence. This needs careful consideration by editors, broadcasters and donors. Support to media therefore needs to be integrated into a coherent peacebuilding strategy (KOFF, 2002, p. 18).



researchgate.net, “Map of Jammu and Kashmir showing territories under the control of Pakistan, China and India, (December 2015)

1.4. A Brief History of the Kashmir Conflict

The British colonial rule in the Indian Sub-Continent ended in August 1947. Pakistan proclaimed its independent republic on 14 August 1947 while India did it on 15 August 1947. Mr. Muhammad Ali Jinnah became the first Governor General of Pakistan and India retained the British Governor General Lord Mount Baton who was the last British Viceroy of India prior to the independence. Nawabzada Liaqat Ali Khan was the first Prime Minister of Pakistan and Pundit Jawahar Lal Nehru was the first Prime Minister of India after the independence (Alstair, 1991, p. 121).

The partition of the Indian Sub-Continent envisaged the partition of Punjab and Bengal that brought West Pakistan and East Pakistan on the map of the Earth. The princely states were given the right to join India or Pakistan on their own choice. The

princely states were ruled by Muslim and Hindu rulers. It became a turning point in the future of these states.

The State of Jammu and Kashmir was one of the princely states while its ruler Raja Hari Singh, who was a Hindu, decided to join India despite an overwhelming Muslim majority in the state. An uprising started against the decision. Pakistan and India fought a brief war in 1948 over Kashmir in which both Pakistan and India captured parts of the state which became the Pakistan Administered Kashmir and the rest of the State of Jammu and Kashmir became the Indian Administered Kashmir (Military History, p. 29).

The roots of water disputes between India and Pakistan started from Kashmir. The majority of the rivers which flow in Pakistan and provide maximum water to the agriculture sector of Pakistan come through Kashmir. Therefore, Pakistan is striving hard for the ownership of land. The survival of Pakistan is hidden in the water resources of Kashmir. This was also a factor behind the thinking of the founder of Pakistan. Moreover, Indus River is the largest river in Pakistan and it provides plenty of water to the peasants of Pakistan to replenish their crops. With the World Bank sponsored agreement of 1960 both states had agreed to use water of these rivers according to the upper riparian and lower riparian rules (Miner, et al, 2009, p. 185).

Historically India has been using water as a water bomb against Pakistan. Immediately after the independence of Pakistan in 1948, India stopped water of all the rivers which flow from India or Indian Administered Kashmir towards Pakistan that further resulted in lower agricultural output in Pakistan. But this matter was resolved as a result of the 1960 agreement. India is currently not abiding by the terms of the 1960 agreement and constructing different small, medium, and large dams on these rivers as well as barrages and canals to stop and divert water of the rivers (Indus, Jhelum, and Chenab) which flow towards Pakistan. India has also allowed its peasants to directly draw water from these rivers for irrigation purposes which is not only against the Indus Water Treaty of 1960 but also against the international water division rules of upper riparian and lower riparian (Ali, 2015).

From the Indian perspective the irrigation system of water canals was mostly developed in Punjab and Sindh provinces during the British rule over United India and those areas went to Pakistan. India did not get much of water flowing through the canal

system during the partition. This caused a serious water conflict between the two countries that led to the Indus Water Treaty (Worldbank, 2018).

In the case of Pakistan and India, Pakistan is a lower riparian state and India is an upper riparian state and the control of these rivers is in the hands of India that results in the stoppage of water of the rivers which flow from India towards Pakistan. India is also using the flow of these rivers to destroy infrastructure and agriculture sector of Pakistan. It is because India has control over the flow of all these rivers and during the Monsoon season India opens the gates of its dams along with the original flow of these rivers without informing Pakistan. This results in the submerging of a major part of the land in the flooding water. During the year 2010, almost one-fifth of Pakistan drenched under water due to the water policy of India. Hence, some unverified reports by certain Pakistani agencies blamed India that it released water from its several dams in the Indian occupied region of Kashmir. If this was the case the timing of this can only be seen as adding to the problem (The British Geographer, 2010, p. 2).

The promises were made to the Kashmiri people to give them a right to self-determination by the rulers of both India and Pakistan however, those promises could never be fulfilled. Whenever tensions between India and Pakistan mounted on the issue, United Nations Security Council passed several resolutions in the years 1948, 1950, 1951, 1965 and 1971 to give Kashmiri people their right to self-determination. Although the UN Security Council has largely disengaged from the Kashmir conflict, it does continue to maintain a formal interest in the form of the UN Military Observer Group in India and Pakistan, which continues to monitor activities on both sides of the Line of Control (Westcott, 29 May 2020, p. 7).

People of Jammu and Kashmir have been consistently promised that they will be the ones to decide upon their future. These promises have been made over the years by the Indian and Pakistani governments as well as by the UN Security Council. The United Nations Security Council (UNSC) passed a resolution on September 20, 1965 and asked India and Pakistan to accept a ceasefire. Actually the UNSC emphasized on the need for India and Pakistan to do something about the issue so that the root causes of the conflict could be determined. On the other front Kashmiri political parties also insisted on their right to make their own choice whether they wanted to join Pakistan or India.

In a series of resolutions United Nations Security Council demanded India and Pakistan to have a peaceful solution to the conflict conducting an independent vote for self-determination of the people of Jammu and Kashmir. The UNSC resolutions 38, 80, 96, 209 and 307 were passed in the years 1948, 1950, 1951, 1965 and 1971 respectively (SCR, 2021, 1501).

India and Pakistan have fought three major wars over the issue of Kashmir in 1948, 1965, and 1971. The borders between these two countries in the Kashmir region have yet to be determined and Line of Control (LoC) separates the rival armies. There are always reports of ceasefire violations on both sides of the LoC. Some local clashes have also taken place apart from the major wars between India and Pakistan. The latest of these clashes took place on the Kargil mountains between May and July 1999, part of the broader conflict between India and Pakistan over the region of Kashmir, was a seminal turning point in American foreign policy with India (Riedel, 24 July 2019)

A non-violent freedom movement in Kashmir started in 1989 with public rallies that prompted tough security measures taken by the Indian government. The Kashmir conflict is a dilemma because a blind eye has been turned towards the right of self-determination of the people of Kashmir despite the clear UNSC resolutions. India claims that Kashmir is its integral part while Pakistan claims that Kashmir as a whole should be a part of Pakistan because it believes that the majority of Kashmiri people wants to be affiliated with Pakistan. Although a UN observer mission is present in Kashmir along the Line of Control India has the view that the issue must be resolved between India and Pakistan alone and it should not be internationalized. India wants to avoid international intervention, but needs to address human rights in Kashmir (Ganguly, 17 August 2019)

Hurriyet Conference is the biggest political party in the Indian Administered Kashmir and it demands India, to be recognized as the sole representative of the people of Kashmir. India accuses Pakistan of supporting some radical terrorist organizations based inside Pakistan like Lashkar-e-Taiba, Jaish-e-Muhammad, Al Badar and Harakat ul Mujahideen (COI, 2012, p. 47-49). While the responsibility for the latest Pulwama attack was claimed by Jaish-e-Muhammad (JeM) (BBC, 15 Feb. 2019).

Pakistan and India have tried to resolve the Kashmir conflict through dialogue despite their wars in 1948, 1965, and 1971. In 1965 a ceasefire was achieved and an agreement was signed as a result of bilateral talks in Tashkent. The similar agreement followed the 1971 war in Shimla between Pakistan Prime Minister Zulfikar Ali Bhutto and Indian Prime Minister Indira Gandhi. International organizations like OIC, SAP-I and SAARC have also made some contributions in the attempts to accomplish a peaceful settlement to the conflict. The negotiations between Pakistan President Pervez Musharraf and India Prime Minister Atal Bihari Vajpayee brought the two countries closest ever to a settlement (Ahmad Z.S, 2016).

Hundreds of men, women and children are reported to have been extrajudicially executed by security forces in recent years, often in reprisal for attacks on their own personnel. On 6 January 1993 at least 53 unarmed people were shot dead in reprisal killings by members of the BSF in the town of Sopore (Amnesty International, 1995, p.4). The statistics published in 2012 show that seventeen thousand people including most of women committed suicide in twenty years in Kashmir (Shahnawaz, Zeenat, 2016). India has consistently underlined that Jammu and Kashmir is an integral part of India and is a matter of strictly internal to India (Indian Express, 5 December, 2020).

1.5. The Pulwama Attack and its Reverberations in Regional Media

A convoy of the Indian Security Forces was attacked by an explosive laden vehicle on February 14, 2019 in the Pulwama district of the Indian Administered Kashmir while passing through Srinagar Highway. 45 Indian security personnel were killed. The suicide bomber was a Kashmiri youth Adil Ahmed Dar while Jaish e Muhammad (JeM) claimed responsibility for the attack (BBC, 15 February 2019).

It was the deadliest terrorist attack in more than 30 years in the Indian-administered Jammu and Kashmir. The attack resulted in Indian and Pakistani skirmishes across the Line of Control (LoC), the first time following the 1971 India-Pakistan war. The attack triggered tensions between India and Pakistan and within Jammu and Kashmir. The threat of a further heightened escalation emerged due to the suicide attack.

India imposed a lockdown in the region and boosted the number of its security forces with thousands of more personnel. More than 200 opposition figures of the Jammu and Kashmir political parties were arrested. It was claimed by the security forces that they had killed 2 top Jaish-e-Muhammad members in Pulwama on 18 February while 3 were killed in the district of Kulgam on February 24. Many security personnel were also killed in security operations. Strikes were held in protest of the operations by the separatists in J&K. The Indian parliament lifted the security protection of 5 separatist Kashmiri leaders on February 17. There were concerns that if these leaders were attacked, it would further destabilize the region. The Indian govt accused Pakistan of complicity in 14 February attack. Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi authorized security forces to decide and respond on the time and place of their choice. Pakistan denied any role in the attack. India and Pakistan recalled their High Commissioners. On February 19 Pakistan Prime Minister Imran Khan extended his hand of cooperation in investigation of the incident however, he warned that they would swiftly retaliate if they were attacked (Crisis Group, 2019).

Just after this incident of Pulwama, political leaders on both sides passed very harsh statements against each other as well as against the Intelligence agencies of each other's state. The Indian Home Minister Rajnath Singh blamed Pakistani Inter-Services Intelligence Agency ISI for funding the perpetrators of the attack. So, the Pulwama attack once again alienated the two neighboring states like several other incidents did in the previous diplomatic history of India and Pakistan. Briefing reporters after attending the Cabinet Committee on Security CCS meet, senior Cabinet Minister Arun Jaitley announced that the Most Favorite Nation (MFN) status to Pakistan stands withdrawn (Indian Express, February 15, 2019). Despite all confrontational statements the chances of a nuclear clash have remained at a minimal level throughout the Pulwama crisis. Although Indian and Pakistan air forces had dogfights and the episode of unprecedented escalation had been witnessed (BBC, 27 February 2019).

India and Pakistani warplanes were engaged in dogfights and political leaders of the two countries made efforts to escalate tensions however, Indian air raids across Kashmir pointed to the fact that India was willing to cross new thresholds. As far as Pakistan is concerned, it had never responded in such a tit-for-tat manner in previous crises in the nuclear era (Yusuf, 2019, p. 1)

The Indian Defense Minister Rajnath Singh vowed to retaliate and promised to act on a time of their own choice. The minister also blamed Pakistan for this attack on Indian Forces and announced that India would isolate Pakistan in the international arena. So, after these incidents, the region of South Asia was once again pushed under the threat of a war and terror. The Pulwama incident no matter who sponsored it, either Pakistan or India provided a chance to India to portray a bad image of Pakistan at the international level and India did it with a full sheer. After this suicide attack, India tried to isolate Pakistan by activating its international lobbies and tried to put pressure on Pakistan. Federal Minister Arun Jaitley said India would take all possible diplomatic steps to cut Pakistan off from the International community (BBC, 15 February 2019).

The first time it happened that India attacked Pakistan with warplanes and bombarded Balakot area of Pakistan which further resulted in a much public and political hue and cry from Pakistan. And Pakistan's public demanded revenge for this violation of the international border. Over time, the conditions at the Line of Control LoC became critical and two nuclear rivals came close to a war. On 27 February 2019 Indian Air Force jets once again entered Pakistan Administered Kashmir and one of the warplanes was shot down while its pilot was apprehended alive. This incident could result in further escalation, but Pakistani Prime Minister decided to return the Indian pilot as a goodwill gesture. Speaking at the parliament Pakistan PM Imran Khan has said the pilot being held by the Pakistan army will be released tomorrow and Pakistan does not want a war (India Today, 28 February, 2019).

Following the Pulwama attack BJP (Bhartiya Janta Party) government won the national general election. Generally, in such uncertain situations people always support the incumbent governments. People do not care about the past performance of the incumbent party. The same happened during the year 2019.

The Hindutva Populism has been an important factor in polarizing the majority Hindus and the minority Muslims in particular and between the majority Hindus and the other minorities at large like the Christians, Sikhs etc. Ruling party BJP won a landslide victory in the 2014 and 2019 general elections that pushed secular and liberal India into the hands of Hindutva or Hindu nationalist ideology that says that India belongs to majority Hindus only. (Rafiq, 2019) According to India's Prime Minister Narendra Modi,

Hindus are the pure people while India used to have a magnificent time when the invading Muslims and Christians destroyed it (Ranjan, 2020).

On the contrary the other perspective of this incident is that this terrorist attack was the part of Guerilla warfare strategy of Pakistan. This is the primary strategy of asymmetric war between the two opponent states where one is stronger and the other is weaker in military might. An attack from the Pakistan side towards India is in the best interest of Pakistan. It is because it demands a very smaller level of investment of money as well as ammunition. On the other side, this type of attack can give back a higher level of output. Because such incidents can create unrest in India on one hand and these attacks can also charge Muslims of India against the Indian government in favor of Kashmiris (Perkovich, 2016, P. 56, 67).

Kashmir had become the bone of contention between the two newly emerged states. Following the division of the sub-continent into Pakistan and India, these two states also tried to gain this part of land called Jammu and Kashmir. It has been the geographical location of Kashmir as well as the availability of natural resources which compelled both states to flex their muscles in the battlefield for conquering the other to capture Kashmir. Hence, the cold war as well as a series of traditional wars started between India and Pakistan. The Kashmir conflict is almost 74 years old and apparently looks like an interstate conflict however, it has been significantly affected by the global changes, reactionary movements against western supremacy and war on terror. Several regional factors have also affected this conflict like the Afghan wars. The economic, political and ideological clashes at provincial and local levels have also affected the Kashmir conflict (Dollard-Doob-Miller, 1939: Ramsbotham, et al., 2011, p. 361).

Pakistan and India are two atomic South Asian states. They have fought many wars since their inception in the year 1947, for instance, the war of 1948, 1965 and 1971. Likewise, on the other hand, diplomatic relations between these two contiguous states are not good due to many historic as well as current regional and international factors. The disputes between India and Pakistan are the same as many other colonized states are facing i.e. states which have got independence from the British Empire. And these problems are due to the division of common land, unjust division of resources, ownership

of land and regarding the future of water flowing in previously common land. India and Pakistan were living under the same British Rule, and the end of this colonized era resulted in lots of political, geographic, and social problems for the people of these two newly emerged states (Wirsing, 2004, p. 66).

Moreover, historically, India-Pakistan relations were driven by many international as well as regional factors. As the cold war era had created polarization, joining of one bloc certainly resulted in the joining of a second power bloc by the second state in the case of Indian and Pakistani affiliations. Although India and Pakistan resumed their trade and commercial ties even during the adverse period, the level of that trade was minimum and not at an optimum level. Because both states are adjacent states, trade volume can be enhanced through mutual contracts and cross-border trade. However, the main hurdle in the development of relations is the Kashmir issue. Since 1989 the Kashmir issue and currently cross border terrorism as well as water crisis are the prime reasons for adverse animosity between the two proximate states India and Pakistan. Many regional and international states as well as international organizations struggled a lot to resolve the mutual issues of these states. There have been numerous mediation attempts in the life of the Kashmir conflict, resulting in ceasefires (the UN's early work through the United Nations Commission for India and Pakistan - UNCIP), and temporary deescalation of tensions (through mediation by the USSR in 1965 and by the US in 1990) (St. John, 1997, p. 2).

But in the end, the lack of mutual trust, political compulsions, and religious factors restrained the development of strong and lasting diplomatic and economic ties between India and Pakistan. Because India and Pakistan are proximate states, cordial relations between these two neighboring countries will bring both countries closer to each other. Pakistan and India both are among the big countries by population. India has a population of 1,339,330,514 while Pakistan has a population of 238, 181,034 according to the U.S. Census Bureau (U.S. Census Bureau, 2021). They can not only invest in one another's markets but also attract international investors into these states. Pakistan and India can get lots of economic, commercial, political, and social benefits by strengthening their diplomatic ties. India and Pakistan would have severe suggestions on border tensions, terrorism, and financial transactions for regional peace and prosperity. India and Pakistan

would have rapid growth if both nations expand their trade for developing bilateral relations (Ahmad, Samsu, 2016, p. 7)

The development of diplomatic and trade ties has been restricted and obstructed because of the conflict and this situation has been blocking the social uplifting of the peoples of Pakistan and India. India and Pakistan are investing billions of dollars to flex their muscles and compete with each other to boost their military might. Pakistan and India came closer to a devastating war than they have in almost 17 years. (Dawn News, March 10, 2019).

The higher levels of military and defense spending of both India and Pakistan left a very small budget to spend on their social uplift. The share of military budget in Pakistan's total budget has been swiftly increasing with a huge percentage. About Pakistan, the Sipri report said its military expenditure had gone up by 70 per cent during the 2010-19 decade to reach \$10.3bn. In terms of GDP, the military budget rose from 3.4 per cent in 2010 to four per cent last year. India is the third-largest military spending state in the world after the United States of America and China while the military spending of India was 2.9% of its GDP during the year 2019. India's military spending of \$71 billion was 6.8 per cent higher over its 2018 expenditure. It grew by 259 per cent over a 30-year period stretching from 1990 to 2019 and by 37 per cent over the 2010-19 decade (Dawn News, 28 April 2020).

Table 1 - Historical Happening of Incidents and Reactions of India and Pakistan

S.No	Type of Incident(s)	Date	Indian Response	Pakistani Response
	Kargil war	3 May-26 July 1999	After the Kargil war, the diplomatic and trade relations were at a standstill position until the year 2004 when Pakistan and India proceeded to a ceasefire agreement at the LoC. After the end	

1			of the war, India blamed for intrusion in Kashmir territory.	
2	Jammu and Kashmir legislative assembly attack	1 October 2001	This attack took the lives of 38 people. India blamed Pakistan as well as Jaish-e-Mohammad for this attack. On the other side, Chief Minister Farooq Abdullah of Jammu and Kashmir also leveled serious allegations against Pakistan and threatened Pakistan with a harsh response.	On the other side, Pakistan condemned the attack on the Legislative Assembly of Jammu and Kashmir and rejected all the blames categorically. Furthermore, Pakistani officials also asked their Indian counterparts for the evidence of the involvement of Pakistan if they had any proof.
3	2001 Parliament Attack	13 December 2001	India accused Pakistan and Pakistan based terrorist organizations of the incident in which Indian security agencies apprehended a young man.	Pakistan rejected all blames from the Indian side and demanded an investigation of the matter
4	Samjhauta Express Bombing	18 February 2007	This blast took the lives of almost 70 people.	Pakistan blamed Indian intelligence agency Raw and Hindu Nationalist Organization RSS for masterminding this event.
5	Mumbai Attacks	26-29 November 2008	This was a series of attacks and India blamed Lashkar-e-Taiba for these attacks. These attacks took the lives of almost 166 people.	Pakistan on the other side stated that Pakistan condemns terrorists and terrorism across the world.
6	Burhan Wani	8 July 2016	Indians killed the young Kashmiri in a shootout and declared him an anti-state element for his involvement in	As a result of the killing of Burhan, Wani Pakistan condemned the state terrorism of India. Moreover, Kashmir was placed under 53

			different attacks on the Indian forces.	consecutive days of curfew
7	Pathankot Airbase Attack	2 January 2016	United Jihad Council and Jaish-e-Mohammad were blamed by the Indian authority.	
8	Uri attack	18 September 2016	It was an attack on the Indian airbase in Uri inside Jammu and Kashmir. Indians blamed jihadi groups for this act. It took the lives of 7 people.	On the contrary, the Pakistani government categorically rejected the blames and held India responsible for all terrorist attacks in Jammu and Kashmir.
9	Pulwama Attack	14 February 2019	This attack killed 40 people which was responded by India in a very harsh tone. India held responsible Jaish-e-Mohammad for this act.	Pakistan demanded solid evidence from India for the blames which India Levelled against Pakistan.

1.6. Purpose of Study

The objective of this research is to conduct a comparative analysis of the narratives of two newspapers of the opposing states on the incident (terrorist suicide attack) i.e. the Pulwama attack on Indian Reserved Forces that created a deep rift in relationships between the two neighboring South Asian nuclear powers.

The news, articles, columns, editorials, and statements of leaders from Pakistan and India which were published in ‘The Dawn’ and ‘The Indian Express’ from 14th of February 2019 to August 5, 2019 will be analyzed. Dollard Doob-Miller’s Frustration-Aggression Theory of conflict fits in the Pulwama attack incident and the Intractable and Protracted Social Conflict of Kashmir. According to the theory aggression is the result of hindering, or frustrating, a person's struggle to achieve a goal. Since Kashmiris are not given a choice to determine their own fate despite all of the UNSC resolutions passed

since 1948 their frustration has the consequence of resorting to violence in some particular cases. According to critics use of disproportionate force by the Indian security forces in Kashmir has alienated Kashmiri youth. One of the United Nations report regarding the violence in Kashmir valley between June 2016 and April 2018 says that excessive use of force and firing of pellet guns by the Indian security forces has blinded hundreds. India rejected the report and its findings (BBC, 1 May 2019).

1.7. The Importance of Study

Kashmir has become one of the primary factors which disturbed the growth and development of cordial and diplomatic relationships between India and Pakistan for the last almost 73 years. Intermittent episodes of good relations were there but that period of good relations was not long. That period was too short to further strengthen diplomatic ties. All of the wars fought between India and Pakistan since independence were the Kashmir-based wars. Either they started from Kashmir or they began for the extension of the occupation of Kashmir. Kashmir for Pakistan remains the number one pre-requisite or demand for developing diplomatic and economic relationship with India. For the Pakistanis, Kashmir remains the “unfinished business” of the 1947 partition. Pakistan, the self-professed homeland for an oppressed and threatened Muslim minority in the Subcontinent, finds it difficult to leave a Muslim majority region to a Hindu-majority state (Cohen, 2001, p. 17).

India on the other hand considers Kashmir as its integral part. Strategically Kashmir is vital for the Indian defense keeping in mind its rivalry with Pakistan and China. China also has control over some territories of Kashmir and therefore directly involved in the dispute. Hence, it is very important to look at this protracted conflict in detail to understand its complexity (Marky, 19 April 2021)

From the academic perspective this study would set a guideline for the researchers to understand root causes of the Kashmir conflict in the context of its history. Being one of the oldest conflicts in the modern world after WWII, a research on the contemporary incidents would be helpful to perceive the dynamics of the conflict and motives behind the violence in Kashmir. The discussion on the media discourses is especially important

for the journalists to understand their limitations and accesses while reporting on such intractable and contracted conflicts like the Kashmir conflict.

This research would add value to the existing literature on the prolonged and lingered conflict of Kashmir while making comparisons with existing conflicts and any emerging conflicts in the world. This is imperative to express here that being a an important and a landmark contemporary incident, not much academic work has been done on the Pulwama attack, its motives, reverberations and consequences. Therefore, this thesis will lay a good foundation for the future reserchers to understand the Kashmir conflict before and after the Pulwama attack as well as the events which led to radical steps taken by the Indian government regarding the historical status of the state of Jammu and Kashmir.

1.8. Limitations of Research

The current study is conducted by collecting qualitative data for a specific time period between 14 February 2019 and 05 August 2019. Therefore, this is the primary limitation of the current study. Moreover, the data is collected from two English newspapers, one from India and the other from Pakistan i.e. Indian Express and Dawn News respectively. Hence these are the main limitations of the current study.

The reason for limiting this research to English language newspapers from the both countries India and Pakistan is that most of the peoples of these two countries rely on these media outlets published in commonly used and understood English language. The international public opinion has also been based and built on the English language publications therefore, the research has been limited to the English language newspapers.

2. METHODOLOGY AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

In the current study, the qualitative methodology is used to collect the data as well as to analyze it. The Discourse Analysis of the Indian Express and Dawn News from India and Pakistan respectively will be made. A micro and macro structural analysis would be useful to understand insight of these two papers as well as it will give an idea of the

policies of the Indian and Pakistani governments in the aftermath of the Pulwama attack. The Indian Express and Dawn News are not the government sponsored media outlets however they generally give a precise idea of the ongoing incidents and policies of their respective governments. Additionally, these two newspapers have a wider range of readers in India and Pakistan. The researcher has decided to use two English language newspapers. One from India and the other from Pakistan to collect data regarding the Pulwama attack which took place in Pulwama Kashmir.

The Pakistani English language newspaper which has been selected for data collection is 'Dawn News'. From India English language newspaper selected for data collection regarding the Pulwama attack is the 'Indian Express'. These Newspapers on both sides are considered reliable for expressing and publishing the news and events from the perspective of the state policies of the both rival states India and Pakistan. Therefore, these two English Newspapers have been selected as a sample.

The Indian Express and Dawn Newspaper are widely published and sold in India and Pakistan respectively. The numbers of publications sold and followed over the internet indicate that people have a high level of trust in the reporting of these two English language newspapers. The data which is collected from these two English newspapers relates to the Pulwama attack and coverage of stories by these two newspapers on different occasions. Furthermore, a specific period is selected for data collection. For data collection, a period of approximately six months has been selected i.e. from 14th of February 2019 to 5th of August 2019. This time period has been chosen because the Pulwama attack took place on 14 February 2019 that led to a historical decision of the Indian parliament to suspend the Article 370 of the Indian constitution. The State of Jammu and Kashmir loses its special status (Indian Express, 6 August 2019).

This was the step that no previous Indian government dared to take in more than 70 years. The two opponent states' newspapers were selected for cross-examination of the stories, columns and news published on both sides regarding the Pulwama attack. The analysis of these stories which were published in these two newspapers will show the reliability of news, behavior of people, state reaction, biasness, or unbiasedness of newspaper owners towards the state policy and other liking and disliking of the newspapers.

The researcher has analyzed the different stories by first developing number of themes regarding the reactions of Pakistan and India after the Pulwama attack in the shape of past literature. On the other side, the researcher has, later on, analyzed each event through the statements of the politicians, diplomats, people, and international leaders which were published in Dawn and Indian Express after the Pulwama attack. The two English newspapers were selected for data collection by following stories regarding the Pulwama attack. The reading of these two newspapers has revealed the fact that these newspapers have published a higher number of news and stories which relate to the Pulwama attack as compared to the other newspapers. This is the reason these newspapers were selected as a sample.

2.1. Research Question

Did both 'Indian Express' and 'Dawn News' keep a balance between their respective national sensitivities and justice and human rights of the people of Jammu and Kashmir while publishing news, columns and editorials on the Pulwama attack?

The data has been collected from Indian Express and Dawn News to analyze the media coverage of the Pulwama incident. Furthermore, the media reporting of the incidents in these two newspapers will be analyzed here by the researcher to know the types of news stories, columns and editorials which have been published within a specific period between 14 February 2019 and 5 August 2019. Here the researcher will analyze the words, phrases, and titles used for describing an event that relate to the Pulwama attack.

To analyze the data collected the researcher has developed this question after reading the relevant literature on the Pulwama attack as well as previous terrorist attacks in the Indian Administered Kashmir as well as inside India.

3. FINDINGS

3.1. The Analysis of the news

The findings of the qualitative data collected in the research process has been analyzed. Micro analysis and macro structural analysis has given us a clear picture of how the newspapers, the Indian Express and Dawn News of India and Pakistan respectively have chosen the news regarding the Pulwama Attack to best serve the public opinions of their countries. It has also been observed that despite their instincts these newspapers have also expressed their concerns regarding their sensitivities for democracy, justice and human rights. The Indian Express for instance in one of its news published on August 6, 2019 after the suspension of the Article 370 of the Indian constitution and lifting of special autonomous status of the state of Jammu and Kashmir on 5 August 2019 used the headline, “The story of Indian democracy written in blood and betrayal”. The newspaper criticized the government of BJP of changing the status of the state of Jammu and Kashmir on the cost of violating democratic human rights of the people of Kashmir.

Table 2 A Sequence of Important Events after 14th February 2019

S. No	Occurring of Different Events	Date
1	Pulwama Attack	14 February, 2019
2	Indian Air Force Strike Balakot, Pakistan	26 February, 2019
3	Heavy skirmishes and cross border fire started at LOC, repeated violation of LOC border by both air forces (India and Pakistan)	26 February, 2019
4	India-Pakistan Air Force Dog Fire in Azad Kashmir, and apprehension of Abhinandan Varthaman	27 February, 2019
5	Pakistani Air Force locked an Indian military installation and then dropped weapons in an open place	27 February, 2019
6	Pakistan has closed his airspace for all commercial flights which remain in order until 15 July 2019	27 February, 2019
7	Suspension of Samjhauta Express, resumed on 5 th March, 2019	28 February, 2019

8	Returning of Abhinandan Varthaman to India	01 March, 2019
9	Indian Naval intrusion into Pakistan sea area	05 March, 2019
10	Pakistan and India accepted a peace offer	22 March, 2019
11	India suspended article 370 of the constitution regarding Kashmir	05 August, 2019

The links of the news analyzed in Tables 3 and 4 can be found in the Appendix C.

Table 3 – Micro Structural Analysis of the News Published after the Important Events

Dates	Titles		Syntactic/Lexical style		Rhetoric of the news	
	The Indian Express	Dawn News	The Indian Express	Dawn News	The Indian Express	Dawn News
15/02/2019 16/02/2019	Indian Minister Rajnath Singh: Some elements are being funded by Pakistan and ISI	The charge that those who planned the attack had links with Pakistan has been vigorously denied and the attack has been condemned by Pakistani Foreign Office	Active / Pakistan and ISI accused	Active / Pakistan Foreign Office denied allegations and condemned the attack	Terror attack	Militant attack
27/02/2019	Indian and Pakistani forces locked in an aerial dogfight. Pakistan Air Force made advancement towards the Line of Control	Pakistan Air Force undertook strikes across the Line of Control. Pakistan shot down an Indian aircraft, pilot captured	Active / Indian Air Force strikes	Active / Pakistan Air Force strikes	Photograph of the Indian Air Force jets	The photograph of the Indian pilot captured.
23/03/2019	Pulwama is part of a larger strategic matrix for Pakistan: Export terror to the neighborhood to avoid violence in its own backyard.	Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi sent a goodwill message to Pakistan PM Imran Khan on 23 March Pakistan Day.	Active / Pakistan exports terrorism to neighbors	Active / Desire for Peace with neighbors	No photograph	The photographs of Indian and Pakistani Premiers

06/08/2019 12/08/2019	Betrayal of democracy, blood	India imposes occupied Kashmir clampdown to head off Eid Protests	Active /Jammu and Kashmir loses special status.	Active/ Clampdown in occupied Kashmir).	The photograph of a two security personnel guarding the street after clampdown in Kashmir	The photograph of a man passing by security personnel after clampdown on 11 August 2019
--------------------------	------------------------------	---	---	---	---	---

Table 4- Macro Structural Analysis of the News Published after the Important Events

	15 February 2019-Indian Express	16 February 2019 Dawn News
Title And Entry Of The News	India won't tolerate terror. Some elements are being funded by Pakistan and ISI. We won't tolerate terror. We will eliminate terror. People of Jammu and Kashmir are with us in our fight against terror." Because Pakistan and its intelligence service ISI support some terror elements and people of Jammu and Kashmir support us we will eliminate terror.	Following the militant attack in India-held Kashmir's Pulwama area on Thursday, tensions between India and Pakistan are once again running high. Dawn News has assessed the atmosphere of tension between India and Pakistan from the statements issued by the Indian government officials and their outrage over the Pulwama attack saying that tensions are running high between the two countries once again.

Thematic and Schematic Structural Analysis	Because Pakistan and its intelligence service ISI support some terror elements and people of Jammu and Kashmir support us we will eliminate terror. The title said that Pakistan and ISI are to be blamed for the terror attack otherwise there is no problem from the people of Jammu and Kashmir therefore we will eliminate terrorism. So the real problem has been shown as Pakistan and ISI saying that the terrorist attacks could not happen without the funding provided by Pakistan and ISI to the terror elements. In a way Pakistan has been threatened and blamed for the Pulwama attack through its funding rendered to the terror elements. The people of Jammu and Kashmir are not supporting any terror activities because they are with the Indian government in its fight against terrorism.	The newspaper has not published any statement from the Pakistani officials that could aggravate the already tense situation created in the aftermath of the Pulwama attack. In the continuation of the news it has given the Pakistan Foreign Office's statement condemning the Pulwama attack. The news is about Pakistani denial of any support for the terrorist organization Jaish e Muhammad (JeM) which has claimed responsibility for the attack. The focus of the news is to explain official stance of Pakistan regarding the Pulwama attack and to outline current atmosphere. The reaction of Pakistan Foreign Office on the attack and its views regarding the Indian accusations are given in the news. The Indian efforts to isolate Pakistan and abolishing of Most Favorite Nation (MFN) in trade for Pakistan has been mentioned in the news. Generally, the news contains steps taken by the Indian government against Pakistan and Pakistani reaction to these steps. Especially, Pakistani refusal to accept Indian allegations has been mentioned in the news. Although the news has said about the continuation of blame game going on as a result of the Pulwama attack it has avoided to include any statements that could worsen already tense atmosphere between India and Pakistan.
	Indian Express - 27 February 2019	Dawn News – 27 February 2019
Title And Entry Of The News	The Indian and Pakistani forces were locked in an aerial dogfight. The confrontation erupted after the Pakistani Air Force (PAF) made advancements towards the Line of Control (LoC). Pakistan Air Force (PAF) tried to violate Line of Control between India and Pakistan therefore a dogfight resulted between the fighter jets from both sides.	2 Indian Aircrafts shot down; pilot captured. The next day Pakistan Air Force (PAF) undertook strikes across the Line of Control (LoC) from Pakistan airspace. Pakistan Air Force (PAF) shot down 2 Indian Aircrafts; pilot captured.
Thematic and Schematic Structural Analysis	The news is about skirmishes between the Indian and Pakistani Air Force jets. The news emphasizes that the provocation from the Pakistani side which is also blamed for funding terror that resulted in the Pulwama attack. So Pakistan has been blamed for both as a sponsor of terror and violation of border. Therefore, a dogfight took place between the Air Force jets of India and Pakistan. The thematic structural analysis of the news shows that Pakistan is to be blamed for any situation being created to	The news is about shooting down of 2 Indian aircrafts while one of the pilots was captured by Pakistani security forces. The news narrates the tense atmosphere between India and Pakistan. The photograph of the captured pilot has been published in the news. The news says that the Indian jets were shot down when they came to strike targets inside Pakistan. The news is about an air raid conducted by Indian warplanes across the Line of Control (LoC) while Pakistan Air Force jets shot down two Indian jets. One of the downed jets fell inside Pakistani territory

	start a war between India and Pakistan in the aftermath of Pulwama attack. The news supports Indian stance against Pakistan because the responsibility of the Pulwama attack indirectly rests upon it since Pakistan based Jaish e Muhammad (JeM) has claimed responsibility for the attack and Pakistan allegedly funds that terrorist organization. The other reason for the news to support Indian narrative is that Pakistan made advancements to the Line of Control therefore, Indian Air Force jets had to react and a dogfight took place between the Indian and Pakistani warplanes. According to the news India has every right to defend itself against terrorism and border violations funded and committed by Pakistan.	and the other one fell in the Indian territory according to the news. The pilot of the Indian warplane shot down inside Pakistan was initially captured by the Pakistani civilians and then handed over to Pakistani security forces. The style of the news shows that Pakistan Air Force only acted for defensive purpose in response to the attack conducted by the Indian warplanes on the Pakistani territory. The objective of the low tone of the news could be to present India as an aggressive side in the conflict and to show Pakistan as acting only in its defense.
	Indian Express- 23 March 2019	23 March 2019 Dawn News
Title and Entry Of The News	The Shifting Battlefields Pulwama is part of a larger strategic matrix for Pakistan: Export terror to the neighborhood to avoid violence in its own backyard.	The Message of Indian PM Narendra Modi to Pakistani PM Imran Khan on 23 March Pakistan Day expressing wishes to Imran and Pakistani people or dealing with the challenges of the Coronavirus pandemic, terming it a difficult time for humanity.

Thematic and Schematic Structural Analysis	The title of the news is about accusing Pakistan of supporting and exporting terrorism to its neighboring countries like India. Therefore, Pakistan would be able to avoid terrorism on its own soil and get rid of the terror elements. This Pakistani policy has been defined as a strategic tactic used by Pakistan. The news also says that Pakistan will be isolated from the rest of the world because of its support for terrorism. The illustrative picture published in the news shows Pakistan as a terrorist standing with a gun and isolated from the whole world. The news is about the alleged role of Pakistan in the Pulwama attack and other terrorist attacks conducted by the non-state actors allegedly funded and supported by Pakistan. The danger of an armed conflict between India and Pakistan due to Pakistani actions has been mentioned which could threaten international peace. Pakistan has been blamed for exporting terror to its neighboring countries so that it could avoid terrorist activities on its own land. Moreover, Indian efforts to isolate Pakistan in the international arena have also been justified according to the news. Hence Pakistan has been shown in the illustrative photograph as standing all alone and isolated from the rest of the world.	Earlier the special message delivered on Pakistan National Day covered the recent crisis between India and Pakistan among other topics saying that Pakistan desires friendly and peaceful relations with its neighbors. Khan made it clear that their desire for peace should not be treated as their weakness and Pakistan reserves its right to take every step for its defense. Dawn News and other national newspapers in Pakistan published the special message of Prime Minister Imran Khan on 23 March Pakistan Day. The messages given by the Prime Minister Imran Khan said that peace between the neighbors and friendly relations based on equality would bring prosperity to the region.
Title And Entry Of The News	Indian Express 06 August 2019 The story of Indian democracy written in blood and betrayal BJP thinks it is going to Indianise Kashmir. Instead, we will see, the Kashmirisation of India. The Indian ruling party BJP's objective of Indianisation and assimilation of the the people of Kashmir could make a reverse impact and separatist sensitivities of the other restive states in India could be strengthened.	Dawn News 08 August 2019 500 arrested, clampdown challenged in Supreme Court Indian security forces arrested more than 500 people since August 5, it emerged.
Thematic	The news has dramatically criticized the steps taken by the BJP government to suspend the article 370 of the Indian	The situation in Kashmir has been shown in the news saying that more than 500 people have been arrested by the Indian security forces while the

	constitution. The question has been asked in the news whether Indianising Kashmir by force would be sustainable or it would radicalize the rest of Indian minorities. The photograph of Indian Interior Minister Amit Shah in the Indian parliament taken after the historical 5 August decision has been published in the news. The Indian Express has published a detailed news regarding the suspension of the Article 370 that ended the special status of the State of Jammu and Kashmir. In the beginning of the news the bold step taken by the BJP government has been lauded however a criticism has been made by asking the questions about the future ramifications of the action taken on 5 August 2019 by the Indian parliament. The news says that the special status given to the state of Jammu and Kashmir was a constitutional democratic right that has been taken away. The news says that by taking this right away the Indian democracy has been betrayed. A balanced approach towards the radical step taken by the BJP government has been shown in the news. The concerns of a nationwide conflict and clashes have been expressed in the news. Instead of going along a popular patriotic discourse the news has expressed its feelings about the future of democracy and human rights in the country.	clampdown has been challenged in the Indian Supreme court. The news clearly expresses the tight measures taken by the security forces and protests held against the clampdown. A photograph has been published in the news in which security forces are taking an activist of the Kashmir Youth Congress into custody. In the continuation of the news it says that one of the opposition Indian National Congress Party member of parliament has filed a petition in the Supreme Court asking for an end to curfew and other clampdown restrictions in Kashmir. The petition has also asked to free political prisoners in Kashmir. The style of the news is explanatory of the current situation in Kashmir in the aftermath of the suspension of the Article 370 and the measures taken by the security forces against the protesters. On the other hand, the news has reported the legal action taken by the opposition in the Supreme court.
--	--	---

3.2. Micro Analysis

In table 3 micro analysis has been made and the forms and characteristics of the words used in the news published by the Indian Express and Dawn News in the following dates of the important events that took place in the State of Jammu and Kashmir between February 14, 2019 and August 5, 2019 were critically analyzed to better understand discourses of these two newspapers.

In a news on the February 15, 2019 the Indian Express published the words terror attack and terror funding while on February 16, 2019 Dawn News published a news with the words 'denied terror links' and 'condemned the attack'. The narrative of the news published by the Indian Express seems to be blaming while the narrative of the news published by Dawn News is rather defensive. The news published by the Indian Express on February 27, 2019 mentions the dogfight between Indian and Pakistani warplanes and the advancement of Pakistan Air Force across the Line of Control (LoC) The same day Dawn News published a news stating that Pakistan Air Force conducted strikes across the Line of Control from its own territory and captured an Indian pilot who jet was downed by Pakistan Air Force. The narrative of the both newspapers was balanced and based on facts with some words stating the policy of their respective states.

Larger strategic matrix of Pakistan and exporting terror to neighboring countries were the statements used in the news published by the Indian Express on 23 March 2019. Coincidentally it was the 23 March Pakistan Day when Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi sent a goodwill message to Pakistani Prime Minister Imran Khan on 23 March Pakistan Day expressing wishes to Imran and Pakistani people or dealing with the challenges of the Coronavirus pandemic, terming it a difficult time for humanity. Pakistani Prime Minister Imran Khan delivered a policy statement in his special message published in all of the national newspapers including Dawn News. Desire for peace with neighbors, regional prosperity and right to defend were the statements used in the message. Moreover, there was a warning in the message that their desire for peace should not be treated as their weakness. Again a discourse of blaming was prominent in the news published by the Indian Express while a carrot and stick attitude was shown in the news based on the special message of Pakistan Prime Minister Imran Khan. On 6 August 2019 right after the suspension of the Article 370 of the Indian constitution the Indian Express published a news stating that the Indian democracy is written in blood and betrayal. The words blood and betrayal point towards the approach of the Indian parliament to resolve the issue and a betrayal of democracy at the same time because democratic rights of the people of Kashmir promised by the Indian constitution have been taken away. In the detail of the news the courageous decision to suspend Article 370 has been appreciated because no previous Indian government could do it however, questions about the legitimacy of the decision have been raised (Indian Express, 6 August, 2019)

Making a comparison of the status of Kashmir and the state of Nagaland the news says that while Nagaland has the same provisions regarding its status why Kashmiri status has been taken away. Just because Kashmir is the only state with a Muslim majority. The democratic rights of the people of Kashmir promised by the constitution have been revoked that could radicalize the other minorities especially the Muslims in the mainland India. Therefore, it may result in Kashmirisation of India instead of Indianising Kashmir as aimed by the ruling Indian ruling party BJP. The newspaper has taken a rational approach towards the radicle decision taken by the Indian parliament to resolve the Kashmir issue.

On the other hand, Dawn News in its news published on 8 February 2019 has taken the approach of reporting the situation on the ground in Kashmir saying that more than 500 people have been arrested by the Indian security forces amid protests against the suspension of the Article 370 of the Indian constitution. An opposition member from the Indian National Congress has filed a petition in the Indian Supreme Court demanding the lifting of curfew and other restrictions in Kashmir.

3.3. Macro Structural Analysis

In table 4 macro structural analysis has been made of the news published on the following dates of the important events that took place during the period between 14 February 2019 and 05 August 2019. The titles of the news and their entries have been analyzed. The news published by the Indian Express on February 15, 2019 has given the statement of Indian Defense Minister Rajnath Singh saying that some elements were being funded by Pakistan and the ISI. Besides accusing Pakistan of funding terror Singh's statement consisted of a threat to retaliate. The news also says that the people of Jammu and Kashmir are also supporting the Indian government and they are not against the Indian government as claimed by the Pakistani authorities. Since the support of the people of Jammu and Kashmir is crucial for either sides it would be meaningless to continue with the conflict without this support.

According to the statement of Indian Defense Minister given in the news actual problem in Jammu and Kashmir is the funding of terror elements by Pakistan and ISI

rather than people of Kashmir. It is not the aspirations and struggle of the people of Jammu and Kashmir for their freedom or their right for self-determination but the funding and support provided by Pakistan and ISI that incite terrorism in the valley. The elimination of terror would mean the elimination of the supportive means of terror coming from Pakistan. In a way a psychological atmosphere for an imminent attack against terror elements inside Pakistan is being prepared. In other words, Pakistan and ISI are being warned about upcoming actions India could take to eliminate terror in Jammu and Kashmir. The impact of news has been boosted by blaming and pointing towards Pakistan and ISI who would be kept responsible for the terror attacks against India.

In its news published on 16 February 2019 Dawn News wrote about the tensions created between India and Pakistan as a result of the militant attack in Pulwama. The news consists of the statement issued by Pakistan Foreign Office condemning the attack and denying any support for the terrorist organization Jaish e Muhammad (JeM) which claimed responsibility for the attack. Dawn News has assessed the atmosphere of tension between India and Pakistan from the statements issued by the Indian government officials and their outrage over the Pulwama attack saying that tensions are running high between the two countries once again. The focus of the news is to explain official stance of Pakistan regarding the Pulwama attack and to outline current atmosphere. The reaction of Pakistan Foreign Office on the attack and its views regarding the Indian accusations are given in the news. The Indian efforts to isolate Pakistan and abolishing of the Most Favorite Nation (MFN) in trade for Pakistan has been mentioned in the news. Generally, the news contains steps taken by the Indian government against Pakistan and Pakistani reaction to these steps. Especially, Pakistani refusal to accept Indian allegations has been mentioned in the news. Although the news has said about the continuation of blame game going on as a result of the Pulwama attack it has avoided to include any statements that could worsen already tense atmosphere between India and Pakistan.

The Indian Express published a news on 27 February 2019 reporting a dogfight between Indian and Pakistani fighter jets as a result of Pakistan Air Force advancements towards the Line of Control (LoC). The tone of the news is accusing Pakistan of a border violation and a provocation from the Pakistani side which is also blamed for funding terror that resulted in the Pulwama attack. So Pakistan has been blamed for both as a sponsor of terror and border violation. Therefore, a dogfight took place between the Air

Force jets of India and Pakistan. The news supports Indian stance against Pakistan because the responsibility of the Pulwama attack indirectly rests upon it since Pakistan based Jaish e Muhammad (JeM) has claimed responsibility for the attack and Pakistan allegedly funds that terrorist organization. The other reason for the news to support Indian narrative is that Pakistan made advancements to the Line of Control therefore, Indian Air Force jets had to react and a dogfight took place between the Indian and Pakistani warplanes. According to the news India has every right to defend itself against terrorism and border violations funded and committed by Pakistan.

In a news published on February 27, 2019 Dawn News reported that 2 Indian aircrafts were shot down and one of the pilots was captured. The news says that following the Indian air raid on 26 February 2019 in the Pakistani territory Pakistan Air Force undertook strikes across the Line of Control (LoC) from Pakistan airspace. The news narrates the tense atmosphere between India and Pakistan. The photograph of the captured pilot has been published in the tone of the news could be to present India as an aggressive side in the conflict and to show Pakistan as acting only in its defense. The style of the news shows that Pakistan Air Force only acted for defensive purpose in response to the attack conducted by the Indian warplanes on the Pakistani territory. The objective of the low tone of the news could be to present India as an aggressive side in the conflict and to show Pakistan as acting only in its defense.

On 23 March 2019 the Indian Express published a news saying that Pakistan was shifting battlefields by exporting terror to its neighboring countries while Pulwama is part of a larger strategic matrix for Pakistan. The title of the news is about accusing Pakistan of supporting and exporting terrorism to its neighboring countries like India.

Therefore, Pakistan would be able to avoid terrorism on its own soil and get rid of the terror elements. This Pakistani policy has been defined as a strategic tactic used by Pakistan. The news also says that Pakistan will be isolated from the rest of the world because of its support for terrorism. The illustrative picture published in the news shows Pakistan as a terrorist standing with a gun and isolated from the whole world. The news is about the alleged role of Pakistan in the Pulwama attack and other terrorist attacks conducted by the non-state actors allegedly funded and supported by Pakistan. The danger of an armed conflict between India and Pakistan due to Pakistani actions has been

mentioned which could threaten international peace. Pakistan has been blamed for exporting terror to its neighboring countries so that it could avoid terrorist activities on its own land. Moreover, Indian efforts to isolate Pakistan in the international arena have also been justified according to the news. Hence Pakistan has been shown in the illustrative photograph as standing all alone and isolated from the rest of the world.

On the same same on 23 March 2019 Dawn News published the goodwill message of Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi for Pakistani Prime Minister Imran Khan on the occasion of 23 March Pakistan Day wishing that Imran Khan and Pakistani people would overcome the Corona virus pandemic. The special message delivered by PM Imran Khan on the 23 March Pakistan National Day also covered the recent crisis between India and Pakistan among other topics saying that Pakistan desires friendly and peaceful relations with its neighbors. Khan made it clear that their desire for peace should not be treated as their weakness and Pakistan reserves its right to take every step for its defense. The message clearly points to India and its recent attacks on Pakistani territory in retaliation of the Pulwama attack. According to the news Pakistani Prime Minister Imran Khan has extended an olive branch to its neighbor India as well as warned of the consequences of any hostile action against his country. The messages given by the Prime Minister Imran Khan said that peace between the neighbors and friendly relations based on equality would bring prosperity to the region. However, he also said that their desire for peace should not be taken as weakness and Pakistan reserves the right to defend itself.

The message in the news carries the strick and carrort policy for the countries having any ambitions to harm Pakistan in any way. Following the Indian Parliament's decision to suspend the Article 370 of the Indian constitution and to end autonomous status of the State of Jammu and Kashmir on August 5, 2019 the Indian Express published a news on August 6, 2019 in which it lauded the parliamentary action on one hand criticized the way a solution to the Kashmir issue is being imposed on the people of Jammu and Kashmir. The news said ruling party BJP thinks it is going to Indianise Kashmir. Instead, we will see, the Kashmirisation of India. The Indian ruling party BJP's objective of Indianisation and assimilation of the people of Kashmir could make a reverse impact and separatist sensitivities of the other restive states in India could be strengthened. The Indian Express has published a detailed news regarding the suspension of the Article 370 that ended the special status of the State of Jammu and Kashmir.

In the beginning of the news the bold step taken by the BJP government has been lauded however a criticism has been made by asking the questions about the future ramifications of the action taken on 5 August 2019 by the Indian parliament. The news says that the special status given to the state of Jammu and Kashmir was a constitutional democratic right that has been taken away. The news says that by taking this right away the Indian democracy has been betrayed. A balanced approach towards the radical step taken by the BJP government has been shown in the news. The concerns of a nationwide conflict and clashes have been expressed in the news. Instead of going along a popular patriotic discourse the news has expressed its feelings about the future of democracy and human rights in the country.

On 8 August 2019 Dawn News reported that more than 500 people have been arrested since 5 August 2019 in Kashmir while the clampdown has been challenged in the Indian Supreme Court. The news clearly expresses the tight measures taken by the security forces and protests held against the clampdown.

A photograph has been published in the news in which security forces are taking an activist of the Kashmir Youth Congress into custody. In the continuation of the news it says that one of the opposition Indian National Congress Party member of parliament has filed a petition in the Supreme Court asking for an end to curfew and other clampdown restrictions in Kashmir.

The petition has also asked to free political prisoners in Kashmir. The style of the news is explanatory of the current situation in Kashmir in the aftermath of the suspension of the Article 370 and the measures taken by the security forces against the protesters. On the other hand, the news has reported the legal action taken by the opposition in the Supreme court.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Like the other intractable and contracted social conflicts in the world, the Kashmir Conflict has its own motives and dynamics from the Peace and Conflict Studies perspective. The research question of the study is, ‘Did both ‘Indian Express’ and ‘Dawn News’ keep balance between their national sensitivities and justice and human rights of the people of Kashmir while publishing news, columns and editorials on the Pulwama attack?’

To answer this research question discourse analysis of 34 news each from the Indian Express and Dawn News has been made and the findings have been put in numerical order as shown in Tables 5. 6 and 7. The work sheets and news lists have been given in the appendices A and B. According to the serial numbers in the list the 34 news selected from the Indian Express are 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 16, 17, 18, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39 and 40 as mentioned in Appendix A. According to the serial numbers in the list the 34 news selected from the Dawn News are 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 8, 9, 12, 14, 17, 18, 19, 24, 27, 29, 31, 33, 34, 36, 38, 40, 43, 51, 53, 56, 57, 58, 59, 62, 63, 64, 65 and 66 as mentioned in Appendix B.

The news selected for the discourse analysis were picked from the Indian Express and Dawn News published on same dates or dates close to each other. In some instances, news published on the same dates could not be retrieved because of their unavailability. Even the multiple subscriptions of these two respective newspapers could not solve the problem. The length of the news may also have affected the numbers of the words and phrases used in the news. However, a general perception of the discourses of the Indian Express and Dawn News can be grasped from the results of the analysis.

The results of the discourse analysis showed that Dawn News mentioned the suicide attacker a little more than the Indian Express while the number of people killed in the Pulwama attack was mentioned by the Indian Express 39 times as compared with 27 in Dawn News as given in Table 5. The number of the people killed in the Pulwama attack could have boosted outrage and harsh sentiments of the Indian public opinion.

On the other hand, a lesser assertion of the number of people killed in the Pulwama attack by Dawn News could be an effort to lighten the gravity of the incident. However, based on the lengths of the news the number could have come higher in the Indian Express.

The name of Jaish-e-Muhammad (JeM), the militant organization allegedly based in Pakistan that claimed responsibility for the Pulwama attack, was mentioned by the Indian Express far more than Dawn News and the Indian Express used the phrases and sentences instigating an attack against Pakistan fewer than Dawn News as given in Table 6. On Pakistan side a soft attitude against Jaish-e-Muhammad (JeM) has been observed that has always been expressed by the Indian side. The reason for having a soft corner for JeM on the Pakistan side is because JeM fights for the freedom of Kashmir from India and the rights of the Kashmiri people. However, being an interstate conflict in which international institutions like the United Nations have been involved since its emergence in 1948, no non-state armed actors should be involved.

When it comes to blaming the opposite side for the responsibility of the Pulwama attack and deterioration of the bilateral relations, Dawn News has done it 223 times as compared with 66 in the Indian Express. Almost same thing has been done by Dawn News as compared to the Indian Express while praising its own government in the contents of the news as given in Table 7. The blame game has been continuing on both sides, India and Pakistan, through their media, politicians and official institutions since the beginning of the Kashmir conflict. However, following the Pulwama attack, the Indian Express adopted a narrative saying that Pakistan was responsible for all of the terrorist attacks against India including the Pulwama attack.

Definitely it reflected the narrative of the Indian officials and the Indian public opinion that was quite natural. On the other hand, Dawn News has been sticking with the narrative of the pro-freedom Kashmiri people and their democratic human rights as well as the popular public opinion in Pakistan. Pakistan blames India for its tough security policies in Kashmir that have brought the situation to the occurrence of the Pulwama attack. Pakistan has also blamed Indian ruling party BJP of using the Pulwama attack for its political gains and taking its advantage in the upcoming parliamentary elections.

Even the Indian opposition party the Indian National Congress accused Indian Prime Minister Narenbdra Modi of playing politics on the Pulwama attack saying that he was using the Pulwama tragedy for electoral gains. Congress asked Prime Minister Modi not to play politics on the Pulwama attack (Dawn News, 22 February 2019).

It is very clear that the Indian Express although published some impartial stories and news but at large Indian Express has shown its affiliation with the policies of the Indian government and extremist parties. For instance, while reporting on the Pulwama attack the Indian Express most of the time mentioned the security agency personnel killed in the line of duty instead of the suicide attacker which shows Indian Express gave much importance to the security agency personnel who sacrificed their lives for the country and aroused public outrage and sympathies of the people for the victims of the attack. Times of India published the column “Unfairly blaming Pakistan”, this publication replaced the heading and added editor’s note at the end saying that its coverage clarified that the terrorist was a member of Pakistan based Jaish-e-Mohammad. Indian Express quoted Mr. Modi (PM) and Mr. Jaitley (Finance Minister) who criticized Pakistan for being involved rather than publishing actual note Indian Express published public speakers note, defiantly this kind of reporting gives negative idea about Pakistan in public (Gaur, 2019, p. 1).

On the other side, the Dawn News also regularly, followed and published Pulwama related news which shows the stance of this newspaper to a large extent. The words and phrases used in Dawn News while reporting the Pulwama attack and later on stories that relate to the Pulwama attack are mostly ‘evidence’ ‘investigation’ and ‘state terrorism of India’. So, these words also show the support of Dawn News to the stance of the Pakistani government that it adopted after the Pulwama attack. The focus of the Dawn News was mostly on offering India a fair investigation of the Pulwama attack and solving the matter through table talk instead of a military solution. It shows Dawn News struggling for a calm in line with the official policy of Pakistan.

Cross-analysis of all of the news published in Dawn News and Indian Express shows a partially objective attitude of these two English Newspapers. These two English Newspapers although have shown some partial attitude they published reports in the best interest of the region to a large extent and to bring peace in the region and to put an end to extremism and anarchy. Although both newspapers have tried to report news from the perspectives of the countries they represent, they have shown objective attitude to bring hope of peace among their respective masses.

Table 5: Statistics of the Discourse Setting Words

Newspapers	Mentioned Pulwama Suicide Attacker	Mentioned Number of Personnel killed
Dawn News (Pakistan)	28 times	27 times
Indian Express (India)	11 times	39 times

The negative news published means stimulating the state leaders for war against each other and providing them with a proof for aggressive attitude concerning this aspect of the Pulwama attack with the news stories published in the Indian Express and Dawn News. It is clear from the news stories that the Indian Express used the name of Jaish-e-Mohammad, Lashkar-e-Taiba and Jamat-u-Dawah more than the Indian Army which shows the proof of instigating the Indian Government to assault Pakistan regardless of the evidence. Hence, the Dawn News of Pakistan published or used the word ‘attack’ on Pakistan fewer than the Indian Express while reporting the news regarding the Pulwama attack. The Indian Express used this phrase 107 times as compared to 54 times in Dawn News in the news published regarding the Pulwama attack and Pakistan-India relations as given in Table 6.

As far as Indian and Pakistani reactions are concerned, the role of media was also important. Electronic as well as print media published different reports and stories regarding the Pulwama attack which resulted in an Indian air force attack on Pakistan on the 26th of February 2019 after the Pulwama attack. The focus of the Dawn News was mostly on the UNSC resolutions demanding a plebiscite.

Table 6: Number of References to Terrorist Organizations and Instigated Attacks

Newspapers	Mentioned Jaish-e-Mohammad (JeM)	Instigated Attack
Dawn News	54 times	35 times
Indian Express	107 times	25 times

The analysis of different stories, columns, and news published in the Indian Express and Dawn News shows the blame game against each other's state. It has been revealed that Dawn News and Indian Express published the stories in favor of their respective states or in support of some of the statesmen which showed a more subjective attitude of Dawn News as compared to the Indian Express. Dawn News published 223 blaming phrases and sentences against 66 phrases and sentences published by the Indian Express. Similarly, Dawn News published 72 praising phrases and sentences for the Pakistani government as compared to 2 used by the Indian Express as given in Table 7.

The deeper analysis of the news published by the Indian Express and Dawn News within the period between 14 February 2019 and 5 August 2019 showed that the Indian Express used a larger number of phrases and sentences mentioning a negative role of Pakistan regarding the Pulwama attack. The Indian Express used a different approach to report the Pulwama attack presenting India as a victim in this incident. Generally, in their news published after the Pulwama attack the Indian Express and Dawn News have tried to present opinions of their respective governments. The attitudes of both newspapers seem rightful from their national perspectives. However, the support of Pakistan for the above mentioned non-state actors and their terrorist activities may be unjustifiable because an atmosphere of dialogue between India and Pakistan is inevitable to resolve the interstate conflict of Kashmir.

Table 7: The number of blaming and praising words

Newspapers	Blame on opposite state	Praising own Government
Dawn News	223	72
Indian Express	66	2

Pakistan's focus was on verifying the facts of the Pulwama attack. The columns published and news aired were mostly regarding the investigation of the incident and verifying the facts. The Indian leaders and public demanded action against Jaish-e-Mohammad and Jamat-u-Dawa Leaders' Masood Azhar and Hafiz Saeed respectively. Similarly, the news published in the Indian Express were about urging the Indian Government for an attack against Pakistan to avenge the Pulwama attack while the news published in the Dawn News were also instigating Pakistan to attack India mostly in retaliation of any Indian attacks. The Indian Express followed the war rhetoric while publishing the statements of the Indian officials and Dawn News published the news with the contents of negotiation and table talk to resolve the matter. Dawn News mostly represented a defensive approach adopted by the Pakistani officials in the aftermath of the Pulwama attack. The phrases meant to instigate attack can be interpreted differently by different readers.

4.1. Pulwama Attack and Blame Game

The news coverage of the Pakistani and Indian media regarding the Pulwama attack has been done differently as compared to their coverage of the other terror-related incidents. The Indian media recommended the Indian government to launch an attack on Pakistan without any prior investigation of the incident. On the other hand, Pakistani media adopted a safe trajectory and always asked for clarifying the situation through investigation of the incident. The environment of blaming others was at a low level from the Indian Express as compared to Dawn News as mentioned in Table 7. The print media in India including the Indian Express created a rhetoric favoring an all out war on Pakistan

to avenge the Pulwama attack. Amidst the super-charged, hyper nationalist bluster, the Indian print media's response to the terror attack was equally jingoistic.

Leading English dailies such as The Times of India, The Indian Express, Hindustan Times and The Hindu, constantly harped on and played around the anticipatory zeal of military strikes on terror training camps across the Line of Control in Pakistan Occupied Kashmir (Thakur, 2020, p. 92).

The Indian Express while reporting the news regarding the Pulwama attack published a story that the attack resembled the previous attack on the Indian Parliament which was carried out by Afzal Guru who was executed by India in 2013. The Indian Express blamed Pakistan as well as Jaish-e-Mohammad and Jamat-u-Dawa of Masood Azhar and Hafiz Saeed respectively. However, the main focus of the Indian Express was the activities of the Jaish-e-Mohammad. The newspaper also explained that the on-spot planning of the Pulwama attack was carried out in the Pulwama district of Kashmir. It reiterated many times that the key planner or the mastermind of the Pulwama attack was sitting in Pakistan. Born in Bahawalpur in Pakistan Punjab, Masood Azhar had been part of the Harkat-ul-Ansar, which fought against the Russians in Afghanistan, before entering Kashmir. In January 2000, he was among the group of militants exchanged by the Vajpayee government as part of the Kandahar hijacking (Indian Express, 17 February 2019)

India posted a number of charges against Pakistan as well as against Jaish-e-Mohammad much later than the occurrence of the Pulwama attack after which India retaliated with the Indian Air Force attack on Balakot. However, the Indian Express blamed Jaish-e-Mohammad by explaining that Jaish-e-Mohammad was behind the majority of the attacks. Therefore, the Indian Express published the news and different stories regarding this terrorist act before even cleaning the site of the attack. For example, the circumstances of the attack were not clear yet and it had not been determined actually who was behind the attack and who was responsible for the attack. All of these questions could be addressed and answered after a proper investigation of the incident. India on Friday issued a very strong demarche to Pakistan in connection with the terror attack on a CRPF convoy in which 40 security personnel lost their lives in south Kashmir's Pulwama yesterday. Foreign Secretary Vijay Gokhale summoned Pakistan High

Commissioner to India Sohail Mahmood and asked him to initiate immediate action against Jaish-e-Muhammad (JeM), a Pakistan-based terror outfit, which has claimed responsibility for the attack (Indian Express, 15 February 2019)

The Indian Express blamed Pakistan for the incident without any proper evidence or investigation. There was only one suicide attacker who conducted the attack and he was killed in the attack. There was no one left or apprehended for investigation. Adil Ahmad Dar, the 20-year-old school dropout who led the suicide attack at Pulwama in south Kashmir on February 14, was a Jaish-e-Muhammad “fedayee” warrior, trained for the job in the Valley. Moreover, the main news or primary news regarding the Pulwama attack published by the Indian Express was regarding the masterminds of the incident and blaming Pakistan for the incident and other helpers in the attack who assisted the perpetrator of the attack Adil Dar. One feared the inevitable: India will associate Pakistan with Dar and Jaish-e-Muhammad, the terrorist organisation that Pakistan stupidly allows to survive in Bahawalpur, south Punjab (Indian Express, 16 February 2019)

Because driving a car laden with explosives was not an easy task therefore the Indian Express stated that conducting of such a massive suicide attack was not the work of a single person and many people were certainly involved in the Pulwama attack. Indian Express wrote there are reservations regarding the development of an Improvised Explosive Device (IED) that had been loaded in the car used in the Pulwama attack. Because the terrorist groups lack skills required to prepare IED therefore, it could be a work of some outside agencies. The CRPF, officials said, is not used to improvised explosive device (IED) attacks in Kashmir, let alone car-borne suicide bombers. IEDs were a regularity in Kashmir during the peak of militancy, but from mid-2000s militant attacks largely centred around gunfight and grenade attacks (Indian Express, 15 February 2019).

The news reported by Dawn is close to the actual statement of the government. Likewise, on 27th of February 2019, the Indian Foreign Office delivered a dossier to the Pakistani government regarding the facts and information on the terrorist group in Pakistan i.e. Jaish-e-Mohammad etc. In this dossier the Indian Officials mentioned the WhatsApp numbers of the terrorists from where they call one another and details of Kashmiris who were in contact with the Jaish-e-Mohammad during the Pulwama attack

and after the attack. However, Pakistan asked for more evidence (Hindustan Times, 27 February 2019).

But on the other hand, after receiving the dossier from the Indian government Pakistani government (Foreign Office) investigated all of the shreds of evidence provided by India and rejected the accusations of India saying that no link was found with the Pulwama attack as mentioned by India however, Pakistan was ready to investigate and take action if there was any new evidence (Dawn News, 28 March 2019).

4.2. Is Pulwama Attack an Avenge of the State Terrorism?

The sane people of Kashmir are against any war between India and Pakistan. They have also preferred to talk over the use of force and initiation of a war against each other. But the number of such people is minimum or their voices are hidden under the conservative class of the society who does not care about the results of the war. Moreover, these conservative people as well as the right-wing party leaders and their followers on both sides do not know the aftermath of a nuclear war between India and Pakistan. They just want to push their governments into the vicious circle of war. They just want to adopt an aggressive strategy against each other in any condition. Until India backs down from its militarised approach to the Kashmir issue, the violence will continue. Brutality will only trigger more violence. It is only through negotiations between Pakistan, India and the Kashmiris that the conflict can be resolved. However, India will have to loosen its rigidity and recognise that Kashmir is actually a disputed territory — a reality the international community affirms (Dawn News, 16 February 2019).

It was mentioned earlier in the Dawn News that the Pulwama attack was a retaliatory move of the Kashmiri people and was not an act of the Pakistani agencies. It was also published in Dawn News that the suicide bomber who committed this attack in Pulwama was earlier detained by the Indian forces in the year 2017 and tortured. As an avenger he retaliated and attacked the Indian forces to equalize the torture he had faced back in the year 2017 (Dawn News, 16 February 2019). In his column Najmuddin A. Shaikh said that in fact JeM was not behind the Pulwama attack. Previously Jaish-e-

Mohammad and Al-Qaida claimed responsibility for several other attacks but they were not behind those attacks.

Apart from blaming each other the Indian and Pakistani leadership focuses on this issue through an international perspective that what international leaders are thinking about the incident of Pulwama and overall Pakistan India rivalry. The international investors as well as individual states will not invest in Pakistan by looking at the uncertainty and coldness of relationships. So both of these South Asian nuclear states should review their diplomatic and strategic policies to develop good relations (Dawn News, 9 April 2019).

4.3. State Level Talks and Sharing of Evidence Regarding the Pulwama Attack

The Ministry of External Affairs of India (MEA) just two days after the Pulwama attack shared information with Pakistan and stated that Pakistan is evading facts regarding the Pulwama attack. The Indian Ministry of External Affairs official also regretted and said that Pakistan is providing shelter to JeM leader Masood Azhar, who was behind the incident. The same way the ministry official also said Pakistan is supporting Masood Azhar by providing him a safe haven. We have shared enough evidence with Pakistan regarding the culprits of the Pulwama attack but Pakistan is continuously evading her responsibility. The National Investigation Agency in a press release said that a 13500-page charge sheet or dossier had been given to Pakistani government proving that the main culprit of the Pulwama attack was Adil Ahmad Dar. Moreover, the Indian Investigation Agency stated that we have provided lots of documentary and other kinds of evidence regarding the involvement of Masood Azhar in the Pulwama Attack. No one can deny these facts. In one of his chats, Mohammed Umer Farooq, nephew of Jaish Chief Masood Azhar asks brothers of Azhar, Rouf Asghar and Ammar Alvi, for money to be transferred in an account in Pakistan to finance the attack in Pulwama. According to NIA hundreds of thousands of rupees were deposited in two banks in Pakistan which were further transferred to Kashmir through illegal means. (Indian Express, 27 August 2020).

Additionally, regarding the state-level conversation and transferring of evidence, the Indian Express published an editorial which states that investigation regarding the Pulwama attack is in the best interest of Pakistan as well as for maintaining law and order in the region. It proves the assertion made at the time by the Pakistan-based group Jaish-e-Mohammed, that it had perpetrated the attack. The charge sheet says the Pulwama incident was visualized, planned, and organized at every step by the Pakistan-based headship of Jaish-e-Mohammad. Six of those listed as the accused, including Usman Farooq, have since been killed in police encounters. Fayaz Ahmad Thokar, a resident of Tral, was killed along with another local militant. J&K Police termed Thokar's killing as a "big achievement". "He (Thokar) was a co-conspirator in the February 14 Pulwama suicide attack," a senior police officer said. "He was a prize catch." Police have identified the other slain militant as Shan Showkat Bhat. Police sources said Thokar was a close associate of JeM commander Mudasir Khan, who was killed in Tral. A resident of Midoora, Khan was the brains behind the attack (Indian Express, 31 July 2019).

The Indian Express also stated that Pakistan is responsible for the Pulwama attack. Along with the attack in Balakot the Indian authorities also planned withdrawal of Pakistan as the Most Favorite Nation (MFN) in trade. After each such incident, the already strained ties between the two countries take a further hit, this time with Delhi vowing to work for "the complete isolation of Pakistan" from the international community while withdrawing the MFN status for Pakistan (Dawn News, 16 February 2019).

Similarly, the Indian statesmen and Indian Prime Minister also vowed for isolating Pakistan at the international level. For this purpose, India used the Platform of the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) which created lots of pressure on Pakistan for restricting the financial system in the country. With the recent outlook of the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) Pakistani government has been made obligatory to take some action to abide by the global watchdog's anti-terror demands. But Pakistan said it wanted more evidence. Delhi suspects it is all artificial, pointing out Pakistan's indecision in other cases like the case of Mumbai attacks despite providing all kind of evidence by India. Co-operating in the Pulwama inquiry can only be in its best interest of Pakistan.

India claims that Pakistani establishment has a very close relationship with the Jaish-e-Mohammad leader Masood Azhar. After receiving the Indian dossier last March, Pakistan said it had taken into custody almost 40 Jaish-e-Mohammed members/leaders, including Rauf Asghar and Masood Azhar's son Hammad Azhar. In one of these chats, Mohammed Umer Farooq, nephew of Jaish chief Maulana Masood Azhar, asks Rauf Asgar and Ammar Alvi, brothers of Azhar, for money to be deposited in a bank account in Pakistan to finance the attack. (Indian Express, 27 August 2020).

4.4. Did Modi government use Pulwama attack to its advantage?

The Pulwama attack took place on 14 February 2019 and coincidentally India was going to hold its general election on 11 April 2019 that gave a way to speculations whether there was any foul play on the part of the ruling Bharatiya Janata Party BJP to turn public opinion in its favor using the attack. The views of mostly the Indian politicians have been extracted from the Indian English language newspapers to understand this dilemma. The opposition Indian National Congress Leader Tewari in the backdrop of the Pulwama attack said that BJP government of Prime Minister Narendra Modi was jingoistic arrogant and strategic ignorant (The Wire, 23 February 2019).

Former Chief Minister of the State of Jammu and Kashmir and National Conference Leader Sheikh Frooq Abdullah accused Prime Minister Narendra Modi of being behind the Pulwama attack as he was desperate to win elections (India Today, 7 April 2019). Senior Samajwadi Party Leader Ram Gopal Yadav on Thursday accused Prime Minister Narendra Modi of perpetrating the Pulwama terror attack for votes. He said the Modi government "killed" security personnel to serve its political interests (India Today, 21 March 2019)

The shock Pulwama attack has given to the country is understandable. What is not understandable, nor forgivable, is Prime Minister Narendra Modi's refusal to ask the country to stay calm, to ask state governments to prevent revenge attacks on Kashmiris and to warn the cohorts of his own party against avoid inflaming communal passion. Instead he has immediately accused Pakistan of masterminding the attack, launched an international campaign to isolate it, and virtually committed the Indian security forces to

a retaliatory attack on Pakistan at a time and place of their choosing (The Wire, 19 February 2019).

None of this is to say that the Indian Air Force (IAF) response to Pulwama doesn't help make Modi look better. Of course it does, and of course it will improve his ratings, his vote-share and his seats. And if the conflict escalates further, it could help him even more (The Print, 27 February 2019)

All of these statements point to the probability of Modi government using the rhetoric created in the Pulwama attack aftermath to its advantage. If this kind of blame comes from the Pakistani side, it may not gain any credibility because of the nature of relations between the two nuclear rivals. The sentiments of the Hindu nationalist ideology against minorities especially Muslims have been well used by BJP in the previous elections while the Pulwama attack provided a golden opportunity to Modi government to use it, according to the statements of the critics mentioned in the above news and columns.

The nationalistic populism of the BJP government gained momentum because of the Pulwama attack therefore it could take the most radical steps to strip Kashmir of its autonomy guaranteed in the Indian constitution through Article 370 that has been given in one of the following sections in detail. Despite all of the arguments it cannot be said with certainty that the BJP government was behind the Pulwama attack or it had any real intentions to do such terrible things just for political gains. It would be a contradiction in itself that a popular government would sacrifice its own soldiers, gain sympathies of the masses and then use it to win elections.

4.5. Pulwama Attack and its Impacts on Kashmiri People

The people in Kashmir were afraid just after the Pulwama attack for two reasons. Firstly, this type of a big suicide attack created uncertainty for their lives and property. Secondly, Kashmiri people were assured that Indian forces will constrict security in the region after such a big incident. Therefore, Kashmiri people were uncertain about the future of Kashmir. The Pulwama attack created lots of problems and suffering for the people of Kashmir. Moreover, just after two days of the Pulwama attack, there was a

complete shut-down in the entire Kashmir Valley and people were on road against the Indian forces and held them responsible for the chaos in the peaceful valley of Kashmir. Likewise, after the attack, Indian forces started searching the surrounding of the attack site and apprehended many people on the basis of a doubt. Similar scenes have played out across the nation as Kashmiris living away from home flee violent reprisals following last week's attack in occupied Kashmir's Pulwama area, which killed more than 40 Indian paramilitary soldiers. Amnesty India has asked Indian government authorities to ensure that "ordinary Kashmiri women and men do not face targeted attacks, harassment and arbitrary arrests" as tensions simmer in the aftermath of the bombing (Dawn News, 21 February 2019).

Along with bringing suffering and problems for the people of Kashmir Valley, this incident also created many complexities for the people of Kashmir who are living in Indian mainland. One of the Kashmiri girls said that while she was returning home the other day a man shouted on her saying that those Kashmiris were happy over the killing of the Indian soldiers. She said further that they were afraid their landlord might throw them out of their home (University World News, 16 February 2019). There have been several instances of students, academics and intellectuals choosing the path of armed struggle, mainly because they see no other way to resist the atrocities unleashed by the Indian military machine (Dawn News, 16 February 2019).

The important alarming situation is that Kashmiris were not even safe in their valley. Just after the Pulwama attack many Hindus protested and broke panes of vehicles and attacked many homes. Furthermore, many Kashmiri students who are studying at the Indian universities are also harassed by the Indian students.

There are some cases reported in which Kashmiri students were suspended due to their statements or point of view regarding the Pulwama attack (Dawn News, 21 February 2019). The denial attitude of the Indian leaders and politicians is counterproductive for peace in the region. Therefore, the foreign office as well as Pakistani politicians asked India to adopt a come to the ground facts and provide them some real facts regarding the Pulwama attack as well as assist Pakistani officials in the conduction of inquiry of the Pulwama attack. But the Indian counterparts were reluctant to provide any concrete proof of the Pulwama incident. The focus is on blaming Pakistan and Masood Azhar for this

suicide attack on the reserved forces of India. Furthermore, a positive message from Pakistani Premier was conveyed to Indian Premier saying that provided India takes one step towards peace and cooperation, we will take two steps for regional welfare and especially between the two countries. But unfortunately, India has not cooperated with Pakistan in any perspective and ignored the offers which are made by the Pakistani prime minister for peace (Dawn News, 19 February 2019).

Pakistani authorities raised serious questions regarding the intelligence reliability of the intelligence agencies of India. This is because the Indian authorities were repeatedly asking Pakistan to take action against Masood Azhar, the leader of Jaish-e-Mohammad. After all, the suicide attacker showed his affiliation with Jaish-e-Mohammad. The Pakistani foreign office rejected this view of the Indian government saying that it was based on a single video of the suicide bomber who is no more in this world and we cannot hold responsible Jaish-e-Mohammad for the Pulwama attack. Because the attacker and the person whom Indian leaders are blaming are living in different states and one cannot easily travel from one country to the other. Pakistan foreign office stated that India is following 'Selective Morality' which is not good for a democratic and responsible state. Pakistan has exposed the self-purposing of the Indian government in case of the Pulwama attack. The Indian side says that those who planned the attacks had links with the Pakistani state, a charge that Pakistan has vigorously denied. In fact, the Pakistan Foreign Office has condemned the attack, saying that it was "a matter of grave concern (Dawn News, 16 February 2019).

4.6. Article 370 and Article 35A of the Indian Constitution

Article 370 and Article 35A of the Indian constitution has been given in its entirety to understand what happened after the Pulwama attack and what kind of a special status and rights were taken away from the people of the State of Jammu and Kashmir. Under article 370(1)(b), the Union Parliament can only make laws for the state, "in consultation with the Government of the State," on certain matters that were specified in the Instrument of Accession – namely defense, foreign affairs, and communications. Other matters in the legislative subject lists can apply to Jammu and Kashmir only with the "concurrence of

the Government of the State” through a presidential order. Article 370(1)(d) stipulates that other constitutional provisions may be applied to the state from time to time, “subject to such modifications or exceptions” made by the president of India, also through a presidential order, as long as they do not fall within the matters referred to above and except with the concurrence of the state government.

As a result of this status, the state of Jammu and Kashmir enacted its own Constitution, which was formally adopted by a Constituent Assembly on November 17, 1956, and entered into force on January 26, 1957. In July 1952, an agreement was made between the then-prime minister of India, Jawaharlal Nehru, and the prime minister of Jammu and Kashmir, Sheikh Abdullah, which called for India’s citizenship law to be made applicable to the state and allowed the state to regulate the rights and privileges of its own permanent residents. This agreement was codified by the president of India, who issued the Constitution (Application to Jammu and Kashmir) Order, 1954 (made pursuant to Article 370(1) of the Constitution, which added article 35A to the Indian Constitution, allowing the state of Jammu and Kashmir to define permanent residents of the state and certain “special rights and privileges” attached to such residency, including the power to restrict settlement to the state and acquire immovable property (Buchanan, 3 October 2019)

In the first few days of August, there were signs of something afoot in Kashmir. Tens of thousands of additional Indian troops were deployed, a major Hindu pilgrimage was cancelled, schools and colleges were shut, tourists were ordered to leave, telephone and internet services were suspended and regional political leaders were placed under house arrest. But most of the speculation was that Article 35A of the Indian constitution, which gave some special privileges to the people of the state, would be scrapped. The government then stunned everyone by saying it was revoking nearly all of Article 370, which 35A is part of and which has been the basis of Kashmir's complex relationship with India for some 70 years (BBC, 6 August 2019).

4.7. Facts Sharing Regarding the Pulwama Attack

The National Investigation Agency provided several pieces of evidence to the Pakistani authorities regarding the Pulwama attack. These shreds of evidence include the voice messages of Masood Azhar's brother, WhatsApp logs of the suicide bomber and his associates in Jammu and Kashmir, the transaction of the amounts in Pakistani banks, and pinpointing of the locations of the key planner of the Pulwama attack in Pakistan and Pulwama. The National Investigation Agency also stated that the planning of the Pulwama attack was prepared in 10 months and for this period the suicide bomber and his key masters were in close connection. The mastermind of the Pulwama attack was sitting in Pakistan and they belong to Jaish-e-Mohammad according to the National Investigation Agency of India dossier which was provided to Pakistan after the Pulwama attack. The dossier handed over to Pakistan with "specific details of JeM complicity in Pulwama terror attack and the presence of JeM terror camps and its leadership in Pakistan" contains details of Jaish-e-Muhammad (JeM) chief Maulana Masood Azhar's anti-India speeches and claims of attacks by Jaish on security forces in the past two years (Indian Express, 1 March 2019).

The National Investigation Agency also explained that the voice messages which they received from the Whatsapp log of different apprehended people have matched with the voice of JeM leader's kin Rouf Asghar. Similarly, the identity card of Azhar's nephew Mohammad Umer Farooq was issued by the Pakistani authorities who was the key conspirator behind the incident (Indian Express, 5 March 2019).

The other facts of the Pulwama attack are that it was the result of the Indian Army's apprehension of Adil Ahmad Dar during the year 2017. According to the parents of the suicide attacker, their son Adil Ahmad Dar was kidnapped forcefully by the Indian forces and released after some time. The detention of Adil Ahmad Dar radicalized him which further resulted in such a big move from his side. Adil Ahmad Dar, also known as Adil Ahmad Gaadi Takranewala, was a resident of Gundibagh village in Pulwama district of South Kashmir and a member of Jaish-e-Muhammad (JeM) suicide squad (Economic Times India Times, 16 February, 2019).

All these facts of the case show that the Pulwama attack is primarily the result of following the move of the Indian government based on 'Realism'. For that purpose, the Indian government has been adopting these means, such as extra judicial killing of the

suspected people in Kashmir. The Indian government called back security provided to the key Kashmiri leaders as a result of the Pulwama attack. The Pulwama attack instigated the Indian political leadership as well as the military establishment. The police were also ordered to withdraw all the facilities provided to the Kashmiri leaders in response to the Pulwama attack. In response to the Indian move of taking back security from the Kashmiri leaders, one of the Hurriyat leaders Mirwaiz Umar Farooq said that the government itself had been keeping their security in place according to its own assessment. Hurriyet residence would remain the same regardless of any security presence. These facts regarding the Pulwama attack and later on the response of the Indian government in Kashmir as well as the treatment of Pakistan shows the attitude of India in the region (Dawn News, 17 February 2019).

Just after the occurrence of the Pulwama attack, issuance of harsh statements started from the Indian side. This time the reaction of India was severe against Pakistan. The Indian government withdrew the Most Favorite Nation (MFN) status from Pakistan and imposed 200 percent duties on Indian goods. This resulted in putting the bilateral trade of about 2 billion dollars in a cold corner. Because imposing such high duties on imported goods would certainly reduce the demand for the goods from India. India vowed to isolate Pakistan at the international level.

For that purpose, India chose the FATF platform and UNSC to increase international pressure on Pakistan. The Indian officials in post-Pulwama FATF meetings said that Pakistan is supporting the terrorist activities by providing man-power as well as by financing them. India has lobbied with several countries, from the US to Europe, Australia to West Asian countries, to make the case for blacklisting of Pakistan (Indian Express, 19 February 2019).

4.8. Pulwama Attack and Politicians' Perspective

Former Pakistani Interior Minister Rehman Malik raised concerns regarding the Pulwama attack by stating that how is it possible that a car laden with 350 kg of explosives reaches the highway at the same time when the convoy was passing from there. He said

it is impossible without the prior information of the movement of the convoy. Similarly, these massive movements of the military convoys are always protected by the well-skilled security squads. In case of the Pulwama attack all of the security points are in the best knowledge of the RAW which conducted this attack and then blamed Pakistan for this suicide attack. Rehman Malik additionally explained that such type of movement of the military convoys is always kept secret and only a few people know about such movements.

How could a common Kashmiri know about the massive movement of the military. He said that throughout history whenever any such incident happened in the Indian Administered Kashmir the Indian political leadership and military establishment always blamed Pakistan. Further, the minister pointed out that the other terrorist attacks in the history of India, such as the attack on the Indian Parliament, Samjhauta Express attack, Uri attack, and many others were also masterminded by the Indian Raw and RSS. However, they always blamed Pakistan. India's law and order institutions proved before the court that RAW was involved in all these terrorist attacks in India (Dawn News, 16 February 2019).

India's foreign ministry stated that it was the Pulwama incident in which Jaish-e-Mohammad leader was designated as the mastermind and a global terrorist. He mentioned that China has withdrawn its technical hold or point of view regarding banning Masood Azhar in the Security Council (SC) and as a result, Masood Azhar has been declared as a global terrorist. The spokesperson also stated that the decision of the Security Council regarding declaring Masood Azhar as a global terrorist is neither welcomed nor criticized by Pakistan (Indian Express, 14 March 2019).

Pakistan foreign office spokesperson Tehmina Janjua also stated that everyone knows who will get benefit from this anarchy as a result of the Pulwama attack. She also said general election of Indian Lok Sabha has revealed many facts regarding the pre-planned or self-arranged Pulwama attack. For the JeM claiming responsibility for the attack asserted by India and a video received of the attacker Janjua raised question about the self-serving standards India has struck to in case of the Pulwama attack and pointed to the clear dichotomy in the Indian stance (Dawn News, 17 February 2019)

World leaders have also shown reservations regarding the happening of such a big attack on the reserved forces of India in the Indian Administered Kashmir. UNSC responded that Pakistan National Security Committee has decided to tighten the neck of Jamat-e-Dawah (JD) and its Non-Governmental Organization (NGO) named Filah-e-Insaniyat (FI) as a result of the international pressure. Later on, Pakistan security agencies have apprehended more than 20 members of Jaish-e-Mohammad and Jamat-e-Dawah. The assets of Jaish e Muhammad (JeM) Masood Azhar were to be frozen by the government of Pakistan (Dawn News, 1 May 2019).

The US President has also shown concerns regarding the Pulwama attack and stated that the United States of America has very strong political and strategic relations with India. The US president also said that both India and Pakistan should cooperate to resolve the matter of cross terrorism in their territory and cross border incidents of terrorism.

The other American leaders also condemned the incident declaring it as an act of terrorism. World leaders have shown very serious concerns and reservations regarding the Pulwama attack and strongly condemned such an incident of terrorism. Trump said that the situation between Pakistan and India was very bad and dangerous and they would like to see a stop in hostilities and that they were seriously involved in the process (Dawn News, 27 February 2019).

It can be concluded from the Comparative Discourse Analysis of the Indian vs. Pakistani Media Coverage on the Pulwama Attack that both Indian Express and Dawn News kept a balance between their respective national sensitivities and justice and human rights of the people of Jammu and Kashmir while publishing news, columns and editorials on the Pulwama attack.

While keeping in mind its government policies and sentiments of the majority of the Indian people the Indian Express generally sided with the popular discourse with a few exceptions when it expressed its concerns for democracy and human rights of the people of Jammu and Kashmir. The newspaper called the steps taken in Kashmir worrisome because they could set an example in other restive Indian states. Naturally, one cannot go against the will of the majority of the country and cannot remain impartial because of one's own national interests and sensitivities. Then for the sake of one's own

financial and sustenance one has to remain within the boundaries set by the ownership of the newspaper.

The same things can be said for Dawn News when it sides with the policies of the government of Pakistan and represents sentiments and emotions of the people of Jammu and Kashmir and Pakistan. Since it is the official policy of Pakistan to support the struggle of the people of Jammu and Kashmir for their democratic right of self determination promised by the Indian government as well as the United Nations Security Council resolutions as mentioned in our previous discussions. It is impossible to turn a blind eye towards the sufferings of the people of Jammu and Kashmir in the face of continued oppression in the hands of Indian security forces amassed in the valley. If everything is alright why would hundreds of thousands of Indian military and paramilitary forces be there.

No matter what the media outlets say or write about the Kashmir conflict, it remains to be seen how the governments of India and Pakistan would act to bring peace and a settlement to the valley of Jammu and Kashmir and how the international community would contribute in the solution of the problems ultimately faced by the people of the State of Jammu and Kashmir.



This page intentionally left blank

REFERENCES

- Ahmad, Z. S., (2016). Regionalism and Security in South Asia, The Role of Saarc. Retrieved 21 September, 2021 from: <https://dro.deakin.edu.au>
- Ahmed, M., Samsu, K. H. (2016). The Political Economy between India Pakistan Trade Relations, International Affairs and Global Strategy. Retrieved 22 September, 2021, from: www.iiste.org
- Ali, R. N., (2015). Indus Water Treaty between Pakistan and India: From Conciliation to Confrontation. Dialogue (Pakistan). Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: http://www.qurtuba.edu.pk/thedialogue/Dialogue_April_June2015
- Allan, S., and Zelizer, B., (2004): Ramsbotham, O., Woodhouse, T., and Miall; H., (2011). Contemporary Conflict Resolution. Cambridge: Polity Press
- Alstair, L., (1991). Kashmir A Disputed Legacy 1846-1990, Oxford University Press, p.121, Wallon Street, Oxford ox2 6DP
- Amnesty International, (1995). India: Summary of Human Rights Concerns in Jammu and Kashmir, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: www.amnesty.org/en/wpcontent/uploads/2021/06/
- Azar, E., (1985), Rouhana, N., (1998): Ramsbotham, O., Woodhouse, T., and Miall; H., (2011). Contemporary Conflict Resolution. p. 99-101, Cambridge: Polity Press
- Bajraktari, Y., Parajon, C., (2007a). The role of media in conflict. Retrieved 22 September, 2021, from: http://www.usip.org/pubs/usipeace_briefings/2007/0705_media_conflict.html.
- Bajraktari, Y., Parajon, C., (2007). The Role of Media in Conflict, The United States Institute of Peace, Retrieved 22 September, 2021, from: <https://www.usip.org/publications/2007/06/role-media-conflict>
- Barron, R.; Ellenbogen, L. K., Yaffe, M., (2019). Middle East Peace; What Can We Learn from Camp David 40 Years Later? Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.usip.org/publications/2019/03/middle-east-peace-what-can-we-learn-camp-david-40-years-later>.
- BBC. (15 February, 2019). Pulwama Attack: What is militant group Jaish-e-Muhammad? Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-47249982>
- BBC. (15 February, 2019). Pulwama Attack: india will completely isolate Pakistan, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-47249133>
- BBC. (27 February, 2019). Fears Rise in India-Pakistan escalation, An aerial battle – India's account. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.bbc.com/news/live/world-asia-47383889/>

- BBC. (1 May, 2019). Kashmir Attack: Tracing the path that led to Pulwama. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-47302467>
- BBC, (6 August 2019). Article 370: What Happened with Kashmir and why it matters. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-49234708>
- Betz, M., (2017). How media can be instrument of peace in conflict-prone settings. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: [UNDPOGC_Media_conflict%20roundtable%20background%20paper.pdf](https://undp.org/media/conflict%20roundtable%20background%20paper.pdf)
- Bratic, V., Schirch, L., (2007). Why and When to Use the Media for Conflict Prevention and Peacebuilding: The Global Partnership for the Prevention of Armed Conflict c/o European Centre for Conflict Prevention Retrieved 21 september, 2021, from: http://www.sfcg.org/articles/media_for_conflict_prevention.pdf
- Bratic, V., (2008). Examining Peace Oriented Media in Sreas of Violent Conflict, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: The International Communication Gazette 1748-0485 VOL. 70(6): 487–503 DOI: 10.1177/ 1748048508096397 <http://gaz.sagepub.com>
- Buchanan, K., (3 October 2019). FALQs: Article 370 and the Removal of Jammu and Kashmir's Special Status Retrieved 20 September, 2021, <https://blogs.loc.gov/law/2019/10/falqs-article-370-and-the-removal-of-jammu-and-kashmirs-special-status/>
- Burton, J., (1990); Kelman, H., (1990); Ramsbotham, O., Woodhouse, T., and Miall; H., (2011). Contemporary Conflict Resolution. p. 182, Cambridge: Polity Press
- Carmichael, F., Hussain, A., (16 December 2019). Pro-Indian 'fake websites targeted decision makers in Europe', Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: BBC World Service <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-50749764>
- Cherkaoui, T., (April 2021). TRT World, Research Centre Printed by: Hermes Tanıtım Ofset Baskı Hiz. Kag. Ltd. Sti. Büyük Sanayi 1. Cad. No:105 İskitler/Ankara Certificate Number: 47869 Retrieved 21 Seotember, 2021, from: <https://researchcentre.trtworld.com/wp-content/uploads/2021/06/War-Book-BOOK-EN-v20-bv-FINAL.pdf>
- Cohen, S. P., (2001). India, Pakistan and Kashmir, The Brookings Institution, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/cohens20011201.pdf>
- COI, (2012). COI Compilation, 7 May 2012, UNHCR, European Refugee Fund, UNHCR and the Ministry of the Interior, Austria. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: https://www.ecoi.net/en/file/local/1028814/90_1337596756_accord-pakistan-20120507-kashmir.pdf p.47-49
- Crisis Group, (2019). Kashmir February 2019, The entry corrected 2 March 2019. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.crisisgroup.org/crisiswatch/print?page=1&location%5B0%5D=38&t=CrisisWatch+Database+Filter>

- Davidson, A.; (2006). Hamas: Government or Terrorist Organization? Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.npr.org/2006/12/06/6583080/hamas-government-or-terrorist-organization>
- Dawn News, (16 February, 2019). Pulwama attack. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1464153>
- Dawn News, (16 February, 2019). Raw carried out Pulwama attack: Rehman Malik. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1464133/raw-carried-out-pulwama-attack-rehman-malik>
- Dawn News, (17 February 2019). Fear engulfs Muslims living in occupied Kashmir after Pulwama attack. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1464401>
- Dawn News, (19 February 2019). Pakistan will address actionable evidence if shared by Delhi, Imran Khan tells India after Pulwama attack. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1464783>
- Dawn News, (20 February, 2019). Comments and reactions to the prime minister's video message are largely positive. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1464784>
- Dawn News, (21 February, 2019). Kashmiri students flee Indian backlash after Pulwama suicide attack. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1465195/kashmiri-students-flee-indian-backlash-after-pulwama-suicide-attack>
- Dawn News, (22 February 2019). Congress asked Prime Minister Modi not to play politics on the Pulwama attack. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1465358>
- Dawn News, (27 February 2019). Timeline: Events leading up to the Feb 2019 Pak-India aerial combat. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1536224>
- Dawn News, (10 March 2019). Lessons from the Brink. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1468744>
- Dawn News, (28 March, 2019). India's dossier on Pulwama attack rejected. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1472343>
- Dawn News, 9 April 2019). Pak-India stand-off. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1474882>
- Dawn News, (28 April 2019). India has world's third biggest defense spending now. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1552802>
- Dawn News, (1 May 2019). JeM Chief Masood Azhar added to UN terror list after China removes objections. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1479619>
- Dollard, J., Doob, I., Miller, N., (1939): Ramsbotham, O., Woodhouse, T., and Miall; H., (2011). Contemporary Conflict Resolution. p. 361, Cambridge: Polity Press
- Dölkeleş, M., (2021). The Natural Gas and The Protracted Conflict in Cyprus (Published Master Thesis). Social Sciences University of Ankara.

- Fisher, R., and Ury, W., (1991). The method of principled negotiation developed at the Harvard Negotiation Project. Retrieved 12 June, 2021, from: https://www.fd.unl.pt › AGON_MA_25849 PDFgee-21.org/publications/water-Sharing-Conflicts-Between-Countries-and-Approaches-to-Resolving-Them.pdf
- Ganguly, M., (17 August 2019). India wants to avoid international intervention, but needs to address human rights in Kashmir, Human Rights Watch Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.hrw.org/news/2019/08/17/india-wants-avoid-international-intervention-needs-address-human-rights-kashmir>
- Gaur, R. S., (2019). Nationalist narratives in Indian Media coverage of Pulwama Attack: Critical Analyses Dr. Ruchi Singh Gaur Amity University Rajasthan (Jaipur-India) / Amity School of Communication Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://amityuniversity.ae/gmj-ae/journals/Ruchi-Singh.pdf> 22:05
- Gurr, T., (2000): Ramsbotham, O., Woodhouse, T., and Miall; H., (2011). Contemporary Conflict Resolution. p. 66, Cambridge: Polity Press
- Hernandez, R., (2020).. The Media and Conflict: Case Study Overview Reporting on the Kashmir Conflict between India and Pakistan, Global Media Journal. ISSN1550-7521 Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.globalmediajournal.com/open-access/the-media-and-conflict-case-study-overview-reporting-on-the-kashmir-conflict-between-india-and-pakistan.pdf>
- Hindustan Times, (17 February, 2019). 44 CRPF jawans killed in worst terror attack in Kashmir. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, [hindustantimes.com/india-news/44-crpf-jawans-killed-in-worst-terror-attack-in-kashmir-india-slams-pakistan/story](https://www.hindustantimes.com/india-news/44-crpf-jawans-killed-in-worst-terror-attack-in-kashmir-india-slams-pakistan/story)
- Hindustan Times, (27 February, 2019). On Pulwama attack Pakistan asks India for more evidence and information. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, <https://www.hindustantimes.com/world-news/on-pulwama-attack-pakistan-asks-india-for-more-evidence-and-information/story>
- HRW (Human Rights Watch), (27 April 2021). A Threshold Crossed, Israeli Authorities and the Crimes of Apartheid and Persecution Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.hrw.org/report/2021/04/27/threshold-crossed/israeli-authorities-and-crimes-apartheid-and-persecution>
- Hussain, N., (2008). The Role of Media in National Security: A Case Study of 1998 Nuclear Explosions by Pakistan, SouthAsian Strategic Stability Institute London SASSI Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.files.ethz.ch/isn/128264/Report-20.pdf>
- Idrees, I., (2020). Media/communications on peacebuilding/social cohesion/changing prevailing narratives on conflict, Evaluation and Lessons Learned, Iffat Idris GSDRC, University of Birmingham 09 April 2020 Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://reliefweb.int/report/world/mediacommunications-peacebuildingsocial-cohesionchanging-prevailing-narratives-conflict>
- India Today, (28 February, 2019). IAF airstrike aftermath: were the bombs on target? Mamata Banerjee wants information to be public, Retrieved from: <https://indiatoday>

- India Today, (21 March, 2019). Modi Govt. Behind Pulwama attack, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.indiatoday.in/elections/lok-sabha-2019/story/ram-gopal-yadav-comment-pulwama-attack-blames-pm-narendra-modi-1483336-2019-03-21>
- India Today, (7 April 2019). Modi Behind Pulwama attack as he wanted to win elections. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.indiatoday.in/elections/lok-sabha-2019/story/modi-pulwama-attack-as-he-wanted-to-win-elections-farooq-abdullah-1496326-2019-04-07>
- Islam, I. (20 September 2016). How Indian and Pakistani media are covering Kashmir unrest, Deutsche Welle Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.dw.com/en/how-indian-and-pakistani-media-are-covering-kashmir-unrest/a-19562791>
- Islam, N., “Kashmir” in India and Pakistan: Proposed Paradigms from Conflict to Peace, Ankara Yıldırım Beyazıt University Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://tasam.org/Files/Icerik/File/%C4%B0GK2Kitap> (16)_pdf_3621810d-8741-4bf4-9f47-7a12d9608403.pdf
- Jayakumar Kirthi, (2016). The Role of Media in Conflict, Trans Conflicts, The United States Institute of Peace. Retrieved from: <https://www.usip.org>
- Joseph, T. (2014). Mediating War and Peace: Mass Media and International Conflict India, 2014 SAGE Publications Los Angeles, London, New Delhi, Singapore, Washington DC DOI: 10.1177/0974928414535292 Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <http://iqq.sagepub.com>
- KOFF, (2002). Media and Peacebuilding Concepts, Actors and Challenges, Centre for Peacebuilding, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: https://www.swisspeace.ch/fileadmin/user_upload/Media/Publications/WP1_2002.pdf
- Kuusik, N. (28 August 2010). The Role of Media in Peace Building, Conflict Management and Prevention, E-International Relations ISSN 2053-8626 Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.e-ir.info/pdf/4866>
- Lynch J., (2005). Peace Journalism. How media reporting affects wars and conflicts, The United States Institute of Peace, p. 6, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://kvinnatillkvinna.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/11-Peace-journalism-ENG.pdf>
- Marky, D. S., (19 April 2021). Preparing for Heightened Tensions Between China and India, Council on Foreign Relations. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.cfr.org/report/preparing-heightened-tensions-between-china-and-india>
- Marquand, R., (26 January, 1993). Serbia’s State-Run Media are a Weapon of War, The Christian Science Monitor. Retrieved 22 September, 2021, from: <https://www.csmonitor.com/1993/0126/26022.html>
- Military History, (2009). Indo-Pakistan War (1947-1948) Major Wars Post Independence, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from:

- https://nios.ac.in/media/documents/military_history_375/Book-2/Chapter-16.pdf, p. 29
- MFA, (Turkish Ministry of Foreign Affairs), (2015). Cyprus (Historical Overview), Events of 1974 Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: https://www.mfa.gov.tr/cyprus-_historical-overview_.en.mfa
- Miner, M., Patankar, G., Gamkhar, S., & Eaton, D. J., (2009). Water sharing between India and Pakistan: a critical evaluation of the Indus Water Treaty. *Water International*, 34(2), 185-214. Retrieved 22 September, 2021, from: <https://doi.org/10.1080/02508060902902193> Papers published by George Mason University Libraries
- Moutsis, I., (2017). Turkish Cypriot Identity after 1974, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: file:///C:/Users/hamid.chohan/Downloads/Turkish_Cypriot_identity_after_1974_Turkish_Cyprio.pdf
- Perkovich, G., and Dalton, T., (2016). "Not War, Not Peace." Retrieved from: <https://carnegieendowment.org>
- Puddephatt, A. (2006). Voices of War: Conflict and the Role of the Media International Media Support Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.mediasupport.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/11/ims-voices-of-war-2006.pdf>
- Rafiq A., (27 September, 2019). South Asia, what is Hindutva? Retrieved from: <https://globelynews.com/south-asia/what-is-hindutva/>
- Ramsbotham, O., Woodhouse, T., Miall, H., (2011). Contemporary Conflict Resolution. Cambridge: Polity Press, p. 360
- Ramsbotham, O., Woodhouse, T., Miall, H., (2011). Contemporary Conflict Resolution. Cambridge: Polity Press, p. 360,361
- Ranjan, P., (24 September, 2020). Narendra Modi's Nationalist Populism in India and International Law. Retrieved from: <https://www.ejiltalk.org/narendra-modis-nationalist-populism-in-india-and-international-law/>
- Ray, D., (2004). Frames in the U.S print media coverage of the Kashmir conflict Retrieved from: <https://digital.lib.usf.edu/SFS0025128/00001>
- Researchgate, (December, 2015). Map of Jammu and Kashmir showing territories under the control of Pakistan, China and India. Retrieved 21 September, 2019, from: <https://www.researchgate.net/figure/Map-of-Jammu-and-Kashmir-showing-territories-under-the-control-of-Pakistan--China-and-fig-286456270/download>
- Riaz, S., et al., (2018). Kashmir Issue and Pak-Indian Press: Content Analysis of leading newspapers. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: https://ndu.edu.pk/issra/issra_pub/articles/issra-paper/.pdf
- Riedel, B., (24 July, 2019). How the 1999 Kargil conflict redefined US-India ties. Brookings Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from:

<https://www.brookings.edu/blog/order-from-chaos/2019/07/24/how-the-1999-kargil-conflict-redefined-us-india-ties/>

- Saunders, H., (1990). Regional Conflict Settlement and Prevention, 1990 Papers published by George Mason University Libraries. Retrieved 22 September, 2021, from: http://scrc.gmu.edu/finding_aids/saunders.html
- SCR, (2021). Security Council Report 1501, 711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017 Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.securitycouncilreport.org/un-documents/jammu-and-kashmir/>
- Shahnawaz, M., Zeenat, F., (2016). Psychological Impact of Human Rights Violation on Kashmiri People, Indian Journal of Applied Research Print ISSN No: 2249-555X Retrieved 18 August, 2021, from: [https://www.worldwidejournals.com/indian-journal-of-applied-research-\(IJAR\)/article/psychological-impact-of-human-rights-violation-on-kashmiri-people/](https://www.worldwidejournals.com/indian-journal-of-applied-research-(IJAR)/article/psychological-impact-of-human-rights-violation-on-kashmiri-people/)
- SIPRI, (1997): Ramsbotham, O., Woodhouse, T., Miall, H., (2011). Contemporary Conflict Resolution. Cambridge: Polity Press, p. 65
- Short, E., (2018), International NGOs Dedicated to Reducing Armed Conflicts (compilation)p.8-10 Retrieved 30 August, 2021, from: http://www.miltlaenstein.com/uploads/8/5/5/9/85599410/international_ngos_dedicated_to_reducing_armed_conflict.pdf
- St. John, A. W., Third Party Mediation over Kashmir: A Modest Proposal Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.american.edu/sis/faculty/upload/wanis-third-party-mediation-over-kashmir.pdf>
- Telhami, S., (January, 2015). The History of the Arab Israeli Peace Process Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: https://www.fpri.org/docs/telhami_-_hi_-_history_of_arab-israeli_peace_process.pdf
- Thakur, R., & Malhotra, I., (2020). Terrorism as a Media Specific Event: Performative Frames of Uri and Pulwama Reportage in Indian News Media. Media Watch, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://mediawatchjournal.in/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/Terrorism-as-a-Media-Specific-Event-Performative-Frames.pdf>
- The British Geographer, (2010). The Pakistani Floods of 2010 Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: https://www.thegeographeronline.net/uploads/2/6/6/2/26629356/the_pakistani_floods_of_2010.pdf
- The Economic Times, (16 February, 2019). Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-nation/profile-of-pulwama-suicide-bomber-dont-fall-in-love/articleshow/68006566.cms>
- The Indian Express, (15 February, 2019). Pulwama attack: Rajnath vows to win decisive war against terror, says morale of jawans not hit, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/india-morale-has-not-taken-a-hit-rajnath-singh-on-pulwama-terror-attack-5586202/>
- The Indian Express, (15 February, 2019). For CPRF, Pulwama attack a ‘massive setback’, a new challenge Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from:

<https://indianexpress.com/article/india/kashmir-for-crpf-pulwama-attack-a-massive-setback-a-new-challenge-5584753/>

The Indian Express, (15 February, 2019). Updated 22 October 2020, Pulwama attack Highlights, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/jammu-and-kashmir-eight-crpf-injured-in-awantipora-ied-blast-militants-pulwama-live5584067/>

The Indian Express, (16 February, 2019). Looming Crisis, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/columns/a-looming-crisis-adil-ahmad-dar-pulwama-terror-attack-crpf-kashmir-5586544/>

The Indian Express, (17 February, 2019). Jaish's Journey: Parliament attack to Pulwama, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/pulwama-jk-terror-attack-jaish-e-mohammad-masood-azhar-5587542/>

The Indian Express, (19 February, 2019). Don't move Pakistan out of terror fund key list, key group tells FATF, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/pakistan-fatf-grey-list-terror-funding-6274982/>

The Indian Express, (1 March, 2019). Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/dossier-to-pakistan-has-info-on-jaish-e-muhammad-link-to-pulwama-attack-5605800/>

The Indian Express, (5 March, 2019). Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/days-before-pulwama-attack-masood-azhar-told-cadres-kashmir-will-get-freedom-soon-5611086/>

The Indian Express, (14 March, 2019). Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://indianexpress.com/article/explained/jaish-chief-azhar-how-china-stood-in-indias-way-5584745/>

The Indian Express, (31 July, 2019). JeM militant involved in Pulwama attack killed in Anantnag encounter, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/jem-militant-involved-in-pulwama-attack-killed-in-anantnag-encounter-5865273/>

The Indian Express, (6 August, 2019). Article 370 highlights: Jammu and Kashmir Loses Special Status, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/article-370-scrapped-jammu-kashmir-issue-live-updates-amit-shah-5879228/>

The Indian Express, (6 August, 2019). Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/columns/jammu-kashmir-article-370-scrapped-special-status-amit-shah-narendra-modi-bjp-5880797/>

The Indian Express, (27 August, 2020). Terror chats before, after Pulwama: Money in Pakistan bank accounts, IAF movement, , Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/pulwama-attack-pakistan-kashmir-money-6571450/> (Accessed, 21/09/2021)

The Indian Express, (5 December, 2020). Explained: What is OIC's Stand on Kashmir and how has India Responded? Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from:

<https://indianexpress.com/article/explained/explained-kashmir-india-and-the-oic-7074514/>

- The Print, (27 February, 2019). Why air strikes on Pakistan may not help Narendra Modi win the election, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://theprint.in/opinion/why-air-strikes-on-pakistan-may-not-help-narendra-modi-win-the-election/198729/>
- The Wire, (19 February, 2019). In Pulwama Narendra Modi has found the Trigger he needed before 2019 Elections, Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://thewire.in/rights/pulwama-narendra-modi-bjp-2019-elections>
- The Wire, (23 February, 2019). Was Modi Really Unaware of the Pulwama Attack for Over Two Hours? Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://thewire.in/politics/modi-pulwama-documentary-congress>
- Turkish Heritage Organization, (2021). The Cyprus Dispute at a Glance, Washington, DC 1250 Connecticut Ave. NW Suite 700, Washington, DC 20036, P: 202 261 6506 Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: www.turkheritage.org/en/publications/factsheets/issue-briefs/the-cyprus-dispute-at-a-glance-3300
- University World News, (16 February, 2019) Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.cfr.org/global-conflict-tracker/conflict/israeli-palestinian-conflict>
- U.S. Census Bureau, (05 June 2021). Retrieved 5 June, 2021 from: <https://www.census.gov/popclock/print.php?component=counter>
- Westcott, S. P., (29 May 2020). The Case of UN Involvement in Jammu and Kashmir, An Excerpt from The United Nations: Friend or Foe of Self Determination? Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.e-ir.info/2020/05/29/the-case-of-un-involvement-in-jammu-and-kashmir/>
- Wirising, G. R., (2004). Kashmir in the Shadow of War-Regional Rivalries in a Nuclear Age, Gurgaon: Spring Books, p. 66. gee-21.org/publications/water-Sharing-Conflicts-Between-Countries-and-Approaches-to-Resolving-Them.pdf
- World Bank, (2018). Fact Sheet: The Indus Waters Treaty 1960 and the Role of the World Bank Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.worldbank.org/en/region/sar/brief/fact-sheet-the-indus-waters-treaty-1960-and-the-world-bank>
- Yilmaz, M., (2005). The Cyprus Conflict and the Annan Plan: Why one more Failure? Ege Academic Review, 5 (1), 29-39 Retrieved 21 September, 2021 from: <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/eab/issue/39836/472324>
- Yusuf, M. W., (May, 2019). The Pulwama Crisis: Flirting with War in a Nuclear Environment. Arms Control Today. Retrieved 21 September, 2021, from: <https://www.armscontrol.org/act/2019-05/features/pulwama-crisis-flirting>
- Zia, A., Syedah, H., (2015). Use of Print Media for Conflict Resolution and Peace Building: A Case Study of Kashmir Dispute, NDU Journal 2015 08-Print-Media%20and%20conflict%20resolution.pdf

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A

The Indian Express news 14 February 2019 - 5 August 2019 and Work Sheet for selected news

The 34 news selected for the analysis:

Indian Express (34 News)

News 1: 14 February - <https://indianexpress.com/photos/india-news/pulwama-terror-attack-martyr-soldiers-homage-pm-modi-rahul-gandhi-5586919/>:

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned: 1
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed in the Pulwama attack Mentioned: 16
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 3
- d) Instigated attack: 3
- e) Blaming words for opposite side: 1
- f) Praising own govt:

News 2: 15 February <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/jammu-and-kashmir-eight-crpf-injured-inawantipora-ied-blast-militants-pulwama-live5584067/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 2
- d) Instigated attack: 2
- e) Blame on opposite side: 2
- f) Praising own govt:

News 3: 15 February <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/kashmir-for-crpf-pulwama-attack-a-massive-setback-a-new-challenge-5584753/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned: 2
- b) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 3
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:
- f) Praising own govt:

News 4: 15 February <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/pulwama-terror-attack-kashmir-jaish-e-mohammad-pakistan-india-crpf-5585011/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned: 1
- b) Personnel killed Mentioned: 3
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 10

- d) Instigated attack: 11
- e) Blame on opposite side: 4
- f) Praising own govt:

News 5: 15 February <https://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/editorials/pulwama-crfp-camp-ied-blast-kashmir-5584703/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:2
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:3
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:2
- f) Praising own govt:

News 6: 18 February <https://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/columns/pulwama-terror-attack-aftershocks-jaish-e-mohammad-kashmir-pakistan-5588444/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 2
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 11
- f) Praising own govt:1

News 7: 18 February <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/jk-encounter-live-updates-pulwama-pinglan-5588549/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned: 2
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 4
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 1
- d) Instigated attack: 2
- e) Blame on opposite side:1
- f) Praising own govt:

News 8: 18 February <https://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/editorials/pakistan-jaish-e-mohammad-china-terror-funding-kashmir-after-pulwama-5588429/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:1
- d) Instigated attack:1
- e) Blame on opposite side: 2
- f) Praising own govt:

News 9: 20 February <https://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/columns/pulwama-attack-kashmir-conflictindian-army-crpf-5591830/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 2
- f) Praising own govt:

News 10: 22 February <https://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/columns/pulwama-crpf-convoy-attack-jammu-and-kashmir-5595445/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned: 1
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:
- f) Praising own govt:

News 11: 1 March <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/dossier-to-pakistan-has-info-on-jaish-e-muhammad-link-to-pulwama-attack-5605800/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned: 1
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 18
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:2
- f) Praising own govt:

News 12: 3 March <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/balakot-air-strike-abhinandan-varthaman-indian-air-force-pulwama-attack-pakistan-jem-narendra-modi-imran-khan-5608402/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 3
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:7
- d) Instigated attack:6
- e) Blame on opposite side: 2
- f) Praising own govt:

News 13: 5 March <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/days-before-pulwama-attack-masood-azhar-told-cadres-kashmir-will-get-freedom-soon-5611086/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned: 1
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:1

- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 9
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 2
- f) Praising own govt:

News 16: 12 March <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/pulwama-attack-killed-gunbattle-jaish-kashmir-5621602/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 9
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:
- f) Praising own govt:

News 17: 14 March <https://indianexpress.com/article/explained/jaish-chief-azhar-how-china-stood-in-indias-way-5584745/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 2
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 6
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 2
- f) Praising own govt:

News 18: 15 March <https://indianexpress.com/article/explained/itself-in-grey-zone-why-pakistan-has-complained-to-terror-finance-watchdog-about-india-5627147/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 2
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 3
- f) Praising own govt:

News 22: 27 March <https://indianexpress.com/article/pakistan/parallel-to-fatf-review-pakistan-under-watch-for-terror-funding-5644462/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 1
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 3
- f) Praising own govt:

News 23: 30 March <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/kartarpur-corridor-pakistans-10-member-panel-sikh-referendum-indo-pakistan-talks-5649498/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 1
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 3
- f) Praising own govt:

News 24: 30 March <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/mha-sets-up-terror-monitoring-group-to-check-flow-of-illegal-funds-in-kashmir-5649526/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 1
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 3
- f) Praising own govt:

News 25: 30 March <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/pakistan-takes-journalists-to-balakot-gives-limited-access-5649530/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 3
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 6
- f) Praising own govt:

News 26: 31 March <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/jammu-and-kashmir-seventeen-jaiish-men-killed-since-pulwama-attack-5650987/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned: 1
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 8
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:
- f) Praising own govt:

News 27: 2 April <https://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/columns/pulwama-terror-attack-india-pakistan-relations-balakot-air-strike-imran-khan-5653585/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned: 1
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 1

- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 3
- f) Praising own govt:

News 29: 9 April <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/iaf-puts-out-radar-images-to-show-how-it-downed-pak-f-16-5665850/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 1
- f) Praising own govt:

News 30: 11 April <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/jk-highway-curbs-misleading-information-being-spread-says-mha-5669574/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 2
- f) Praising own govt:

News 31: 19 April <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/citing-terror-india-puts-local-trade-on-hold-5683289/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 7
- f) Praising own govt:

News 32: 3 May <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/kashmir-shopian-encounter-exercise-restraint-protesters-congress-leader-mir-5709355/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:
- f) Praising own govt:

News 33: 17 May <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/kashmir-encounter-pulwama-shopian-6-militants-among-9-killed-in-valley-5732058/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 2
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 1
- f) Praising own govt:

News 34: 31 May <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/shopian-encounter-underway-between-security-forces-and-militants-5757630/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:
- f) Praising own govt:

News 35: 7 June <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/pulwama-panjran-encounter-security-forces-militants-killed-5769181/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 3
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:
- f) Praising own govt:

News 36: 8 June <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/jammu-kashmir-ex-spos-among-4-jem-men-killed-in-pulwama-encounter-5770399/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 5
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:
- f) Praising own govt:

News 37: 14 June <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/jk-journalists-encounter-awantipora-beaten-cameras-snatched-kashmir-police-5781177/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:

- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:
- f) Praising own govt:

News 38: 16 June <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/alert-jk-pakistan-input-india-us-threat-ied-vehicle-attack-awantipora-pulwama-sco-summit-bishkek-5782710/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:1
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 1
- f) Praising own govt:1

News 39: 31 July <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/jem-militant-involved-in-pulwama-attack-killed-in-anantnag-encounter-5865273/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 5
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:
- f) Praising own govt:

News 40: 5 August <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/abrogation-of-article-370-night-before-centres-august-5-move-bjp-reached-out-to-congress-chief-whip-in-rs-he-quit-next-morning-7440572/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:
- f) Praising own govt:

APPENDIX B

The Dawn News, 14 February 2019 - 5 August 2019 and Work Sheet for selected news

The 34 news selected for the analysis:

Dawn News (34 News)

News 1: 14 February related <https://www.dawn.com/news/1463821>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned: 5
- b) Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 4
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 2
- d) Instigated attack: 1
- e) Blaming words for opposite side: 1
- f) Praising own govt:1

News 2: 15 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1463946>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned: 2
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 3
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 3
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:1
- f) Praising own govt:3

News 3: 16 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1464153>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:1
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 1
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 6
- f) Praising own govt:2

News 4: 16 February : <https://www.dawn.com/news/1464205>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:4
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 1
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 8
- f) Praising own govt:3

News 5: 16 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1464133/>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned: 1

- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:18
- f) Praising own govt:3

News 6: 16 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1464147>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:3
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 2
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 6
- f) Praising own govt:

News 8: 17 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1464358>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned: 2
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 1
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 2
- f) Praising own govt:

News 9: 17 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1464401>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:6
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:6
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 18
- f) Praising own govt:2

News 12: 18 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1464783>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack: 3
- e) Blame on opposite side: 11
- f) Praising own govt:2

News 14: 20 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1464784>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:

- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 7
- f) Praising own govt:5

News 17: 22 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1465407>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 1
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:10
- f) Praising own govt:2

News 18: 22 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1465382>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned: 2
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 1
- d) Instigated attack:6
- e) Blame on opposite side: 23
- f) Praising own govt:5

News 19: 23 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1465527>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack: 10
- e) Blame on opposite side: 5
- f) Praising own govt:2

News 24: 24 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1465730>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:2
- e) Blame on opposite side:9
- f) Praising own govt:2

News 27: 25 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1465828>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:

- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack: 3
- e) Blame on opposite side:11
- f) Praising own govt:3

News 29: 26 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1466149>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 5
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:1
- f) Praising own govt:1

News 31: 27 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1466364>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack: 3
- e) Blame on opposite side: 1
- f) Praising own govt:2

News 33: 28 February <https://www.dawn.com/news/1466685>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack: 3
- e) Blame on opposite side: 7
- f) Praising own govt:7

News 34: 28 March <https://www.dawn.com/news/1472343>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 5
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:1
- f) Praising own govt:2

News 36: 1 March <https://www.dawn.com/news/1466951>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:

- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 2
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side:3
- f) Praising own govt: 4

News 38: 3 March <https://www.dawn.com/news/1479973>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 5
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 3
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 8
- f) Praising own govt:

News 40: 5 March <https://www.dawn.com/news/1467981>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack: 3
- e) Blame on opposite side: 9
- f) Praising own govt:7

News 43: 7 March <https://www.dawn.com/news/1468744>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:5
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 5
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 5
- f) Praising own govt:2

News 51: 28 March <https://www.dawn.com/news/1474540>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 5
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 1
- f) Praising own govt:2

News 53: 9 April <https://www.dawn.com/news/1474973>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:

- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack: 1
- e) Blame on opposite side: 7
- f) Praising own govt:1

News 56: 1 May <https://www.dawn.com/news/1479738>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 5
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 3
- f) Praising own govt:3

News 57: 2 May <https://www.dawn.com/news/1486781>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 5
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 7
- f) Praising own govt:1

News 58: 8 June <https://www.dawn.com/news/1487238>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned: 1
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 2
- f) Praising own govt:1

News 59: 10 June <https://www.dawn.com/news/1489110>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 1
- f) Praising own govt:2

News 62: 21 July 2019 <https://www.dawn.com/news/1497092>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:

- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 5
- f) Praising own govt:2

News 63: 30 July <https://www.dawn.com/news/1498227>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned: 1
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 12
- f) Praising own govt:

News 64: 5 August <https://www.dawn.com/news/1499076>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 9
- f) Praising own govt:

News 65: 10 August <https://www.dawn.com/news/1499253>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 3
- f) Praising own govt:

News 66: 11 August <https://www.dawn.com/news/1514652>

- a) Suicide Attacker mentioned:
- b) (Number of) Personnel killed Mentioned:
- c) Name of JeM mentioned:
- d) Instigated attack:
- e) Blame on opposite side: 2
- f) Praising own govt:

APPENDIX C

The list of the news from the Indian Express and Dawn News which were published following the important events between 14 February 2019 and 5 August 2019 as mentioned in Table 2 and used for the Micro and Macro Analyses

- 1- The Indian Express, February 15, 2019 17:34
<https://indianexpress.com/article/india/jammu-and-kashmir-eight-crpf-injured-in-awantipora-ied-blast-militants-pulwama-live5584067/>
- 2- Dawn News, Editorial Published February 16, 2019
<https://www.dawn.com/news/1464153>
- 3- The Indian Express, February 27, 2019
<https://indianexpress.com/article/india/indian-air-force-cross-loc-claims-pakistan-live-updates-5600815/>
- 4- Dawn News February 27, 2019
<https://www.dawn.com/news/1466347>
- 5- The Indian Express, March 23, 2019
<https://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/columns/pulwama-attack-pakistan-kashmir-narendra-modi-imran-khan-5638900/>
- 6- Dawn News, March 23, 2019
<https://www.dawn.com/news/1614177>
- 7- The Indian Express, August 6, 2019
<https://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/columns/jammu-kashmir-article-370-scrapped-special-status-amit-shah-narendra-modi-bjp-5880797/>
- 8- Dawn News (AFP) August 8, 2019
<https://www.dawn.com/news/1498785>