

REPUBLIC OF TURKEY
SAKARYA UNIVERSITY
INSTITUTE OF EDUCATIONAL SCIENCES
ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEACHING DEPARTMENT

**YOUNG LEARNERS' FOREIGN LANGUAGE ANXIETY LEVEL AND ANXIETY
SOURCES**

MASTER'S THESIS

ELİF KAYHAN

SUPERVISOR
PROF.DR. FİRDEVS KARAHAH

JANUARY 2021

REPUBLIC OF TURKEY
SAKARYA UNIVERSITY
INSTITUTE OF EDUCATIONAL SCIENCES
ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEACHING DEPARTMENT

**YOUNG LEARNERS' FOREIGN LANGUAGE ANXIETY LEVEL AND ANXIETY
SOURCES**

MASTER'S THESIS

ELİF KAYHAN

SUPERVISOR
PROF.DR. FİRDEVS KARAHAN

JANUARY 2021

DECLARATION

I declare in this study I prepared in accordance with the Sakarya University Institute of Educational Sciences, Thesis-Project Writing Guide that:

- I have obtained and presented all the information and documents included in the thesis within the framework of academic and ethical rules,
- I refer to the works I have used and cite them as a source,
- I have not made any changes in the data used,
- I have not presented the whole or any part of this thesis as another thesis



Elif KAYHAN

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First of all, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my thesis advisor Prof. Dr. Firdevs Karahan for her supervision, guidance, encouragement and immense knowledge throughout this research study has kept me motivated.

My sincere thanks also go to the committee of my thesis, Doç. Dr. Doğan Yüksel and Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Cihat Atar for providing constructive feedback on my thesis.

My special thanks also go to the research assistant Burcu Koç for her constructive feedback. I owe much to her for her friendly comments and support.

I sincerely thank to the research assistant Yasin Üngören for the data analysis.

I also want to thank Ahmet Dönmez for his biggest support during the process of writing this thesis.

Moreover, my dear friends Deniz Gürcan, Pınar Demirtaş, Gönül Altun and Derya Halisdemir deserve many thanks for their invaluable support, encouragement and sympathy. They were always with me whenever I needed.

Last but not least, I owe greatest thanks to my beloved parents their endless understanding, love, and belief in me.

Finally, I would like to acknowledge my deep gratitude to all people who supported me during this challenging process with their advice, patience and love.

ABSTRACT

YOUNG LEARNERS' FOREIGN LANGUAGE ANXIETY LEVEL AND ANXIETY SOURCES

Elif KAYHAN, Master's Thesis

Supervisor: Prof. Dr. Firdevs KARAHAN

Sakarya University, 2021.

The aim of the study is to investigate the Foreign Language Anxiety (FLA) among young learners by questioning the level of FLA among young learners and by explaining the sources of young learners' FLA. Anxiety affects language learners negatively during the foreign language learning process (Dewaele, 2009; Horwitz et al., 1986; Gregersen & Horwitz, 2002), and several language learners suffer from the FLA, causing failure in language classes; thus, this study focuses on what causes FLA among young learners, and what extent young learners' anxiety level differs in terms of age, gender, academic achievement, economic situation, parents' education level, parental expectation, and learning experience. It was designed as a mixed methods research to investigate the different perspectives drawn from both qualitative and quantitative data. The quantitative data were collected by the Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS) (Aydın, Harputlu, Uştuk, Güzel, & Çelik, 2017b), which was adapted for young learners from the Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS) of Horwitz et al. FLCAS (1986) while the qualitative data were gathered by semi-structured interviews. The universe of the study was Karasu and the sample of the study was 8 different public secondary schools which are located in the city center. The quantitative data were gathered from 380 students who study at 5th, 6th, and 7th grades, and semi-structured interviews were held with seven of the students who had a high level of anxiety according to results of FLCAS. According to the results, the young learners had a moderate level of FLA at the class and FLA effects of all the variables which are age, gender, academic achievement, economic situation, parents' education level, parental expectation, and learning experience were analyzed and discussed. It was found in the study that age, gender, academic achievement, parent's education level, and parental expectation had effects on young learners' FLA. Also, considering the interviews, suddenly asked questions by the teacher, not being able to answer the questions, having low marks, teachers, difficult subjects, writing long articles,

and some classroom activities cause FLA among the young learners. In the study, all these findings were discussed in detail and suggestions were presented for the educators and language teachers.

Keywords: Foreign language anxiety, anxiety level of young learners, anxiety sources, English language teaching



ÖZET

ÇOCUKLARDA YABANCI DİL ÖĞRENME KAYGI SEVİYESİ VE KAYGI SEBEPLERİ

Elif KAYHAN, Yüksek Lisans Tezi

Supervisor: Prof. Dr. Firdevs KARAHAN

Sakarya University, 2021.

Çalışmanın amacı, çocukların Yabancı Dil Kaygı (YDK) düzeyini sorgulayarak ve onların YDK sebeplerini açıklayarak çocuklardaki YDK'yı araştırmaktır. Kaygı, yabancı dil öğrenme sürecinde dil öğrenenleri olumsuz etkilemektedir (Dewaele, 2009; Horwitz ve diğerleri, 1986; Gregersen ve Horwitz, 2002) ve birçok dil öğrencisi derslerde başarısızlığa neden olan YDK ile problem yaşamaktadır; bu nedenle, bu çalışma, çocuklarda YDK'ya neyin sebep olduğuna ve genç öğrencilerin kaygı düzeyinin yaş, cinsiyet, akademik başarı, ekonomik durum, ebeveynlerin eğitim seviyesi, ebeveyn beklentisi ve öğrenme deneyimi açısından ne ölçüde farklı olduğuna odaklanmaktadır. Hem nitel hem de nicel verilerden elde edilen farklı bakış açılarını araştırmak için bu çalışmada karma araştırma yöntemi kullanılmıştır. Nicel veriler Horwitz ve diğerlerinin (1986) Yabancı Dil Kaygı Ölçeği'nden (YDKÖ) çocuklar için uyarlanan Yabancı Dil Kaygı Ölçeği (YDKÖ) (Aydın, Harputlu, Uştuk, Güzel ve Çelik, 2017b) ile toplanmıştır. Nitel veriler ise yarı yapılandırılmış görüşmeler kullanılarak toplanmıştır. Araştırmanın evreni Karasu'dur ve araştırmanın örneklemini şehir merkezinde yer alan 8 farklı devlet ortaokulu oluşturmaktadır. Nicel veriler, 5., 6. ve 7. sınıflarda öğrenim gören 380 öğrenciden toplanmış ve YDKÖ sonuçlarına göre kaygı düzeyi yüksek olan yedi öğrenciyle yarı yapılandırılmış görüşmeler yapılmıştır. Sonuçlara göre, genç öğrenciler sınıfta orta düzeyde YDK'ya sahip ve yaş, cinsiyet, akademik başarı, ekonomik durum, ebeveynlerin eğitim düzeyi, ebeveyn beklentisi ve öğrenme deneyimi gibi tüm değişkenlerin YDK üzerindeki etkisi analiz edildi ve tartışıldı. Araştırmada yaş, cinsiyet, akademik başarı, ebeveynin eğitim seviyesi ve ebeveyn beklentisinin çocukların YDK'sını etkilediği bulundu. Ayrıca yapılan görüşmelere göre öğretmenin aniden sorduğu sorular, sorulara cevap verememe, düşük not alma, öğretmenler, zor konular, uzun yazılar yazma ve bazı sınıf içi etkinlikler çocuklarda YDK'ya neden olmaktadır. Çalışmada tüm bu bulgular detaylı bir şekilde tartışılmış ve eğitimcilere ve dil öğretmenlerine öneriler sunulmuştur.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Yabancı dil kaygısı, çocukların kaygı düzeyleri, kaygı sebepleri, İngiliz Dili Eğitimi



LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. The demographic distribution of the participants.....	27
Table 2. Test of normality.....	31
Table 3. FLA among young learners.....	32
Table 4. FLA difference between gender groups.....	33
Table 5. Kruskal Wallis H Test results for FLA difference in terms of age.....	34
Table 6. Kruskal Wallis H Test results for FLA difference in terms of academic achievement	36
Table 7. Kruskal Wallis H Test results for FLA difference in terms of economic situation	37
Table 8. Kruskal Wallis H test results for FLA difference in terms of fathers' education level of the students	39
Table 9. Kruskal Wallis H test results for FLA difference in terms of mothers' education level of the students	40
Table 10. Kruskal Wallis H test results for FLA difference in terms of parental expectation	42
Table 11. Kruskal Wallis H test results for FLA difference in terms of students' learning experience.....	43
Table 12. The profile of the interviewees.....	45
Table 13. The feelings of the anxious students in the classroom	47
Table 14. The sources of the interviewees' FLA.....	47

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. Sample item of FLCAS	29
--------------------------------------	----



ABBREVIATIONS

FLA	: Foreign Language Anxiety
FLCAS	: Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale
HLA	: High Language Anxiety
LLA	: Low Language Anxiety



TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION	i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
ÖZET	v
LIST OF TABLES	vii
LIST OF FIGURES	viii
ABBREVIATION	ix
CHAPTER I	1
INTRODUCTION	1
1.1. The statement of the problem	1
1.2. The purpose and the importance of the study	3
1.3. Problem sentence	4
1.4. Sub-problems	4
1.5. Assumptions	5
1.6. Limitations	5
1.7. Definitions	5
CHAPTER II	7
LITERATURE REVIEW	7
2.1. Anxiety and foreign language learning	7
2.2. Types of anxiety	9
2.3. Foreign language anxiety	10
2.4. Components of foreign language learning anxiety	13
2.4.1. Communication apprehension	13
2.4.2. Fear of negative evaluation	14
2.4.3. Test anxiety	16

2.5. Foreign language anxiety sources	17
2.5.1. Other aspects	20
2.5.1.1. Gender	21
2.5.1.2. Learning experience	22
2.5.1.3. Age	23
2.5.1.4. Proficiency level	23
2.5.1.5. Achievement	24
2.5.1.6. Academic year/grade	24
CHAPTER III	26
METHODOLOGY	26
3.1. The method of the study	26
3.2. Participants	26
3.3. Data collection instruments and data collection process	28
3.3.1. Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS)	28
3.3.2. Semi-structured interviews	29
3.4. Data analysis	30
CHAPTER IV	32
FINDINGS	32
4.1. Findings of quantitative data	32
4.1.1. What is the level of young learners' foreign language anxiety?	32
4.1.2. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of gender?	33
4.1.3. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of age?	34
4.1.4. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' academic achievement?	35
4.1.5. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' economic situation?	37

4.1.6. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of parents' education level of the students?	38
4.1.7. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of parental expectation?	41
4.1.8. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' learning experience?	43
4.2. Findings of qualitative Data	45
CHAPTER V	51
RESULTS, DISCUSSION, AND SUGGESTIONS	51
5.1. Results and discussion	51
5.1.1. The discussion of the quantitative data	51
5.1.1.1. What is the level of young learners' foreign language anxiety?	51
5.1.1.2. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of gender?	53
5.1.1.3. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of age?	54
5.1.1.4. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' academic achievement?	56
5.1.1.5. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' economic situation?	58
5.1.1.6. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of parents' education level of the students?	59
5.1.1.7. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' parental expectation?	59
5.1.1.8. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' learning experience?	60
5.1.2. The discussion of the qualitative data	62
5.1.2.1. What are the sources of young learners' FLA?	62
5.2. Suggestions	66

5.2.1. Suggestions based on the study	66
5.2.2. Suggestions for future research studies	67
REFERENCES	68
APPENDICES	80



CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

This chapter includes the statement of the problem, purpose and importance of the study, problem sentences, sub-problems, assumptions, limitations, and definitions, which are clarified in a detailed way.

1.1. The Statement of the problem

Foreign language learning is a complex process that is affected by not only the cognitive domain factors related to mental skills which are knowledge, comprehension, application, analysis, synthesis, and evaluation but also the affective domain factors related to the emotions or feelings of human beings such as motivation and anxiety (Brown, 1994; Wang, 2010). Due to these effects in a foreign language learning process, several studies have been implemented in order to find out and to understand the factors and variables affecting foreign language learning in detailed way (Aydin, 2001; Brown, 1994; Chastain, 1975; Gardner & MacIntyre, 1993; Horwitz, Horwitz and Cope, 1986; Scovel, 1978; Young, 1990). Among all these variables and factors, anxiety has been considered as one of the most important affective factors and has had a significant role while learning a foreign language since it is quite prevalent to come across foreign language learners experiencing apprehension and adverse feelings in foreign language classes (MacIntyre, 1998). Moreover, according to MacIntyre and Gregersen (2012), language anxiety as a term involves negative and fear-related emotions that are associated with learning a foreign language, not the mother tongue of the person. Thus, anxiety is a common negative feeling among learners in foreign language classes, and foreign language learners come up against language anxiety.

When the relation between anxiety and language learning is considered, Foreign Language Anxiety (FLA) has appeared in foreign language learning. The FLA term has been clarified by Horwitz et al. (1986), and Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS) was presented as an instrument in order to investigate language learners' anxiety while learning a foreign language by Horwitz et al. (1986). After that, FLA has been an area of interest, and a growing body of research, and several researchers have investigated the effect of FLA on foreign language learners (Aydin, 2008; Balemir, 2009; Brown, 1994; Çağatay,

2015; Ezzi, 2012; Güzel, 2016; MacIntyre & Gregersen, 2012; Marwan, 2016; Scovel, 1991; Spielberger, 1983). In order to point out the existence and effects of FLA, Horwitz (2001) reported that one of every three foreign language learners had the feeling of anxiety, and Campbell and Ortiz (1991) stated that half of all language learners suffered from language anxiety. In addition, Horwitz et al. (1986) stated that several people had the claim of having a psychological barrier for learning a foreign language.

Researchers are aware of the fact that most language learners experience foreign language anxiety in their learning, and they raise a question about what happens if language learners feel anxious in the classroom. Different answers have been found for this question, and there is a fact that language anxiety might create several problems for learners (Kondo & Ling, 2004). Anxious learners may find their lessons less enjoyable (Dewaele et al. 2017), they feel uncomfortable in language classes (Aydın, Yavuz & Yeşilyurt, 2009), and learners' performance might be affected adversely because of language anxiety (Chen & Chang, 2004). Also, the feeling of anxiety toward learning a foreign language demotivates the learners in language classes and several researchers are aware that it will be difficult to have a good performance and achievement expectation from language learners (Azher, Anwar & Naz, 2010; Batumlu & Erden, 2007). Moreover, in the classroom, anxious students have the problem with participating in role play activities, remembering learned topics, and answering the questions (Ely, 1986; Horwitz et al., 1986 as cited in MacIntyre & Gregersen, 2012). Therefore, students who have the feeling of anxiety might have lower grades (Aida, 1994; Elkhafaifi, 2005; Horwitz, 1986; MacIntyre & Gardner, 1994; Young, 1986), and they might not want to continue their foreign language courses (Dewaele, 2009). Even if anxious students study harder to deal with this problem (Horwitz et al., 1986), the results might be the same and they might even have lower achievement (MacIntyre & Gregersen, 2012).

When several studies are examined and taken into consideration, learners have the feeling of anxiety and worry reasoned because of different sources. Young (1991, p. 427) lists the sources as “associated with the learner, associated with the instructor and instructional practices”. Worde (2003) remarks teachers as an anxiety source in language classes because they might create a negative atmosphere in the classroom and they are dominant speakers in front of the learners (Zhao, 2009). Also, classroom activities, learning strategies, cultural differences, fear of negative evaluation, learners' educational

backgrounds, and attitudes might be some of the factors affecting the process of language learning; many other sources might be listed here as sources of language anxiety (Aydın, 2008; Aydın, 2013; Balemir, 2009; Yan & Horwitz, 2008; Young, 1991).

As clarified above, FLA has been investigated in terms of different perspectives, and it is clear that anxiety might be a big trouble of language learners; thus, as Andrade and Williams (2009) state, it still needs to be investigated by the researchers to define it with a deep understanding. According to Horwitz et al. (1986), FLA has been identified adequately; however, its effect on foreign language learning should be investigated further. Bailey et al. (1999) also support this opinion by stating that “better understanding of the nature of foreign language anxiety remains a key element in reducing the negative experiences of learners in the classroom” (p. 72). In addition, Aydın (2001) recommends studying on FLA in a detailed way since there are still unknown issues about the effect of anxiety on language learning such as its effect on learners’ attitudes and motivation because of the variety of setting and individual differences of language learners (Horwitz, 2013). Furthermore, looking back to early studies, most of them focus on FLA of adults, university or college students, (Aida, 1994; Andrade & Williams, 2009; Çağatay, 2015; Elkhafaifi, 2005; Kitano, 2001; Young, 1986). However, as Aydın et al. (2017a) mentioned, there are limited studies related with FLA among young learners (Alshahrani & Alandal, 2015; Aydın, 2013; Aydın et al., 2017a; Chan & Wu, 2004). Therefore, the study aims to focus on young learners and investigate the FLA among young learners by questioning the level of FLA among young learners and explaining the sources of FLA among young learners.

1.2. The Purpose and the importance of the study

Anxiety is one of the unfavorable feelings which adversely influence language learners in the process of learning a foreign language (Dewaele, 2009; Horwitz et al., 1986; Gregersen & Horwitz, 2002). Since several language learners suffer from FLA, which causes failure in language classes, educators and language teachers need more explanation about which variables have an effect on foreign language anxiety among young learners, and this study clarifies to what extent language learners’ anxiety level differs in terms of different variables such as age, gender, academic achievement, economic situation, parents’ education level, parental expectation, and learning experience.

On the other hand, many studies have focused on foreign language anxiety among adult EFL learners, and little attention has been paid to children's foreign language anxiety even though target language proficiency might be facilitated by foreign language learning during childhood (Cameron, 2003). Thus, the research on foreign language learning during childhood should gain importance, and the causes of FLA before adolescence should be studied for better language learning. By regarding the former situation, the study may clearly present the sources of FLA among young learners by interviewing anxious young learners.

In addition, this study focusing on young learners' foreign language anxiety may be a good guide for teachers in terms of understanding FLA of young learners and helping anxious learners to deal with this adverse feeling in language classes based on the sources presented by the participants of the study.

1.3. Problem sentence

This study aims to research the level of FLA from the perspective of young learners who study in secondary schools. Especially, the study focuses on 5th, 6th, and 7th grade students studying in public schools and tries to find out both their FLA level and the sources of their FLA by applying Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS) and interviewing the anxious students. Hence, the researcher tries to find out the answers of these questions presented below:

1. What is the level of young learners' foreign language anxiety?
2. What are the sources of young learners' foreign language anxiety?

1.4. Sub-problems

There are several variables affecting language learners while learning a foreign language, and this study focuses on some specific factors in order to investigate the foreign language anxiety among young learners in a detailed way; thus, the study follows to answer these sub-questions:

1. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of gender?
2. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of age?
3. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' academic achievement?

4. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' economic situation?
5. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of parents' education level of the students?
6. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' parental expectation?
7. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' learning experience?

1.5. Assumptions

The participants of the study are the students studying at public secondary schools. The aim is to investigate the level of the FLA and anxiety sources among these students by collecting data with the questionnaire of FLCAS and semi-structured interviews. Thus, it is assumed that the students will voluntarily participate in the study and answer the questions in an honest and sincere manner. Also, they will report their real ideas and perspectives during the study.

1.6. Limitations

This study is limited to the secondary public schools in Karasu, Sakarya, Turkey. Therefore, the findings of the study might not be generalized for all the language learners. Also, data collection instruments might not be accepted enough to get detailed information from the participants. For further studies, data collection instruments can be varied, and the perceptions of the teachers can be included because they might be good observers of students' anxiety problems in the classroom. Moreover, the same study might be carried out in various regions in Sakarya or in Turkey; hence, the data might be collected from various regions in Sakarya or in Turkey.

1.7. Definitions

Anxiety: The feeling of unease, worry, or nervousness

Foreign Language Anxiety (FLA): The feeling of apprehension and involves fear related emotions, which is linked with learning or using a foreign language (MacIntyre & Gregersen, 2012).

Communication Apprehension: Shyness triggered by the fear or anxiety while having communication with people (Horwitz et al., 1986)

Fear of Negative Evaluation: Having anxiety or worry about others' evaluations, having the belief that the others would evaluate one negatively (Horwitz et al., 1986)

Test Anxiety: A type of performance anxiety which is experienced in testing situations and based on a fear of failure (Horwitz et al., 1986)



CHAPTER II

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1. Anxiety and foreign language learning

Anxiety is described as the subjective feeling of tension, apprehension, nervousness and worry, which is associated with an arousal of the autonomic nervous system (Spielberger, 1983). Scovel (1991) describes anxiety as “a state of apprehension, a vague fear that is only indirectly associated with an object” (p. 3). According to Brown (1994), anxiety is the feelings of frustration, apprehension, uneasiness, and self-doubt. Barlow (2004) has stated that anxiety is a future-oriented mood state associated with preparation for possible, upcoming possible events. According to the structural analysis of anxiety, the symptoms of anxiety are worry, avoidance, and muscle tension (Craske, Rauch, Ursano, Prenoveau, Pine, & Zinbarg, 2011).

Anxiety negatively affects not only the language learning process but also many types of learning and has been one of the most commonly examined variables in psychology and education (Horwitz, 2001). Hence, human psychology has a big role in learning a foreign language, and those psychological factors affect the foreign language learning process (Gardner & MacIntyre, 1993; Horwitz et al., 1986; Samimy & Tabuse, 1992; Schumann, 1999; Young, 1990; Zhanibek, 2001); thus, when one is learning a language, anxiety as a psychological factor adversely influences the learning process. It has been a crucial issue in language learning for educators because it is considered as an important obstacle which learners encounter in the process of foreign language learning (Dil, 2009; Wu, 2010; Zheng, 2008).

Language anxiety is the feeling of apprehension and involves fear related emotions, which is linked with learning or using a foreign language (MacIntyre & Gregersen, 2012). MacIntyre and Gregersen have stated that the term of ‘‘language anxiety’’ involves both second language anxiety and foreign language anxiety together with language skills such as speaking, reading, writing, and comprehension. Moreover, it is the mix of self-perceptions, beliefs, feelings, and behaviours relevant to classroom language learning (Horwitz, Horwitz, & Cope, 1986).

As Horwitz et. al. (1986) stated, learners' adverse emotional reactions to language learning are the result of foreign language anxiety. According to Horwitz et al., this anxiety results from insufficient communicative abilities in foreign language learning because understanding each other during the interaction in mother language is not usually hard whereas second language communication entails a risk for learners and makes the learners feel self-consciousness, fear, or even panic.

In the history of anxiety and language learning Oxford (1999) was concerned with whether language anxiety was harmful or helpful, and it was stated that anxiety had a negative effect on language learning by regarding; grades in language courses in Aida's (1994) study, performance in skill- based tasks in Young's (1986) study, self-confidence in Gardner and MacIntyre's (1993) study. Similarly, Djigunovic (2006) carried out a study to investigate the effect of anxiety on foreign language learning process, and the results indicated that the students with high levels of anxiety had more problems.

Actually, the idea of negative emotions faced in the process of L2 development is not a new issue; in Krashen's (1982) "Comprehension Hypothesis", it is argued that in order to acquire the target language, affective filter, which is associated with emotional and psychological factors affecting success or failure of acquiring a foreign language, facilitates or hinders language production. When affective filter is low, learners feel safe and motivated for learning a foreign language; whereas, learners experience stress and feel anxious when the filter is high. Thus, according to Krashen, high anxiety affects the affective filter, which makes learners fail in language classroom, and low anxiety brings about more success for language learners.

In addition, foreign language learning is affected by several variables, and one of the biggest obstacles in foreign language classroom is reported as anxiety when the difficulties for learners are investigated (Dil, 2009). In order to investigate the effect of anxiety on foreign language learning, Horwitz et al. (1986) improved "Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS)", and several studies have been carried out by using this scale (Aida, 1994; Aydin, Yavuz, & Yeşilyurt, 2006.; Balemir, 2009; Chan & Wu, 2004; Dewaele, Witney, Saito, & Dewaele, 2018). Also, to understand what language anxiety is, psychologists divide the anxiety into different categories.

2.2. Types of anxiety

Language anxiety is classified into three types: Trait anxiety, state anxiety, and situation-specific anxiety. *Trait anxiety* is linked with the personality. It is defined as “a general series of anxiety not specific to a particular stimulus” (Greenberg, 2006, p.121), “a general tendency to perceive situations as threatening” (Spielberg, 1968, 1977, p.1), and a stable emotional state (Riasati, 2011). Similarly, Phillips (1992) has identified the term of trait anxiety as a constant feeling of anxiety for every situation. It is clear from the former studies that trait anxiety is being anxious regardless of any conditions; thus, it has a negative effect on people’s memory and cognitive features (MacIntyre & Gardner, 1991).

On the other hand, *state anxiety* is an apprehension of an experience at a specific moment for a definite situation (Spielberger, 1983); in other words, a momentary experienced feeling of anxiety (MacIntyre, 1999). It is not a permanent state and the conditions of a particular situation trigger this type of anxiety (Young, 1991); also, as long as the sources of anxiety exist, state anxiety does not disappear (Young, 1990). Moreover, Keramida and Tsiplakides (2009) have defined the term of state anxiety as a social type of anxiety that emerges within reasonable limits under certain conditions. By regarding all these explanations, it can be clarified that while trait anxiety is the feeling anxious in any situation, state anxiety is experienced for different situations in a specific time.

The third anxiety type is *situation-specific anxiety* which is the apprehension of specific situations and events (Ellis, 1994). MacIntyre and Gardner (1991) have reported that it is experienced in a well-defined situation. As Young (1999) remarked, situation-specific anxiety is similar to trait anxiety; however, it is associated with a single context or situation unlike a general issue. In case of language learning, learners’ inadequate knowledge of language causes situation-specific anxiety (MacIntyre & Gardner, 1991) and learners have this type of anxiety every time during the language learning (Balemir, 2009); hence, foreign language anxiety is considered as a situation-specific anxiety. For example, public speaking, participating in class activities, and written exams are some specific situations for situation-specific anxiety (Zhanibek, 2001). To sum up, foreign language anxiety is described as a distinct complex of self-perceptions, beliefs, feelings, and behaviors during the language learning process (Horwitz, Horwitz, & Cope, 1986) and it is a unique apprehension to a specific situation; thus, it is identified as situation specific anxiety.

Furthermore, language anxiety has been identified with different explanations and categorizations such as facilitating vs. debilitating anxiety (Scovel, 1978) when effects of anxiety on individuals are regarded. This is based on the fact that anxiety has both positive and negative influences on the process of language learning. Brown (1994) has stated that facilitating anxiety creates a positive effect on learners during performing a task. In addition, Bekleyen (2004) has also pointed out that learners can do better than they might do and learners might be focused and alert with the help of facilitating anxiety. Unlike facilitating anxiety, debilitating anxiety makes learners flee from the new learning task (Scovel, 1978), and it does not motivate the learners in language learning. Therefore, while facilitating anxiety has a positive effect on performance, debilitating anxiety likely causes the decrease of learners' performance.

2.3. Foreign language anxiety

Language anxiety is a prevalent issue in the process of learning a foreign language and learners mostly experience anxiety during their language class. In regards to the relationship between anxiety and foreign language, Brown (1994) has remarked that learners have an anxious reaction during the complex tasks because they have the feeling of lack of necessary skills to complete them successfully. Also, there is no doubt that learners consider foreign language learning as a challenging task which is not easy to accomplish. Hence, they may have apprehensive attitudes and behaviors during the foreign language learning.

FLA is described by Horwitz et al. (1986) as “-a distinct complex of self-perceptions, beliefs, feelings and behaviours related to classroom language learning arising from the uniqueness of the language learning process” (p.128). Moreover, MacIntyre and Gardner (1994) have stated that language learners feel anxious or worried during the foreign language learning, and this feeling is correlated with speaking, listening, and learning in foreign language learning contexts. In Wong's (2009) study, students with high language anxiety express that they find English classes stressful because of their nervous, miserable, and anxious feelings.

According to Philipps (1994), negative affective reactions, negative attitudes, and discouragement toward foreign language studies are observed in a language classroom where there is a high level of FLA. Thus, it can be understood that FLA has an adverse influence on students' performance. For example, fear of speaking, making mistakes while

speaking, forgetting vocabulary and sentence structure of foreign language while speaking, and speaking in front of the other people are listed as the situations faced by worried learners (Koch & Terrell, 1991 as cited in Aydın, 2008). Similarly, MacIntyre & Gardner (1991) have realized that the speed of anxious learners' vocabulary learning is slower than less anxious learners; also, in order to remember the words, learners with high level experience more distress than the ones having lower level of anxiety. Furthermore, Wörde's study (2003) demonstrates how students reflect their anxiety in classroom; for example, while some of the students reflect their anxiety physically such as trembling, sweating, tapping their feet, drumming their desks, and headaches, some students draw pictures and write something unrelated to the lesson on their books. Also, they can have a nap during the class as avoidance from the class. Similarly, Chiu et al. (2010) have found out that students generally laugh to hide their anxiety in the class. By taking these studies into consideration, it is clear that students show different reactions in the face of anxiety in the classroom.

From a different point of view, some researchers claim that anxiety might be a motivating and contributing factor in language classes if learners know how to deal with their worries and apprehension while they are completing their tasks in language classes. Thus, anxiety becomes a motivation for learners as a facilitator factor in the language learning process (Gardner & MacIntyre, 1993; Scovel, 1991; Young, 1999). However, Williams and Andrade (2008) have pointed out a different opinion that anxiety cannot be a facilitator in language learning because it is difficult to truly measure the facilitating anxiety in real life, and they deduce from their study that anxiety is tool to control the class and do not have any function to facilitate foreign language learning.

On the other hand, a question appears in minds whether poor language learning causes foreign language anxiety among language learners. While some researchers point out that anxiety is the result of poor language learning, some claim vice versa. Horwitz (2001) put an end that anxiety is caused by poor language learning. She states that several factors such as risk taking and making mistakes have negative effects on language learners; thus, they may have feelings of apprehensiveness by taking into consideration their own public image. In addition, Sparks, Ganschow and Javorsky (2002) also have explained that since a subtle cognitive language learning disability causes poor achievement in language

learning, poor performance causes anxiety among learners, and it leads them to feel anxious.

In the process of language learning, language learners have the feeling of anxiety about all language skills, which has been studied by several researchers. According to the study of Sila (2010), anxiety first appears in the receptive skills (reading and listening) but later anxiety exists in the productive skills (speaking and writing) when the learners' proficiency level is getting upper. While Brantmeier (2005), Young (2000), and Zin (2000) studied the anxiety's relation with reading, Cheng (2002), Elkhafaifi (2005), and Vogely (1999) investigated anxiety's effect on listening skill. Furthermore, there are studies on how learners feel while writing by (Cheng, 2002; Cheng et al., 1999). By regarding the relation of anxiety with listening, writing, and reading, there is no doubt that oral performance is considered as the biggest anxiety factor for learners. Researches on the speaking anxiety has been carried out by Mak (2011), Öztürk and Gürbüz (2014), Subaşı (2010), and Hewitt and Stephenson (2012), and this type of anxiety occurring in a communicative atmosphere has been explained as a big obstacle for potential performance of learners and as the most difficult skill for learners (Mark, 2011; Subaşı, 2010; Zhang, 2009). Some factors bring about difficulty in speaking a foreign language, and Ur (1996) has listed these factors as feeling apprehensive about making mistakes, lack of motivation to express themselves, having a less speaking time because of large classes, and tending to use mother language because of its convenience. In addition, Rababa'ah (2005) has reported that learners themselves, teaching strategies, curriculum, learners' lack of foreign language competence, and environment cause speaking-anxiety in the classroom.

In addition, Ay (2010) examined the foreign language anxiety of young adolescent students in relation to language skills at different levels, and she reported that foreign language anxiety in receptive skills (reading and listening) was lower while the anxiety in productive skills (writing and speaking) was higher. This might be explained that learners might be more familiar with receptive skills from the beginning of language learning. Ay's study indicates that young adolescent students had the feeling of anxiety in the process of language learning and this feeling could have a negative effect in learners' future lives.

Liu and Chen (2013) studied FLA in young learners to realize the relationship between FLA and the variables such as multiple intelligences, learner attitudes, and perceived competence. According to the results of the study, foreign language anxiety had a negative

and significant relationship with learning attitude, length of taking extracurricular English lessons, and length of learning English, and multiple intelligences.

By regarding all these studies, several studies have been carried out since the 1970's (Curran, 1976; Gardner et al. 1976; Scovel 1991), and it has been proposed that it is difficult to measure the effects of anxiety on foreign language learning processes. However, it is an important issue for better learning environments; thus, the possible reasons behind anxiety should be understood by language teachers.

2.4. Components of foreign language learning anxiety

FLA is an important emotional factor for language learning and is based on many different factors. Horwitz et al. (1986) point out that FLA includes three components which are communication apprehension, fear of negative evaluation, and test anxiety.

2.4.1. Communication apprehension

Communication is inevitable and has a big importance to learn a foreign language, and foreign language learning requires learners to communicate in the target language. This need in the target language brings about communication apprehension which is a component of FLA in language classes and is defined by Horwitz et al. (1986) as “a type of shyness characterized by fear of or anxiety about communicating with people” (p.127). It is a distinct psychological state that is mostly associated with the oral production in foreign language learning. MacIntyre and Gardner (1989) have clarified communication apprehension is that learners may have the feeling not to be able to express themselves or to comprehend other learners in foreign language, which causes apprehension and worry.

Horwitz et al. (1986) exemplified communication apprehension as difficulties speaking with a partner or in groups, stage fright and receiver anxiety (i.e., difficulties comprehending an oral message). Therefore, communication apprehension has been regarded as a significant component of FLA (Aida, 1994) since speaking in a different language except for native language makes learners feel worried (Ergün, 2011; Horwitz et al., 1986; Levine, 2003; Young, 1990). As MacIntyre (1999) mentioned, the most significant factor of anxiety in the process of learning a foreign language was speaking. Also, Ergün (2011) has supported this situation by stating that communication in the target language is inevitable during the language learning process, and this situation makes learners feel nervous in language classes because learners have the fear of not being

understood in the target language and understanding the others in the classroom. Moreover, Horwitz et al. (1984) have remarked that even talkative people in their social life may have this frustration, and they may turn a silent person in language classes. On the other hand, while communication apprehension is associated with speaking and listening skills of language learning (Horwitz et al., 1986), there are various studies concentrating on reading and writing or on four skills of language learning (Balemir, 2009; Bekleyen, 2009; Cheng, 1999; Elkhafaifi, 2005; Young, 1991; Zhao, 2009).

By regarding communication apprehension among language learners, researchers have remarked different reasons for this type of anxiety in language classes. For example, there are missing authentic conversation skills for learners, and they do not have enough skills to express themselves during the class (Brown, 2009; MacIntyre & Gardner, 1989). Also, Bekleyen (2009) found that certain linguistic difficulties, teachers' manner, and crowded classrooms could be sources of this anxiety while low self-esteem, error correction, the feature of activities, and tasks might be listed as sources of communication apprehension by Young (1990). In addition, Aydın (2008) has stated that communication apprehension appears among language learners when they have lack of communication skills although they have many opinions to share; thus, a greater anxiety towards communication apprehension with teachers and peers is exhibited by younger learners.

2.4.2. Fear of negative evaluation

Fear of negative evaluation is defined by Horwitz et al. (1986, p.128) as “the apprehension about others' evaluations, avoidance of evaluative situations, and the expectation that others would evaluate oneself negatively”. The “others” are referred to as teachers and peers of learners, and language learners might generally feel evaluated by their teachers and by their peers during the language learning in the classroom. This feeling makes them feel anxious for speaking in front of their peers and teachers, and they are afraid of being in the spotlight (Young, 1990). Similarly, Aydın (2008) has stated that it is an apprehension resulting from the evaluation of other people who are around the learners; thus, evaluation and criticism of peers are main causes of anxiety (Conway, 2007). Therefore, in order to realize the effect of fear of anxiety on language learners, several studies have been implemented; for instance, Na (2007) has stated the general situation of high school students' anxiety in English classes that students' fear of negative evaluation is quite serious. According to the study of Alrabai (2015), learners' performance is permanently

monitored and evaluated in EFL classroom settings in Saudi Arabia, and the fear of a negative evaluation has been the main source of anxiety for learners in their English class.

In addition, the relation with emotions and anxiety-provoking beliefs in FL learning is investigated by Aragão (2011), and he has stated that emotions of shyness, embarrassments, pride, self-esteem, and inhibition are shaped by beliefs linked with a student's self-concept. The belief that classmates will criticize or laugh during the performance leads the student to have the fear of feeling embarrassed when speaking in the class (Aragão, 2011). By regarding this belief, Aida (1994) has stated the behavior of the learners who feel fear of negative evaluation that these learners would rather stay inactively in the classroom, and they do not want to do activities during the class, and they think the classroom as a problem creating area for them. Thus, fear of negative evaluation is seen as the main reason for foreign language anxiety since this feeling brings about test anxiety, communication apprehension with other people, fear of making mistakes during speaking, and negative attitudes toward foreign language learning (Aydın, 2008).

According to age of learners, fear of negative evaluation may show difference for learners; for instance, Aydın, Harputlu, Çelik, Uştuk and Güzel (2017a) found that students at younger ages experienced a low level of anxiety compared to the older ones when other students laughed at them while speaking English. Besides, the results showed that nine-year old students did not have any anxiety when they had any English exam. On the other hand, Gregersen and Horwitz (2002) found that fear of negative evaluation appeared in highly anxious students because they thought themselves as foolish when they met a situation in which peers or teachers evaluated them.

Sources of fear of negative evaluation are listed as negative judgments by others, leaving unfavorable impressions on others, making verbal or spelling mistakes, and disapproval by others who are teachers and friends during the process of learning in the study of Aydın (2008). Moreover, because of fear of negative evaluation, the questions asked by teachers and corrections made by teachers make learners feel worry (Aydın, 2008). Also, negative judgments by other people, leaving unfavorable impressions on others, committing verbal or spelling mistakes, and disapproval by others (such as teachers and friends) are listed as reasons for the fear of negative evaluation (Aydın, 2008). According to study of Horwitz et al. (1986), students cannot be sure what they are uttering during the conversation, and they may have the feeling that they are not good enough at expressing themselves for a proper

social impression, which is caused by fear of negative evaluation. Additionally, students' proficiency level has an effect on the feeling of fear of negative evaluation (Dil, 2009). Dil has pointed out that learners have the fear of being negatively evaluated when they make mistakes, especially in front of their classmates, and students who think their English is weak feel more fear than students who think their English is good.

2.4.3. Test anxiety

The last component of FLA is test anxiety, and it is defined as “a type of performance anxiety stemming from a fear of failure” by Horwitz et al. (1986, p. 128), and it is an apprehension of academic evaluation that learners consciously or unconsciously have because of a fear of failing tests (Horwitz & Young, 1991). Language learners feel anxious when a perfect performance is expected from them, and Ohata (2005) has related the test anxiety with negative consequences of getting poor grades which may lead to psychological stress like the fear of losing self-confidence. Also, according to Horwitz et al. (1986), tests and quizzes are used in foreign language classes, which causes anxiety for learners in language classes. Thus, Cicek (2015) has pointed out that when learners have the feeling of test anxiety, they meet some difficulties in the learning process; also, oral production is not considered as an opportunity for communication (Tsiplakides & Keramida, 2009).

Test anxiety is experienced by learners for every school subject in their entire learning process, and it is not a unique issue just for foreign language learning. Aida (1994) and MacIntyre and Gardner (1989) have claimed that learners have the feeling of speech anxiety and fear of negative evaluation by investigating FLA; however, there is not any proof showing that test anxiety is a particular issue for foreign language learning. Thus, it is accepted as a more general issue.

On the other hand, there have been different studies to indicate test anxiety as a component of FLA. One of them was conducted by Aydın et al. (2006) to indicate the students' FLA level, and the results showed that age, gender, grade, and formal achievement scores were indicators of test anxiety in foreign language learning. Also, Gursoy and Arman (2016) analyzed the level of test anxiety between high school students and found that students had a moderate level of test anxiety in foreign language learning. Both Aydın et al. (2006) and Gursoy and Arman (2016) reported that there was a negative relation between anxiety and test results; hence, those who had lower grades had more test anxiety.

Different variables affect the text anxiety and these variables are categorized as (1) subject variables such as age, gender, grade, economic and educational background (Madsen 1982; Putwain 2007; Rasor & Rasor 1998), and achievement and proficiency levels (Horwitz, 2001); (2) independent variables such as attitudes towards EFL learning, study skills, test validity, techniques (Shohamy, 1982), testing environment (Bushnell, 1978), test length and formats (Mandelson, 1973), time limit (Madsen & Murray, 1984), and test introduction (Young, 1990); (3) and extraneous variables such as teachers, course books, and language teaching methods (Rotenberg, 2002) and techniques. In addition, test anxiety levels of 8th grade students were studied by Duman (2008), and it was found that gender, paternal occupation, school type, socioeconomic status, parents' educational background, family income, and academic support had a significant correlation with test anxiety.

Aydin (2013) investigated the text anxiety among children and young adolescents and the relation between text anxiety and the variables, and obtained these results: The text anxiety of EFL learners at elementary school was low and they felt more confident and relaxed when they studied sufficiently; male students felt more anxious during studying for tests than female students; younger students felt more confidence for tests while older students were depressed and bothered about exams; higher grade students had more negative feeling about their performance when compared with lower-grade students; finally, the feeling of the students who lived with better economic conditions was more relaxed than the students' feelings who lived under better economic conditions. Moreover, Koçkar, Kılıç, and Şener (2002) tried to explain if there was a relationship between test anxiety and achievement among elementary school students and found out that learners with high test anxiety had the low level of academic achievement. Also, according to the study of Unruh and Lowe (2010), they found that gender was an important factor on the test anxiety for elementary and secondary schools.

All in all, even if students have a better performance during the class, they start to feel of fear when it comes to being tested, which causes failure. Additionally, communication apprehension and fear of negative evaluation are components of FLA, and they all have a big importance on foreign language learning.

2.5. Foreign language anxiety sources

There have been a negative relationship between anxiety and foreign language learning according to the studies of Aida (1994), Cheng (1994), and Gregersen (2003); however, the

reasons of this negative relation are not explicitly stated, and it shows variety from study to study (MacIntyre, 1995; Sparks & Ganschow, 2007).

From an analysis of the study of Young (1991), language anxiety is associated with personal and interpersonal anxieties, learner beliefs about language learning, instructor beliefs about language teaching, instructor-learner interactions, classroom procedures, and language testing. Young expresses each item as: Low self-esteem and competitiveness are two important sources of personal and interpersonal anxiety. Speaking with an excellent accent, the belief of the fact that two years is enough time to become a fluent speaker in another language, and that some people are more able to learn a foreign language than others are learning beliefs, which contributes to language anxiety. Instructors think that their roles are more like drill sergeants rather than facilitators, and this may be contributing to learner language anxiety. As classroom procedures, having to speak in the target language in front of a group arises anxiety, and Young stated that more than sixty-eight percent of her subjects reported feeling more comfortable when they did not have to get in front of the class to speak (p. 427).

Classroom activities and language learning strategies are identified as main variables that influence FL anxiety by Yang and Horwitz (2008). As Alrabai (2015) has stated, the reasons for anxiety could be associated with several factors such as religious, social, and cultural misconceptions for especially Saudi EFL learners. A threatening and competitive atmosphere in the classroom, lack of the learners' involvement in class discussion, overcrowded EFL classes, strict classroom rules, and assessment procedures are also defined as contributing factors to the learners' anxiety in Saudi Arabia. Moreover, Na (2007) has stated the factors of the existence of anxiety in English classes such as cultural tradition, lack of communication opportunities in English language, classroom atmosphere, and high expectation of parents for their children.

On the other hand, Trang, Baldauf and Moni (2013) have remarked that pedagogical approaches, assessment strategies, student-teacher relationship, and curriculum structure are the factors affecting anxious FL learners. Also, Subaşı (2010) investigated the reasons of main sources of students' anxiety while their speaking performance and personal reasons, teachers' manners, teaching procedures, and previous experience were listed as sources of anxiety from the interviews.

Khan (2015) has pointed out from the result of his study conducted to secondary level students that students' previous educational backgrounds, difficult and unknown topics, students' inabilities to express their thoughts, being negatively judged by the teacher, too much self-consciousness, and students' economic situations are the main reasons that make the students feel worried in learning English language.

Marwan (2016) investigated Indonesian students' foreign language anxiety and described the items in the questionnaire measuring anxiety factors as lack of confidence, lack of preparation, fear of failing the class, fear of making mistakes, and difficulty in understanding teachers' instructions. According to the results, lack of preparation, lack of confidence, and fear of failing in the class contributed to the feeling of learners' foreign language anxiety; moreover, lack of preparation was seen as a main cause of anxiety. Also, the results of Liu and Chen (2013)'s study indicated that EFL students who study at an elementary school in Taiwan felt anxious about "failing their English course" and "being a less competent English speaker than their peers" (p. 935). According to the study, low self-perceived ability level and learning attitude can be regarded as a source of language anxiety for young learners.

According to Chan and Wu (2004)'s investigation about foreign language anxiety of EFL elementary school students in Taiwan, they reached some variables which might have effects on learners' anxiety level. Firstly, they found a negative correlation between foreign language anxiety level and English learning achievement. Secondly, low proficiency, fear of negative evaluation, competition of games, anxious personality, and pressure from students themselves and their parents were specified as sources of language anxiety. Moreover, anxiety-provoking situations were reported as tests, speaking in front of others, incomprehensible input, and speaking to native speakers. Also, instruction language had an effect on language anxiety in the classroom and a balanced instructional language helped the students feel more relaxed. Finally, the awareness of the teachers about FLA is not sufficient, which causes anxiety in the classroom.

Aydin's (2008) investigation on the language anxiety among Turkish EFL learners showed the reasons of language anxiety as unpreparedness for class; communication apprehension with teachers, peers, and native speakers; teachers' questions and corrections in classroom environment; tests and negative attitudes towards English courses.

In the classroom teachers have a big responsibility and power during the process of foreign language learning; thus, teachers and teachers' beliefs about teaching foreign language are some of the factors for anxiety in the classroom, and teachers corrections and communication with teachers during the class are additional factors affecting learners' anxiety (Young, 1991). Teachers' corrections in the classroom, tests, and the fear of disapproval by others and making mistakes are the sources of anxiety for young learners according to the study of Aydın (2008). Öztürk and Gürbüz (2014) found the main reasons for EFL speaking anxiety as pronunciation, immediate questions, fears of making mistakes, and negative evaluation.

While learning a foreign language, speaking skill is one of the anxiety provoking factors during the language class. Mak (2011) identified several factors by using the FLCAS of Horwitz et al. (1986) such as fear of negative evaluation, not being comfortable when having a speech with a native, and adverse manners to language classes. According to Mark's study, negative self-evaluation and negative attitudes affect students' performance and achievement; thus, language teachers should care not only for students' linguistic competence but also sentimental needs by creating a secure and relaxed learning atmosphere which is decreased from anxiety risks.

According to Zhang and Zhong (2012), foreign language learning anxiety appears because of different factors; for example, when learners think that they have lack of ability to learn language, and language learners have the feeling of failing to achieve high standard of language because of exposition of an expert language of native speaker in the class. Also, Hashemi and Abbasi (2015) have attracted attention to classroom language, and they state that formal language classroom requires more correct and clear language usage in the classroom, which causes a big anxiety for learners. Furthermore, Zhang and Zhong (2012) have explained the instructors, peers, and classroom practices as the reasons for anxiety.

2.5.1. Other aspects

As Horwitz, Horwitz, and Cope (1986) have stated that communication apprehension, test anxiety, and fear of negative evaluation provide useful conceptual buildings for a description of foreign language anxiety; however, she asserts that foreign language anxiety is not simply the combination of these fears transferred to foreign language anxiety. Horwitz, Horwitz, and Cope (1986) have taken into consideration self-perceptions, beliefs, feelings, and behaviors related to classroom language learning arising from the uniqueness

of the language learning process. Therefore, there might be other sources or variables which affect the language learning process in the classroom.

2.5.1.1. Gender

There have been several different studies related to gender effect on FLA, and different results have been reported by researchers. Denies (2015) carried a study, linking gender to students' proficiency across 14 countries and Denies interpreted cross-country variation in the gender gap as an evidence that gender was primarily a social factor rather than a biological factor in FL learning. She stated from her analysis that girls had an outperformance, and this outperformance explained the gender difference on FL learning. Similarly, Dewaele and MacIntyre (2014) reported that gender had a significant effect on FLCA and female students showed a higher level of FLCA than male ones since female learners are more worried than male learners about making mistakes and lack of confidence (Dewaele et al. 2016). Another study of Dewaele follows up the same result, in which female students report more FLCA than their male peers (Dewaele, Witney, Saito, & Dewaele, 2018). The results of the studies indicate that female learners are more emotionally involved in the process of FL learning. In addition, Gerencheal and Horwitz (2016) investigated gender differences in foreign language anxiety at an Ethiopian university and concluded that females had a higher level of anxiety than male learners. Besides, Ezzi (2012) and Mesri (2012) found the same results with their study and pointed out that female students felt more anxious than males.

By regarding all these studies, the feeling of female students' anxiety changes according to some factors in the classroom, and the fear of failure, teachers' correction, negative evaluation and unpreparedness cause the anxiety of female students (Aydin, Harputlu, Çelik, Uştuk & Güzel, 2017a). When the situations of 'volunteering answers', 'speaking in English', and 'afraid of being laughed at' are taken into consideration in this study, the anxiety level of girls is significantly higher than boys' anxiety level. Marwan (2016) states that both female and male students felt anxious during the class when they were not prepared for the class; however, the findings also showed that male learners felt more confident during the class when compared with female ones. They had a common idea on the statement of *'I tremble when I know that I am going to be called on in my class and it embarrasses me to volunteer answers in my English class.'* from the questionnaire (Marwan, 2016).

On the other hand, according to some studies, there is a significant difference on the anxiety level of male and female students, and results show that male students feel more anxiety than female students (Azhar, Anwar, & Naz, 2010; Fariadian, Azizifar, & Gowhary, 2014; Na, 2007). The results point out that female students are more confident while male students tend to hesitate and feel anxious in the language learning environment. Yan and Horwitz (2008) state that there is a belief that females are better than males at language learning because females are more talented and hardworking.

While some of the researchers point out that gender has an effect on FLA, others explain that there is not a significant difference on anxiety by regarding gender of the learners. Hence, many other researchers pointed from a different perspective that gender did not have an effect on students' foreign language anxiety, and they found no correlation between gender and foreign language anxiety (Duxbury & Tsai, 2010; Loo & Kitjaroonchai, 2015; Piechurska- Kuciel, 2012; Wong, 2009). As an example, Aida (1994) investigated Japanese students' anxiety in their classrooms via Horwitz's (1986) FLCAS; thus, she tried to find out the sources of their anxiety, and tried to answer if there was a gender difference in language anxiety, and she found that there was not a significant gender difference in language anxiety.

2.5.1.2. Learning experience

L2 learning experience is associated with learners' attitudes toward language learning and can be affected by situation specific issues such as learning environment and experience. The time which is spent on foreign language has quite importance during the learning a foreign language, and how much time learners spend on language learning is an effective factor for learners' anxiety level. For example, when Wong (2009) compares the high language anxiety (HLA) students with the low language anxiety students (LLA), LLA students spend more time with English and have more efforts to improve their English skills whereas HLA students do not know anything about how to improve their proficiency in English. In this study, considering English materials and communication in English, there is also a significant difference between HLA and LLA students; only one HLA student communicates in English most of the time and most LLA students do reading English materials. Similarly, Dewaele et al. (2018) pointed out that more experienced FL learners who spent more time on four skills (listening, reading, writing, and speaking) reported less FLCA, reflecting the finding in Dewaele and MacIntyre (2014).

2.5.1.3. Age

The studies concerning age effect on FLA of young learners are quite limited because they are generally interrelated with adult learners. However, MacIntyre and Gardner (1994) explained that the level of FLA was increasing by learners getting older. Similarly, Aydın (2013) pointed out that young learners felt more relaxed with regards to text anxiety. On the other hand, Dewaele (2007) stated that the adult learners had less anxiety than young learners since language learning was a new situation for young learners. Aydın, Harputlu, Çelik, Uştuk and Güzel (2017a) found from their research that in terms of age, speaking activities, examinations, and teachers' corrections made the students feel more anxious than older ones. Therefore, even though there is no consensus regarding these studies, some studies show that age has an influence on foreign language anxiety; it might be one of the factors on language anxiety for learners.

2.5.1.4. Proficiency level

According to some studies, language anxiety differs across proficiency levels of language learners and several researchers have investigated the effect of proficiency level on language anxiety. For instance, Liu (2006) conducted a study about anxiety in Chinese EFL students at different proficiency levels and found a contrary relation between proficiency level and anxiety that students having high proficiency level showed a low-level anxiety. Dewaele and MacIntyre (2014) investigated the effect of FL mastery on FLCA, and the test results in the study showed that the anxiety scores of the high intermediate and advanced groups were significantly lower; moreover, the advanced group showed a lower level FLCA than the high intermediate group. Thus, they reported the idea that the more the students are advanced level in FL, the less there is anxiety in the classroom. Also, Marwan (2016) revealed that lower intermediate students had the problem of self-confidence because of likely their limitations in foreign language mastery; thus, they felt more anxiety than upper intermediate learners. Similarly, Na (2007) states the factors of the existence of anxiety in English classes as English proficiency since learners feel anxious and worried when their proficiency level is not enough to communicate freely and express themselves adequately.

On the contrary of these studies, Marcos-Llinás and Garau (2009) noted that anxiety of advanced learners was higher than beginner and intermediate level students. Similarly,

Aydin (2013)'s study also pointed out the same results that high-grade students felt more worried about foreign language tests than the lower grade students.

From a different point of view, Batumlu and Erden (2007) state that proficiency level does not have a significant effect on anxiety. Balemir (2009) supports this result with his study, and he shows that learners' anxiety degree is not influenced by their' proficiency level.

2.5.1.5. Achievement

When Horwitz (2010) listed many studies related to FLCA, she pointed out that many studies showed a consistent and negative correlation between language anxiety and FL proficiency scores which included course grades, standardized tests, and other measures. Dalkılıç (2001) studied the relation between achievement and foreign language anxiety, found out that achievement was affected adversely by foreign language anxiety; thus, foreign language anxiety is a significant factor on learners' achievement.

A number of studies show that learners with a high academic achievement can have a high degree of FLA (Kitano, 2001; Marcos-Llinás & Garau, 2009). On the other hand, according to the study conducted to the university students in Pakistan, the results showed that there was a negative correlation between language anxiety and academic achievement; thus, as academic achievement increases, the level of anxiety decreases among university students (Azher, Anwar, & Naz, 2010). Additionally, Batumlu and Erden (2007) also found a negative correlation between achievement and anxiety. Aydin, Harputlu, Çelik, Uştuk and Güzel (2017a) pointed out that the students who had lower grade felt more worried than higher grades in the class because of examinations, unpreparedness, and teachers' correction.

2.5.1.6. Academic year/ grade

Several researchers found that the level of FLA did not show any decrease in regards to learners' grade (Aydemir, 2011; Casado and Dereshiwsky, 2001; Elaldı, 2016). On the contrary, when students' grade is getting higher, their anxiety levels appear higher; for instance, the students' anxiety level at preparatory class becomes lower than students' fourth grade anxiety level (Elaldı, 2016).

Concerning all the studies mentioned, language anxiety is regarded as a significant issue for the students while learning a foreign language, and students mostly feel worried and uneasy in the language classrooms. Thus, several studies have been conducted to

investigate which sources or what factors affect FLA among the students, and FLA has been based on many various factors including communication apprehension, fear of negative evaluation, and test anxiety. Besides, anxiety sources vary from study to study, and the age, gender, academic achievement, learning experience, proficiency level, and grade of the students might be determinant factors on their anxiety levels.



CHAPTER III

METHODOLOGY

This chapter presents the design of the study and it gives information about the method of the study, the population and the sample of the study/ research group, and data collection instruments. Finally, data collection process and data analysis are explained to find out the level of young learners' FLA and the reasons for this anxiety.

3.1. The method of the study

This study aimed to investigate the FLA among young learners, find out the level of FLA among young learners, and young learners' FLA sources in language classes. It was designed as a mixed methods research to investigate the different perspectives drawn from both qualitative and quantitative data. Mixed methods research is an approach that involves both qualitative and quantitative data and integrates these two forms of data to reach the different perspectives of the study (Creswell, 2014). Also, by integrating both quantitative and qualitative into a study, researchers corroborate their findings in a way that one type of data does not allow (Tashakkori & Teddlie, 2003), and Creswell (2014) suggests that an expanded understanding of the problems is provided by the combination of qualitative and quantitative approaches. Hence, using a mixed methods design, the researcher was able to compare, interpret, and integrate main findings from different forms of data.

In the current study, quantitative data is collected by Foreign Language Anxiety Scale (Aydın, Harputlu, Uştuk, Güzel, & Çelik, 2017b), which was adapted for young learners from the Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS) of Horwitz et al. (1986), whereas qualitative data is collected by semi structured interviews which are created by the researcher by examining the studies on foreign language learning anxiety (Balemir, 2009; Çermik, 2015; Özkan, 2019; Öztürk & Gürbüz, 2014; Worde, 2003) and by examining and following the steps of preparing semi-structured interviews questions.

3.2. Participants

The study was conducted during the first term of 2020-2021 academic years, and the target group was 5th, 6th and 7th grade students who study at the public secondary schools in Karasu, Sakarya, Turkey. The universe of the study was Karasu, and the sample of the study was 8 different public secondary schools which are located in the city center. The

questionnaire was implemented in one class from every grade in every secondary school. All the classes were chosen randomly to administer the questionnaire. In total, the number of 5th grade students was 147, the number of 6th grade students was 176, and the number of 7th grade students was 117. All in all, 440 students were included in the study from different schools; however, 60 students' answers were removed from the study since there was missing information on their questionnaire. In this study, 8th grade students were not included since they might have already had the feeling of anxiety for high school exams, and it might be difficult to distinguish this anxiety from foreign language anxiety. The demographic distribution of the participants is illustrated in Table 1.

Table 1
The Demographic Distribution of the Participants

Variables	Items	N	%
Gender	Male	162	42,4
	Female	218	57,1
Age	9	5	1,3
	10	66	17,3
	11	142	37,2
	12	169	44,2
	1(100-85)	181	47,4
Academic Achievement	2(84-70)	82	21,5
	3(69-60)	55	14,4
	4(59-50)	43	11,3
	5(49-0)	21	5,5
	1 – High	95	24,9
Economic Level	2 – Medium	270	70,7
	3 – Low	17	4,5
Father Education Level	1-University	68	17,8
	2-High School	126	33,0

Mother Education Level	3-Secondary School	129	33,8
	4-Primary School	58	15,2
	1-University	50	13,1
	2-High School	110	28,8
Parental Foreign Language Learning Expectation	3-Secondary School	121	31,7
	4- Primary School	100	26,2
	1 – High	263	68,8
	2 – Medium	96	25,1
Learning Experience Years	3 – Low	23	6,0
	1	2	,5
	2	6	1,6
	3	121	31,7
	4	144	37,7
	5	99	25,9
	6	10	2,7

3.3. Data collection instruments and data collection process

3.3.1. Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS)

Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS) was designed by Horwitz et al. (1986) in order to investigate the foreign language classroom anxiety level. FLCAS is a tool including originally 33 items and scored on a 5-point Likert Scale, ranging from “strongly disagree” (1) to “strongly agree” (5). The scale consists of three components, which are communication apprehension, fear of negative evaluation, and test anxiety.

The tool developed by Horwitz et al. (1986) mostly addresses adult learners, and several studies have been conducted by using this scale. On the other hand, it should be noted that there are limited studies which measure the effect of FLA on young learners (Aydın, 2013). Aydın et al. (2017b) state that FLCAS is used as a tool for measuring anxiety levels of young learners even if it was designed for adults. By regarding the developmental and cognitive differences of young learners, FLCAS is not sufficient to find out the anxiety

level of young learners since young learners might have problems with understanding the statements and expressions (Aydın et al., 2017b). Therefore, Aydın et al. (2017b) clarified that a specific scale should be designed for young learners in order to reveal the sources and the level of anxiety among young learners and they adapted FLCAS of Horwitz et al. (1986) for young learners.

The adapted version of FLCAS by Aydın et al. (2017b) includes 20 items on three components which were determined in original scale as communication apprehension, fear of negative evaluation, and test anxiety. In the scale, ten items (1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10) are related with communication apprehension; seven items (11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17) are related with fear of negative evaluation; lastly, three items (18, 19, 20) are related with test anxiety. Each item in the scale includes 5 facial expressions ranging from very unhappy (1), unhappy (2), neither happy nor unhappy (3), happy (4), very happy (5), as seen in Figure 1. In the study of Aydın et al. (2017b), the internal consistency was found to be .85 in Cronbach's Alpha; therefore, this scale is reliable and valid to measure the levels of FLA among children aged 7-12 who learn English as a foreign language (EFL) in the Turkish EFL context.

Furthermore, before the study, this adapted version of the questionnaire was piloted with a few participants in order to determine whether the questionnaire is understood clearly by the target group and whether it works with the target group or not.



Figure 1. Sample item of FLCAS

3.3.2. Semi-structured interviews

In order to gather more information about the sources of FLCA from the students' point of view and to gain a deep understanding from their inner world, semi-structured interviews were held with seven students who had a high level of anxiety according to results of adopted FLCAS. By the help of semi-structured interview, anxious learners could have a

chance to point out why they had this feeling in language classes, and the sources of FLCA could be clarified in a detailed way.

As for qualitative data, semi-structured interview questions were prepared in the line with Creswell (2014) by examining and basing the studies related with the anxiety of foreign language learning (Balemir, 2009; Çermik, 2015; Özkan, 2019; Öztürk & Gürbüz, 2014; Worde, 2003). After a supervisor confirmed the questions, the questions were piloted with a few students to find out if the questions are understood well by the students and if they work with the target group. After that, the semi-structured interviews were carried out in Turkish with anxious students in order to create a relaxing atmosphere and to help them to express their opinions freely. All data collection and analysis procedures were carried out according to Creswell (2014); thus, the responses of questions were recorded by taking permission from the interviewees. After the interviews were conducted to 7 anxious students, all responses were transcribed into English by the researcher and transcribed responses into English were checked by another rater. Both English and Turkish versions of interview questions were provided at the Appendix 2 and Appendix 3.

3.4. Data analysis

In this study, data were collected quantitatively and qualitatively. The quantitative data were collected with Horwitz et al.'s (1986) FLCAS, which was adopted for young learners by Aydın et al. (2017b). The FLCAS had a five graded Likert scale; very unhappy (1), unhappy (2), neither happy nor unhappy (3), happy (4), very happy (5), and included three sub-factors: communication apprehension, fear of negative evaluation, and test anxiety. The qualitative data were collected by semi-structured interview questions.

First of all, in the study, in order to determine the suitability of using parametric analysis methods, Kolmogorov Smirnov was tested for normality tests in order to determine whether the normality assumptions were met. Kolmogorov Smirnov normality test results related to the distribution of the data obtained by the measurement tool were given in Table 2. Non-parametric analysis methods were preferred because normality assumptions were not met in the measurement tool sub-dimensions and total scores.

Table 2

Test of Normality

Sub-factors of the FLCAS	Kolmogorov-Smirnov		
	Statistics	Sd	P
Communication Apprehension	,076	382	,000
Fear of Negative Evaluation	,102	382	,000
Test Anxiety	,266	382	,000
Total Score	,071	382	,000

In the study, the mean and standard deviation values of each dimension were used for students' anxiety of learning foreign languages.

Mann-Whitney U test was used to determine whether the students' foreign language learning anxiety differs significantly according to gender. Kruskal-Wallis H Test was used for variables such as age, academic success, economic status, father education, mother education, family's English learning expectation (parental expectation), and English learning experience.

The Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) program was used while performing statistical operations. While performing statistical operations, the value of .05 was taken as the level of significance.

The qualitative data collected from 7 anxious students' answers were analyzed through content analysis procedures of Creswell (2014). Firstly, all the answers of the students were transcribed and translated in English, and the answers were read for a general understanding. After that, the data were interpreted by the researcher and another rater. After the interpretation, common themes were created from the answers according to their frequencies by the researcher and another rater. These themes were explained in a detailed way in order to explain the sources of FLA among young learners. These themes were explained in a detailed way in order to explain the sources of FLA among young learners.

CHAPTER IV

FINDINGS

This chapter includes the results of the quantitative and qualitative data of the study. The first section presents the results of the FLCAS and clarifies what extent students' anxiety differs in terms of the age, gender, academic achievement, economic situation, parents' education level, parental expectation, and learning experience. The second section provides the sources of FLA among young learners with the results of the interviews.

4.1. Findings of quantitative data

4.1.1. What is the level of young learners' foreign language anxiety?

This question aimed to investigate the level of the FLA among young learners studying public schools through the FLCAS, consisting of three sub-dimensions. The questionnaire was a 5-graded Likert scale and the total score ranged from 20 to 100. Table 3 presented the results of the FLA among young learners.

Table 3

FLA Among Young Learners

Sub-factors of the FLCAS	Mean	Standard Deviation
Communication Apprehension	37,2227	6,66058
Fear of Negative Evaluation	13,0173	3,65965
Test Anxiety	13,9514	1,63344
Total Score	64,1915	8,30493

The factors of FLCAS among young learners, their mean scores and standard deviation values were revealed in Table 2: It is $37.22 + 6.66$ for Communication Apprehension, $13.01 + 3.65$ for Fear of negative evaluation, $13.95 + 1.63$ for Test Anxiety. The FLA total score of the students participating in the study ranged between 34 and 83, their average score was 64.19 and the standard deviation is 8.30.

Considering the FLCAS, the highest possible score could be 100 for the total score, 50 for the communication apprehension, 35 for the fear of negative evaluation, and 15 for the test

anxiety. According to the mean scores and possible highest score, students' anxiety level was defined. Thus, the results for the sub-dimensions of the FLCAS showed that the students had a moderate anxiety in terms of communication apprehension (M=37,2227), a high level of anxiety in terms of the fear of negative evaluation (M=13,0173), and a low level of anxiety in terms of test anxiety (M=13,9514). Considering the total score of the FLCAS (M=64,1915), the students were considered to be moderately anxious in language classes.

4.1.2. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of gender?

In order to have a deep understanding of FLA among young learners, another question was asked to reveal to what extent students' FLA differed in terms of gender. Mann Whitney U-test results according to the gender variable of students' foreign language learning anxiety are presented in Table 4.

Table 4

FLA Difference Between Gender Groups

	Gender	n	Mean Rank	Total Rank	U	P
Communication Apprehension	Male	162	185,83	30104,00	16901,000	,474
	Female	218	193,97	42286,00		
Fear of negative evaluation	Male	162	209,98	34016,00	14503,000	,003
	Female	218	176,03	38374,00		
Test Anxiety	Male	162	164,68	26678,00	13475,000	,000
	Female	218	209,69	45712,00		
Total Score	Male	162	188,96	30611,50	17408,500	,814
	Female	218	191,64	41778,50		

According to Table 4, the number of male students was 162, and the number of female students was 281, in total 380 students were included in the study. Table 3 revealed that

mean rank for male participants was 188,96, and mean rank for female participants was 191,64.

When Table 4 was examined, FLA of young learners showed a significant difference in fear of negative evaluation ($U = 14503,000$, $p < .05$) and test anxiety ($U = 13475,000$, $p < .05$) as sub-dimensions of the FLCAS. When the mean ranks were taken into consideration, it was determined that female students had higher fear of negative evaluation levels compared to male students whereas it was determined that male students' test anxiety levels were higher than female students.

On the other hand, it was found that students' FLA did not show a significant difference in the sub-dimension of communication apprehension ($U = 16901,000$, $p > .05$) and their total scores ($U = 17408,500$, $p > .05$).

4.1.3. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of age?

As another variable, the researcher questioned the age effect on the young learners' FLA and focused on the students' ages. For students' FLA scores according to different age groups, Kruskal Wallis H test results are presented in Table 5.

Table 5

Kruskal Wallis H Test Results for FLA Difference in Terms of Age

	Age	n	Mean Rank	sd	χ^2	p	Significant Difference
Communication Apprehension	9	5	266,90	3	8,142	,043	11-12
	10	66	186,33				
	11	142	207,62				
	12	169	177,74				
Fear of Negative evaluation	9	5	168,70	3	1,345	,718	
	10	66	180,26				
	11	142	197,63				
	12	169	191,42				
Test Anxiety	9	5	253,80	3	2,196	,533	

	10	66	191,33			
	11	142	193,84			
	12	169	187,76			
	9	5	252,20			
Total Score	10	66	183,61	3	6,273	,099
	11	142	206,54			
	12	169	180,15			

In the study, students' ages varied between 9 from 12. When Table 5 was examined, according to students' FLA total scores [$\chi^2 (3) = 6,273$, $p > .05$] in terms of age, there was not a significant difference in students' FLA. Also, by regarding sub-factors of the FLCAS, students' FLA did not differ significantly in the fear of negative evaluation scores [$\chi^2 (3) = 1,345$, $p > .05$] and in test anxiety scores [$\chi^2 (3) = 2,196$, $p > .05$].

On the other hand, it was found that there was a significant difference in students' FLA in terms of age in the communication apprehension sub-factor of the FLCAS [$\chi^2 (3) = 8,142$, $p < .05$]. In order to determine in which groups there was a meaningful difference, Bonferroni Multiple Comparison test results were examined. According to these results, 12 years old students had higher foreign language learning anxiety in communication apprehension compared to 11-year-old students and the difference was significant.

4.1.4. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' academic achievement?

Academic achievement was another variable questioned in this study. What extent students' FLA differed in terms of students' academic achievement was analyzed with Kruskal Wallis H test and the results are presented in Table 6.

Table 6

Kruskal Wallis H Test Results for FLA Difference in Terms of Academic Achievement

	Academic Achievement	N	Mean Rank	sd	χ^2	p	Significant Difference
Communication Apprehension	1(100-85)	181	242,26	4	77,316	,000	1-5, 1-4, 1-3, 1-2
	2(84-70)	82	159,52				
	3(69-60)	55	152,78				
	4(59-50)	43	124,69				
	5(49-0)	21	117,12				
Fear of Negative evaluation	1(100-85)	181	193,79	4	5,195	,268	
	2(84-70)	82	173,45				
	3(69-60)	55	207,57				
	4(59-50)	43	206,83				
	5(49-0)	21	168,74				
Test Anxiety	1(100-85)	181	209,59	4	15,364	,004	1-4
	2(84-70)	82	186,91				
	3(69-60)	55	181,51				
	4(59-50)	43	148,55				
	5(49-0)	21	167,62				
Total Score	1(100-85)	181	235,32	4	56,994	,000	1-5, 1-4, 1-3, 1-2
	2(84-70)	82	157,06				
	3(69-60)	55	164,95				
	4(59-50)	43	139,08				
	5(49-0)	21	125,19				

According to Kruskal Wallis H Test results, students' FLA in terms of their academic achievement which was grouped as 100-85, 84-70, 69-60, 59-50, and 49-0 were revealed. When Table 6 was examined, there was a significant difference in students' FLA in the total score [χ^2 (4) = 56,994, $p < .05$] according to their academic achievement.

Furthermore, to be more specific, students' FLA in communication apprehension [$\chi^2 (4) = 77,316, p < .05$] and test anxiety [$\chi^2 (4) = 15,364, p < .05$] differed significantly. However, it was found that there was no significant difference in the fear of negative evaluation [$F(2) (4) = 5,195, p > .05$] sub-factor of the FLCAS according to the academic achievement of students' FLA scores.

In order to determine in which groups there was a meaningful difference observed in students' FLA, Bonferroni Multiple Comparison test results were examined. The results indicated that students with academic achievement between 100-85 scores had lower levels of foreign language learning anxiety in the communication apprehension sub-factor compared to students with academic success between 84-70, 69-60, 59-50 and 49-0.

It was found that FLA of the students who had academic success between 59-50 scores was higher in test anxiety, and the difference was significant compared to students with academic achievement between 100-85 scores.

In addition, FLA of the students with academic achievement between 100-85 scores was lower in the total scores of foreign language learning anxiety compared to students with academic success between 84-70, 69-60, 59-50 and 49-0.

4.1.5. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' economic situation?

The results of Kruskal Wallis H test of FLA scores according to the students' economic levels are presented in Table 7.

Tablo 7

Kruskal Wallis H Test Results for FLA Difference in Terms of Economic Situation

	Economic Situation	N	Mean Rank	sd	χ^2	p	Significant Difference
Communication Apprehension	1 – High	95	203,61				
	2 – Medium	270	186,28	2	2,074	,354	
	3 – Low	17	206,76				
Fear of Negative	1 – High	95	175,14	2	2,855	,240	

Evaluation	2 – Medium	270	197,31			
	3 – Low	17	190,68			
	1 – High	95	195,54			
Test Anxiety	2 – Medium	270	189,31	2	,527	,768
	3 – Low	17	203,76			
	1 – High	95	196,52			
Total Score	2 – Medium	270	189,59	2	,284	,868
	3 – Low	17	193,74			

Table 7 indicated the effect of students' economic situation on their FLA scores. When Table 7 was examined, sd scores for both all sub-factors of the FLCAS and total result were 2. According to the results, students' FLA in terms of the economic level did not differ in communication apprehension [$\chi^2 (2) = 2,074, p > .05$], fear of negative evaluation [$\chi^2 (2) = 2,855, p > .05$], and test anxiety [$\chi^2 (2) = ,527, p > .05$] as sub-factors of the FLCAS. Moreover, the total score of the scale [$\chi^2 (2) = ,284, p > .05$] did not differ significantly. In other words, findings of the study demonstrated that FLA of the students did not show any statistically significant difference in terms of students' economic situation.

4.1.6. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of parents' education level of the students?

Another research question asked in the study aimed to find out whether there was a significant difference in students' FLA in terms of their parents' education level. Firstly, the results of Kruskal Wallis H test of FLA scores according to the father's education level of the students are presented in Table 8.

Table 8

Kruskal Wallis H Test Results for FLA Difference in Terms of Fathers' Education Level of the Students

	Father Education Level	N	Mean Rank	sd	χ^2	p	Significant Difference
Communication Apprehension	1-University	68	194,32				
	2-High School	126	185,96				
	3-Secondary School	129	193,53	3	,405	,939	
	4-Primary School	58	192,42				
Fear of Negative Evaluation	1-University	68	179,55				
	2-High School	126	196,96				
	3-Secondary School	129	187,85	3	1,489	,685	
	4-Primary School	58	198,47				
Test Anxiety	1-University	68	163,76				
	2-High School	126	191,26				
	3-Secondary School	129	206,90	3	8,214	,042	3-1
	4-Primary School	58	187,00				
Total Score	1-University	68	183,21				
	2-High School	126	189,39				
	3-Secondary School	129	194,90	3	,604	,895	
	4-Primary School	58	194,95				

Table 8 revealed Kruskal Wallis H test results for students' FLA scores according to their fathers' education level and according to the results; most of the fathers' education level was high school or secondary school. When the results were considered, it was found that students' FLA in terms of their father education level did not differ in communication apprehension [$\chi^2 (3) = 405, p > .05$], fear of negative evaluation [$\chi^2 (3) = 685, p > .05$], and total score of the study [$\chi^2 (3) = 604, p > .05$]. It means that students' FLA did not differ significantly both in general score and in terms of communication apprehension and fear of negative evaluation.

On the other hand, the table indicated that students' FLA showed a significant difference in test anxiety sub-factor [$\chi^2 (3) = 8.214, p < .05$] according to father education level. Thus, the results of the Mann-Whitney U test of binary combinations of the groups were examined to determine among which groups had the significant difference observed in the study. According to these results, it was found that this significant difference appeared between high school education level and university education level; therefore, the students' FLA in test anxiety was higher when their father's education level was university, and this difference was significant compared to the students whose father education level was secondary school.

Furthermore, in order to observe whether there was a significant difference in students' FLA in terms of their parents' education level, the results of Kruskal Wallis H test of FLA scores according to the mothers' education level of the students are presented in Table 9.

Table 9

Kruskal Wallis H Test Results for FLA Difference in Terms of Mothers' Education Level of the Students

	Mother Education level	N	Mean Rank	sd	χ^2	p	Significant Difference
Communication Apprehension	1-University	50	195,31	3	1,929	,587	
	2-High School	110	186,89				
	3-Secondary School	121	200,79				

	4-Primary School	100	181,53			
	1-University	50	190,46			
	2-High School	110	192,90			
Fear of negative evaluation	3-Secondary School	121	198,90	3	1,740	,628
	4-Primary School	100	179,62			
	1-University	50	175,25			
	2-High School	110	186,25			
Test Anxiety	3-Secondary School	121	204,74	3	3,811	,283
	4-Primary School	100	187,47			
	1-University	50	193,99			
	2-High School	110	189,34			
Total Score	3-Secondary School	121	205,85	3	4,832	,184
	4-Primary School	100	173,37			

The FLA differences among students in terms of their mother education level could be interpreted according to the findings of the Kruskal Wallis H test that there was no significant difference in students' FLA in communication apprehension [$\chi^2 (3) = 1,929$, $p > .05$], fear of negative evaluation [$\chi^2 (3) = 1,740$, $p > .05$], test anxiety [$\chi^2 (3) = 3,811$, $p > .05$] (as sub-factors of the FLCAS), and in total score [$\chi^2 (3) = 4,832$, $p > .05$] of the result. In other words, the mother education level did not make any difference in students' FLA.

4.1.7. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of parental expectation?

The results of the Kruskal Wallis H test of foreign language learning anxiety scores according to the parents' English learning expectations from their own students are presented in Table 10.

Table 10

Kruskal Wallis H Test Results for FLA Difference in Terms of Parental Expectation

	Parental Expectation	n	Mean Rank	sd	χ^2	p	Significant Difference
Communication Apprehension	1 – High	263	220,60				
	2 – Medium	96	129,84	2	59,063	,000	1-3, 1-2
	3 – Low	23	116,07				
Fear of negative evaluation	1 – High	263	183,07				
	2 – Medium	96	217,88	2	7,421	,024	2-1
	3 – Low	23	177,83				
Test Anxiety	1 – High	263	209,86				
	2 – Medium	96	147,53	2	28,279	,000	1-2
	3 – Low	23	165,07				
Total Score	1 – High	263	214,77				
	2 – Medium	96	146,36	2	39,156	,000	1-2, 1-3
	3 – Low	23	113,80				

Tablo 10 revealed that according to English learning expectations of the parents from their students, students' FLA scores differed significantly in terms of communication apprehension [$\chi^2(2) = 59,063$, $p < .05$], fear of negative evaluation [$\chi^2(2) = 7,421$, $p < .05$], and test anxiety [$\chi^2(2) = 28,279$, $p < .05$] as sub-factors of the FLCAS, also in terms of total score [$\chi^2(2) = 39,156$, $p < .05$]. In other words, parents' English learning expectations from their own students created a significant effect on students' FLA.

Bonferroni multiple comparison test results were examined in order to determine in which groups there was a meaningful difference observed in students' FLA. According to these results, it was found that parents who had a medium and low level of English learning expectation created a higher level of FLA over the students in communication apprehension, and this difference was significant compared to the students' parents who had a high-level of English learning expectation from their students.

As displayed in Table 10, FLA of the students whose parents had a medium level of learning expectation was higher in the fear of negative evaluation sub-factor, and the difference was meaningfully significant compared to FLA of the students whose parents had a high-level of English learning expectation.

In addition, in terms of test anxiety sub- factor of the FLCAS, the students whose parents had a high-level of English learning expectations had higher levels of foreign language learning anxiety, and the differences was meaningfully significant compared to the students whose parents had a medium level of English learning expectation.

On the other hand, FLA of the students whose parents had a high-level of English learning expectation was higher in the total scores of foreign language learning anxiety, and the difference was meaningfully significant compared to the students whose parents had a medium and low level of English learning expectation.

4.1.8. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' learning experience?

Learning experience was another variable in this study, and in order to show what extent students' FLA differed in terms of their learning experience, they were asked how long they had been learning English as a foreign language. The results of the Kruskal Wallis H test of the students' foreign language learning anxiety scores according to their English education year are presented in Table 11.

Table 11

Kruskal Wallis H Test Results for FLA Difference in Terms of Students' Learning Experience

	Students' Learning Experience Years	n	Mean Rank	sd	χ^2	p	Significant Difference
Communication Apprehension	1	2	137,00	5	12,404	,030	4-3
	2	6	150,58				
	3	121	216,16				
	4	144	175,73				

	5	99	192,97				
	6	10	141,15				
	1	2	42,25				
	2	6	211,42				
Fear of negative evaluation	3	121	186,27	5	7,012	,220	
	4	144	190,96				
	5	99	194,63				
	6	10	249,45				
	1	2	106,75				
	2	6	147,33				
Test Anxiety	3	121	214,25	5	14,298	,014	4-3
	4	144	175,14				
	5	99	196,10				
	6	10	149,70				
	1	2	88,75				
	2	6	161,08				
	3	121	214,56				
Total Score	4	144	174,49	5	12,031	,034	4-3
	5	99	195,51				
	6	10	156,55				

Table 11 indicated how long students had been learning English as a foreign language learning years varied from 1 to 6 years. According to Kruskal Wallis H test results, students' FLA in communication apprehension [$\chi^2 (5) = 12,404$, $p < .05$] and in test anxiety [$\chi^2 (5) = 14,298$, $p < .05$] and in the total score [$\chi^2 (5) = 12,031$, $p < .05$] differed significantly in terms of their learning experience. However, the scores of students' FLA did not differ significantly in the sub-dimension of fear of negative evaluation [$\chi^2 (4) = 7,012$, $p > .05$].

Bonferroni multiple comparison test results were examined to determine in which groups there was a meaningful difference observed in students' FLA. According to these results, students who had been learning English as a foreign language for 4 years had a higher-level of FLA in communication apprehension sub-factor and the difference was significant compared to students learning English for 3 years.

Moreover, students who had been learning English as a foreign language for 4 years had a higher-level of FLA in test anxiety sub-factor and the difference was significant compared to students learning English for 3 years.

In addition, students who had been learning English as a foreign language for 4 years had a higher-level of FLA in total score and the difference was meaningfully significant compared to students learning English for 3 years.

4.2. Findings of qualitative data

In order to have a deeper understanding of the sources of the FLA among young learners, a semi-structured interview was held with 7 students who had a high level of anxiety according to the results of the FLCAS. These seven students had the highest level of FLA, and they were from different secondary schools and different grades. The interviewees' profiles are presented in Table 12 in terms of their age, gender, English learning experience year, academic achievement, father education level, mother education level, economic level, and parental expectation.

Table 12

The Profile of the Interviewees

Interviewees	Gender	Age	Learning Experience	Academic Achievement	Father Education Level	Mother Education Level	Economic Level	Parental Expectation
1	Female	12	5 years	84-70	Secondary	High	High	High
2	Male	12	6	100-	University	High	High	High

			years	85				
3	Female	11	4 years	84-70	Secondary	Primary	Medium	Medium
4	Male	11	4 years	49-0	Primary	Primary	Low	High
5	Male	12	4 years	59-50	Secondary	Secondary	Medium	Low
6	Male	11	4 years	84-70	High	Secondary	Medium	Medium
7	Female	10	3 years	100- 85	High	Secondary	Medium	High

The interview questions were semi-structured and included 6 questions prepared by the researcher by examining the studies on foreign language learning anxiety (Balemir, 2009; Çermik, 2015; Özkan, 2019; Öztürk & Gürbüz, 2014; Worde, 2003). The interviews were conducted in Turkish in order to make the interviewees understand the questions better and to help them to express their feelings and thoughts clearly. When the interviews were carried out with the students, and the interviews were recorded and transcribed by taking permission from the students. The transcription of the interviews was analyzed according to Creswell (2014)'s qualitative research procedure. After reading through all transcribed data, the researcher and another rater coded the data and created some themes in order to clarify the sources of the FLA among young learners from their answers to the interview questions. Recurring themes were identified for each code and they were calculated in terms of frequency. The themes were identified such as suddenly being asked questions by the teacher, not being able to answer the questions, having low marks, teacher, difficult subjects, writing long articles, and activities. And these themes were presented in Table 14 with their frequencies. Furthermore, in order to clarify the sources of the FLA among young learners, the anxious students were asked to answer how they felt during the lesson. The responses about their feelings during the lesson are presented in Table 13.

Table 13

The feelings of the Anxious Students in the Classroom

Feelings	f
Good	2
Both good and bad	2
Normal	1
Bored	1
Bad	1

The feelings stated by the anxious students were good, good and bad, normal, bored, and bad. As illustrated in Table 13, although all the interviewed students were anxious according to the result of the FLCAS, their feelings varied from good to bad; therefore, the sources of FLA uttered by these students had a big importance and they are clarified in Table 14.

Table 14

The Sources of the Interviewees' FLA

Themes	f
not being able to answer the questions	7
suddenly being asked questions by the teacher	6
having low marks	4
Teacher	4
difficult subjects	2
writing long articles	2
Activities	2

According to the anxious students' responses as illustrated in Table 14, the students feel anxious because of not being able to answer the questions in the classroom (f=7). Some of the responses were presented below:

Interviewee 3: *"Well, suddenly the teacher asks a question ...; for example, when the teacher wants me to answer the question, answering that question incorrectly makes me feel anxious."*

"My biggest stress.... When I answer a question incorrectly, I get upset that the teacher will be mad at me."

Interviewee 4: *"Not being able to answer the question."*

Interviewee 7: *"... for example, the teacher asks a question in English. When I cannot answer that question, I feel anxious."*

The responses of the anxious students show that students have worries in the classroom when they cannot answer the questions during the class, and this might be regarded as an anxiety-provoking factor for language learners. Also, in order to support this finding, Interviewee 4 stated that being asked the question which he could answer makes him feel comfortable in the classroom.

Moreover, the students stated that they feel anxious when the teacher asks a question suddenly during the lesson (f=6). Some of the answers related with this theme:

Interviewee 3: *"Well, suddenly the teacher asks a question. For example, when the teacher wants me to answer the question, answering that question incorrectly makes me feel anxious."*

Interviewee 6: *"When the teacher asks a question, when the teacher says 'Sinan, answer this question.'"*

Interviewee 3: *"During the lesson; for example, suddenly the teacher asks questions from the subjects I don't study."*

As the anxious students uttered, having a low grade (f=4) makes them feel worried and anxious. The students stated that they feel worried especially during exam time because of the fear of having low grades. When they were asked what their biggest worry in the classroom was, the answers were:

Interviewee 2: *"To have a low grade from the exam."*

Interviewee 4: *"To fail the class."*

Interviewee 3: *"I feel worried during the exam... I feel anxious due to having low grade."*

Interviewee 5: *"I feel worried when I fail the class and have a low grade."*

On the other hand, teacher (f=4) can be one of the sources that make the students feel anxious. The fact that the teacher enters the classroom makes the students have negative feelings in the class. Furthermore, the students are afraid of the teacher getting angry in the classroom even if the teacher does not behave angrily. Also, having a new teacher and having less information about the teacher (not knowing the teacher well) might be an anxiety source for young learners. In addition, teacher's reactions make the students have the feeling of apprehension in the classroom. Some of the answers related with the teacher:

Interviewee 4: *"I feel stressed when the teacher comes into the classroom."*

Interviewee 3: *"I am afraid that the teacher will be angry with me in the class when I cannot answer the question."*

Interviewee 2: *"I feel better with the male teacher in the classroom... I feel shy with the female teacher... Because I know the male teacher better than the female teacher. The female teacher came to the school in this year."*

In addition, difficult subjects (f=2), writing long articles (f=2), some activities (f=2) are some of the FLA sources uttered by the anxious students. Some students remarked that some subjects can be difficult and they cannot understand these subjects, which causes negative feelings for the students. Some of the answers related with difficult subjects:

Interviewee 1: *"I do not like question frames in the units because they are difficult."*

Interviewee 7: *"I do not like answering the questions in the reading parts. These questions become difficult and I cannot answer them."*

Also, some activities such as translation into Turkish, speaking activities, and making sentences in English creates a negative atmosphere for the students and they feel anxious in the classroom during these activities. When the students were asked which situations caused you anxiety and stress in the lesson, they replied:

Interviewee 1: *"... during the making sentences activities and the speaking activities."*

Interviewee 2: *"I do not like the activities which we translate the text into Turkish."*

The students also stated that they feel relaxed and comfortable with different and enjoyable activities, competitions, games, and group activities in the classroom. Thus, whereas some

of the activities cause anxiety for the students, some of them create a relaxed environment while learning a foreign language.

Besides all these, writing long articles in the classroom, also, is not preferred by the students and they are afraid of not being able to finish writing during the class time. In other words, they do not prefer writing the things on the board during the break time; thus, they try to finish writing before break-time, which causes anxiety for the students. Some of the answers related with writing long articles:

Interviewee 5: *“I do not like writing long articles because I feel I will not have enough time to write all the written things on the board.”*

Interviewee 6: *“I do not like writing the things on the board.”*



CHAPTER V

RESULTS, DISCUSSION, AND SUGGESTIONS

This chapter includes the discussion of the level of FLA among young learners and FLCAS's results in terms of gender, age, academic achievement, economic situation, parents' education level, parental English learning expectation, and students' learning experience in order to investigate the FLA among young learners. In addition, the results of the semi-structured interview conducted with the anxious student defined according to the result of the FLCAS are discussed to clarify the sources of the FLA among young learners. Then this chapter concludes all the results of the study; finally, it presents the suggestions for further studies and provides pedagogical implications.

5.1. Results and discussion

5.1.1. The discussion of the quantitative data

In this part, the researcher discusses the results of the FLCAS applied to young learners who study 5th, 6th, and 7th grade in order to investigate what level of young learners' foreign language anxiety is and what extent student' FLA differs in terms of gender, age, academic achievement, economic situation, parents' education level, parental English learning expectation, and students' learning experience.

5.1.1.1. What is the level of young learners' foreign language anxiety?

In order to find out the anxiety level of the young learners' while learning a foreign language, the questionnaire of the FLCAS was applied and the results of the FLCAS indicated that young learners experienced a moderate level of FLA in the classroom. Several studies have been carried out to find out the level of students' anxiety and some of them found data supporting this result. For example, Liu and Chen (2013) indicated that fifth and sixth graders had a fair amount of language anxiety parallel with the research of Abu-Rabia (2004) who studied with seventh graders. Similarly, Wong (2009) reported that most of the students studying at secondary school experienced a moderate level of anxiety and the result of the Alshahrani and Alandal (2015)'s study whose participants were elementary school students was in parallel with the result of the current study. On the other hand, Chan and Wu (2004) found a high level of anxiety in students at primary school in Taiwan. Hence, according to these mentioned studies and the current study, it can be

pointed out that young learners might have a moderate level of anxiety while they are learning a foreign language.

The most anxiety-provoking sub-dimension of the FLCAS for young learners was fear of negative evaluation in this current study. This finding is in line with Aida (1994), in which fear of negative evaluation had an impact on students learning Japanese Aida (1994). Moreover, fear of negative evaluation is evaluated as a main source of anxiety for learners in their language class according to teachers (Alrabai, 2015). Likewise, Aydin (2008) stated one of the strong sources of language anxiety was the fear of negative evaluation consisting of negative judgments by others and leaving unfavorable impressions on others. Hence, it might be understood that young learners mostly feel worried when they are evaluated by teachers or their peers in the classroom. Negative evaluations by others, leaving unfavorable impressions on others, making verbal or spelling mistakes, and disapproval by others who are teachers and friends might be some of the reasons for this feeling.

Even though communication apprehension is not considered as a significant factor or a primary source of language anxiety for the Saudi EFL learners in the process of language learning (Alrabai, 2015), this study indicated that young learners experienced a moderate level of communication apprehension among young learners. It is also supported by Alshahrani and Alandal (2015) that communication apprehension plays a role in students' FLA. Communication is a necessary component during the foreign language learning process and while young learners communicate in foreign languages, they feel worried to speak in a different language. There is a moderate communication apprehension among young learners in these situations: The teacher calls them to speak; the teacher gives a say to them in the classroom; young learners speak in front of their peers; young learners speak without any preparations.

On the other hand, there have been studies which indicated that test anxiety was one of the main constructs of students' anxiety in primary school (Alshahrani & Alandal, 2015; Chan & Wu, 2004). However, as Aydin (2013) stated that there was a low level of test anxiety among children and young adolescents, it was indicated in this study that the students studying at secondary schools experienced a low level of test anxiety in the classroom. This finding was supported by Aida (1994) by indicating that test anxiety was not a factor contributing to students' foreign language anxiety. Considering that test anxiety is related

to fear of failing tests, young learners feel a low level of worry when they have a test according to the results of the current study.

All in all, findings of the study indicated that young learners experienced a moderate level of anxiety while learning a foreign language. In terms of sub-factors of the FLCAS, young learners had a moderate level of communication apprehension, a low level of test anxiety, and they were highly anxious due to the fear of negative evaluation in the classroom. This study indicated that young learners mostly suffered from the fear of negative evaluation.

5.1.1.2. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of gender?

This study focused on the young learners' FLA by regarding gender and questioned to what extent young learners' FLA differs in terms of gender. 43% of the participants were male young learners while 57% of the participants were the female young learners. It was presented that there was not a significant difference between female and male young learners' on their total scores FLA. The result of the study showed that gender was not a determinant factor on young learners' FLA. However, when the sub-dimensions of the FLCAS were examined, it was found that young learners' FLA showed a significant difference in fear of negative evaluation and test anxiety. According to the mean ranks of the FLCAS's sub-dimensions, female students had a higher fear of negative evaluation than male students while male students had a higher test anxiety than female students. On the other hand, students' FLA did not show a significant difference in the sub-dimension of communication apprehension.

Several studies have focused on the gender factor in foreign language anxiety so far and as Dörnyei (2005) supported, gender is a significant factor to explain the anxiety levels of the students during the language learning process. Even though learners' anxiety level did not show a significant difference in terms of gender in some studies (Aida, 1994; Alshahrani & Alandal, 2015; Loo & Kitjaroonchai, 2015; Piechurska-Kuciel, 2012), there have been other studies presenting the gender effect on learners' anxiety while learning a foreign language (Abu-Rabia, 2004; Na, 2007; Dewaele et al., 2018).

According to study of Aida (1994), there was no significant gender difference in the learners' FLA. Also, the study of Alshahrani and Alandal (2015) aimed to investigate the impact of gender differences among elementary school students studying at 6th Grade and they found that there was no difference in the level of FLA between male and female

students. Moreover, Loo and Kitjaroonchai (2015) carried out a study with both high school and university students in Thailand and they stated that there was no relation between gender and foreign language anxiety. There was another study carried out with secondary school students in Poland by Piechurska-Kuciel (2012), and they reported that male and female learners showed the same level of FLA.

On the other hand, some researchers reported that female learners' FLA was higher than males or vice versa. Dewaele et al. (2016) reported that female participants had significantly more FLCA than males about their mistakes and lacked confidence in using the foreign language. Furthermore, Dewaele et al. (2018) approved of the gender effect that female learners studying high school experienced more FLCA and foreign language enjoyment than their male classmates by interpreting that female learners were more emotionally involved in the FL learning. According to Gerencheal and Horwitz (2016)'s study with university students, females' FLA was higher than males' FLA. Similarly, Ezzi (2012) found the same result that female students felt more worried. Also, Aydın et al. (2017a) investigated gender effect on FLA among children; they found that female students felt more worried because of the fear of failure, teachers' corrections, and negative evaluations and unpreparedness. Also, they reported that female students had a higher level of anxiety than males during the communication. While all these mentioned studies found that females are more worried than males, Hasan and Fatimah (2014) reported that male learners were more significantly anxious than females in all sub-dimensions of FLCAS. Also, Ekström (2013) explained that male students felt more anxious for listening and writing in English while female students experienced more anxiety for speaking and writing in English. Marwain (2007) stated that male students felt more afraid of failing their English class than females did. In the study of Aydın et al. (2017a), male students felt less confident when volunteering in speaking. From a different point of view of MacIntyre et al. (2002), male learners' anxiety stays at a similar level through different grades; on the other hand, female learners feel less worried and become more eager through different grades as they have more experiences in the classroom.

When all studies are regarded, gender might be a significant factor or not according to the target group. It is stated in this study that gender is not a significant factor for young learners' foreign language anxiety from a general perspective; however, it is a determinant factor for test anxiety and the fear of negative evaluation. Hence, it means that female

students feel more worried than male students when they forget what they want to say, when they make mistakes in the classroom, when they speak without any preparation, and when they do not understand their error corrections. Also, they suffer more than male students since their peers will laugh at them while they are speaking in the foreign language. Considering the male students, they experience more fear of failure than female students and they feel more anxiety when they have tests or quizzes in the classroom. It can be concluded that male young learners' have a higher test anxiety than females whereas female young learners feel more anxious in the fear of negative evaluation.

5.1.1.3. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of age?

In order to answer to what extent students' FLA differs in terms of age, the findings from FLCAS present that there was not a significant difference in students' difference in students' anxiety levels according to their FLA total scores FLA. Moreover, when the sub-dimensions of the FLCAS were examined, students' anxiety levels in the fear of negative evaluation and test anxiety did not differ significantly in regards to age. However, a significant difference in students' FLA was found in the communication sub-dimension of the FLCAS. The results indicated that 12 years old students had a higher foreign language anxiety in communication apprehension compared to 11 years old students, and this difference was significantly meaningful.

There have been several studies in order to investigate whether age is a determinant factor on students' FLA level. Aydin (2013) investigated factors affecting the level of test anxiety among EFL learners at elementary schools and found that younger students had the feeling of more confidence and calm when they were informed about the test compared to the older students. Furthermore, he reported that older students felt more worried before the exams and more depressed after the exams than younger students; thus, Aydin (2013) concluded that the older the students were, the more negative feelings they had and he stated that students with lower-grade are less anxious about pop exams and are affected less negatively in terms of their performance than students with higher-grade. Similarly, Dewaele (2002) reached the same result that older learners had a higher level of FLA than younger learners due to finding accommodating the rules of a foreign language difficult. There was another study carried out by Onwuegbuzie et al. (1999 as cited in Aydin et al., 2017a), and they had the same result that elder learners had more anxiety compared to younger learners.

On the other hand, Dewaele (2007) pointed out that young learners might feel more anxious than adult learners since language is a new situation for them and it can be difficult for them to encounter with a new language. The results of Aydin et al. (2017a)'s study supports the Dewaele (2007)'s opinion and they found that younger learners' anxiety were higher than older students while having examinations, speaking activities, and teachers' corrections. Furthermore, Dewaele and MacIntyre (2014) reported that older learners had significantly lower levels of FLCA because there was a bump in younger learners' anxiety level and it dropped off in older ages' anxiety levels. Aydin (2008) also investigated the language anxiety and fear of negative evaluation among Turkish EFL learners and he stated that younger learners showed a higher fear towards leaving a negative impression, disapproval by their peers, and making mistakes than older students did. In addition, Ay (2010) indicated in her study that young adolescent students suffer from anxiety while learning a foreign language.

By concluding all these studies, age might be a determinant factor for learners' anxiety level. Some studies indicate that younger learners have a higher level of FLA than elder ones whereas other studies report a contrary result. However, in this study, it is clearly stated that age is not a significant factor for young learners' FLA according to total scores of the FLCAS; thus, FLA of the students aged 9 to 12 do not differ in terms of age. On the other hand, the anxiety level of the students aged 12 is higher than the students aged 11 in regards to communication apprehension sub-dimension of FLCAS. This result might be concluded that students aged 12 are at the age of puberty, which might cause more apprehension for the students; therefore, the students at this age might have more communication apprehension since they use the foreign language in front of their peers in the classroom.

5.1.1.4. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' academic achievement?

The findings of the current study indicated that academic achievement was an important factor for young learners' foreign language anxiety. According to the results of the study, FLA of the students with academic achievement between 100-85 scores was lower in the total scores of foreign language learning anxiety compared to students with academic success between 84-70, 69-60, 59-50 and 49-0; thus, students with a high academic achievement had a lower degree of FLA. When the sub-factors of the FLCAS were

examined in terms of academic achievement, young learners' FLA in communication apprehension and test anxiety showed a significant difference; however, young learners' anxiety level did not differ significantly in fear of negative evaluation sub-factor of the FLCAS. To be more specific, students with a high academic achievement had a lower level of FLA in communication apprehension and students with a low academic achievement felt more worried in test anxiety than students with a high level of achievement. These findings clearly explain that the higher academic achievement young learners have, the lower FLA they have.

As Horwitz (2001) declared, a number of studies have been carried out, which have reported that there is a negative relationship between language anxiety and achievement. For instance, the first study using FLCAS (Horwitz, 1986) found significantly a moderate negative relationship between language anxiety and achievement, in which less anxious students' grades were higher than anxious students. MacIntyre and Gardner (1989) also shared the similar results by stating a significant negative correlation anxiety and achievement; moreover, Saito and Samimy (1996, as cited in Horwitz, 2001) reached the similar result by studying with Japanese learners.

Similarly, Loo and Kitjaroonchai (2015) carried out a study with both university and high school students in Thailand and they concluded that there is a negative correlation between students' academic achievement and their FLA by stating that students with better academic achievements show a low level of anxiety. In addition, Abu-Rabia (2004) indicated that FL achievement had a negative and significant correlation with anxiety. Koçkar, Kılıç and Şener (2002) found that students had lower academic achievements because of higher test anxiety among elementary school students. In another study, Aydın (2013) reported test anxiety as a facilitating effect for learners' achievements. He also pointed out that students having a high level of achievement were more aware of what makes them feel anxious or which situations cause them to feel worried; thus, they do not have the feeling of more anxiety and their performance in the classroom is better than students having lower academic achievements. In addition, Azher et al. (2010)'s study with undergraduates in Pakistan replicated the findings by stating that as academic achievement increases, level of anxiety decreases.

When all these studies are regarded by taking into consideration that all these mentioned studies were carried out with different target groups such as university, high school, and

secondary school students, academic achievement has a significant effect on the students' FLA in every part of education. This current study has also indicated the relation between language anxiety and academic achievement is negative for young learners.

5.1.1.5. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' economic situation?

According to the results, students' FLA in terms of the economic level did not differ in communication apprehension, fear of negative evaluation, and test anxiety as sub-factors of the FLCAS. Moreover, the total score of the scale did not differ significantly. In other words, findings of the study demonstrated that FLA of the students did not show any statistically significant difference in terms of students' economic situation in this current study. Similarly, Aydin (2013) aimed to answer the question whether there was a significant correlation between test anxiety of the students at elementary schools and their economic background and concluded that there was not significantly an relationship between students' economic background and their test anxiety level. Beside the current study and Aydin (2013), Khattak et al. (2011) also aimed to know more about the factors affecting FLA in Pakistan and they stated that students' socio-economic situations might have an effect on their efforts in the process of language learning since limited exposure to the target language because of poor conditions may make the students feel anxious. Hence, they found that students developed an attitude to use the target language among them. Khan (2015) also reported the factors that make students feel worried in foreign language class by interviewing with the teachers, and the teachers mentioned in the study that socio-economic situations of the students affect students anxiety in the classroom. Economically supported students might have more opportunities to reach rich sources and more supportive materials for their language education; thus, students with lower economic situations might feel more worried and it can be concluded from these studies that socio-economic situations might be an anxiety source for the students.

Students' economic situation might positively affect in regards to provided materials and supportive resources for the learners while learning a foreign language; thus, these positive conditions might have an effect on students' FLA; however, in this current study there is not any statistically relation between economic situation and anxiety level of the students.

5.1.1.6. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of parents' education level of the students?

In order to investigate the effect of the parents' education level of the students on their FLA, mother education level and father education level were examined separately. According to the results, while mother education level did not make any difference in students' FLA, father education level had the effect on students' test anxiety level. When the anxiety effect of fathers' education level was examined, it was clear that most of the fathers' education level was high school or secondary school. When the results were considered, students' FLA did not differ significantly both in general score and in terms of communication apprehension and fear of negative evaluation. On the other hand, students' FLA showed a significant difference in test anxiety sub-factor of FLCAS according to father education level and it was found that the students' FLA in test anxiety was higher when their father's education level was university.

Azher et al. (2010) also addressed the undergraduate students' anxiety level in terms of parents' education level in Pakistan and the results showed that students whose parents were more educated were more worried than students whose parents were illiterate or less educated because educated families put more pressure on their children's shoulders while learning a foreign language.

5.1.1.7. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' parental expectation?

According to English learning expectations of the parents from their students, students' FLA scores differed significantly in terms of communication apprehension, fear of negative evaluation, and test anxiety as sub-factors of the FLCAS as well as in terms of total score. In other words, parents' English learning expectations from their own students created a significant effect on students' FLA. This significant difference indicated different results for each sub-factor of the FLCAS according to the parents' expectation. For instance, a medium and low level of English learning expectation created a higher level of FLA over the students in communication apprehension compared to the high-level of expectation. Also, the medium level of learning expectation causes a higher anxiety than the high-level of expectation for the students in the fear of negative evaluation. On the other hand, in terms of test anxiety sub- factor of the FLCAS, the students whose parents had a high-level of English learning expectations had higher levels of foreign language

learning anxiety. When all the results are analyzed, all in all, this current study presents that FLA of the students whose parents have a high-level of English learning expectation is higher in the total scores of foreign language learning anxiety, and the difference is meaningfully significant compared to the students whose parents have a medium and low level of English learning expectation.

As Chan and Wu (2004) investigated the sources of FLA among elementary school students in Taipei Country, they stated according to the conducted questionnaire that students feel pressure on their shoulders due to their parents' expectations and they listed parental expectation as a source for students' anxiety level. Khan (2015)'s study also supports this result from the interviews carried out with the students that parental expectation causes the FLA among the students; for example, they might be only or older kids, and they have to earn money for their families; thus, they feel more pressure in foreign language classes.

Parents' expectation from their children might play a crucial role in their children's achievement as Davis-Kean (2005) stated; thus, it might be unavoidable that this expectation may cause the anxiety among learners in the process of language learning by regarding the current study. It can be concluded from the current study that the more expectation parents have from their students, the more anxiety the students have in the language classes.

5.1.1.8. To what extent does students' FLA differ in terms of students' learning experience?

In this current study, students' learning experiences varied from 1 to 6 years; however, most of the students had 3 or 4 years English learning experience. According to the results, students who had been learning English as a foreign language for 4 years had a higher-level of FLA in test anxiety and in communication apprehension whereas there was no significant difference in the fear of negative evaluation in terms of learning experience. In the total score of the study, it was clear that students who had been learning English as a foreign language for 4 years had a higher-level of FLA; thus, as students' experiences increased in foreign language learning process, their anxiety also increased in the classroom.

Similarly, Marco-Llinas and Garau (2009) indicated the similar result from their research about the effect of the proficiency level in FLA among college students learning Spanish as a foreign language that advanced students had a higher level of FLA, which supports that when students have more learning experiences, they feel more worried in the classroom.

On the other hand, taking extra courses decreases the anxiety level of the students in EFL elementary school students in Taipei Country (Chan & Wu, 2004) and according to the interviews with the teachers in the study, there is a difference in anxiety level among students since students have different experiences of learning English out of the school. Also, Zambak (2016) found that students who study English out of the school had lower anxiety than students who do not study English; thus, studying English is a determinant factor to FLCAS. Marwan (2007) supported these findings by stating that lower intermediate students might feel more anxious in the language class since they felt less self-confident in the classroom than upper intermediate students. The feeling of lack of confidence is experienced because of the limitation in foreign language learning, which causes anxiety for the lower intermediate learners. In addition, Dewaele and MacIntyre (2014) reported the same result that when students' experiences increased in the process of language learning, they felt less foreign language classroom anxiety and Dewaele et al. (2017) also supported this finding with the result of their study.

There is a different result found by Ay (2010) that language anxiety differs among young adolescent Turkish students in regard to receptive skills (reading and writing) and productive skills (speaking and writing) according to their language experience. She stated that beginner students feel more anxious in receptive skills and advanced students have the feeling of anxiety in productive skills.

All in all, several findings have been stated in different studies about the relation between anxiety and learning experience. Most of the studies mentioned above report that there is a higher level of anxiety among students who are less experienced in the language learning process; however, the current study points out that when the students have more experiences with the foreign language, they feel more worried in the classroom.

5.1.2. The discussion of the qualitative data

5.1.2.1. What are the sources of young learners' FLA?

According to the anxious students' interview results, findings of the study show that the sources of their anxiety was defined as suddenly being asked questions by the teacher, not being able to answer the questions, having low marks, teacher, difficult subjects, writing long articles, and activities.

Concerning the students' answers, most of the students stated that they feel anxious when they are not able to answer the questions. When they were asked which situations cause anxiety for you in the classroom, they express that "... not to able to answer when the teacher asks a question", "...not to able to answer", "...to answer wrong to the question", and "...when the teacher asks about the topic which I do not know". This issue is related with the fear of negative evaluation and students feel worried when they make mistakes because of fear of negative evaluation; thus, this situation makes them feel worried when they are not able to answer the questions (Aydın, 2008; Azher et al.; 2010). This finding is also supported by Chan and Wu (2004) that one of the sources of language anxiety among students studying in elementary school is presented as the fear of negative evaluation in their study. According to the study of Azher et al. (2010), it is also highlighted from the results of the interview that students experience fear of negative evaluation.

In relation to not being able to answer the questions; when the teacher also asks suddenly a question to the students, it causes to them feel worried in the classroom and they express that "I feel anxious when the teacher ask suddenly question" since they are caught off guard; thus, they are afraid of answering wrong the question. Liu and Chen (2013) shared the same result with their study by stating that one of the top worries of the students from elementary school is not being prepared in advance when the teacher asks questions. Also, Aydın (2008) supports this point by stating that not being prepared for the lesson causes anxiety for the students; thus, it might be understood that students feel more secure when they are prepared the lesson and when they are not caught off guard in the classroom. When students are suddenly asked to answer a question, they have to speak without preparation and they will be forced to talk spontaneously; hence, this situation creates the feeling of apprehension for the students as it is clarified by Azher et al. (2010) that being unable to talk spontaneously causes anxiety in the classroom.

On the other hand, having low marks from their exams causes anxiety for the students and they do not like having a pop-quiz in the classroom. This finding is also supported by Mak (2011) that fear of failing the class was identified as an anxiety factor for university students in Hong Kong. Also, Liu and Chen (2013) support this finding with their study by pointing out that students feel worried most about failing the courses. Similarly, Aydın (2008) clarifies fear of failing classes as one of the anxiety-provoking factors.

In addition, teachers are the sources of anxiety for the students in the classroom according to the current study even though Dewaele et al. (2017) stated that teachers had a little effect on FLCA. The students feel worried since the teacher might be angry with them in the classroom, they do not know the teacher very well, and the teacher comes into the class. Similarly, Toth (2011) studies on the sources of FLA among the students in their first year of study from one Hungarian university and states that constantly monitored and tested by the teacher makes students anxious in the classroom. Likewise, Subaşı (2010) points out in her study with university students that students report a teacher's manner as an anxiety-provoking factor. Moreover, when Aydın (2008) investigates the language anxiety among EFL learners, he clarifies the teachers as a source of anxiety in the classroom since the questions of teachers and their corrections might trigger apprehension in the classroom. On the other hand, fear of negative evaluation which might be caused by the teacher is regarded one of the reasons of FLA among young learners (Horwitz et al., 1986), and teachers might have a significant effect on students' FLA in the classroom.

Also, difficult school subjects are one of the reasons for the students' anxiety. Students feel relaxed when they ask the questions about the topics which they know because they might answer correct the questions. Since making mistakes is regarded as an anxiety-provoking factor for the learners (Aydın, 2008), they might answer wrong the questions related to difficult subjects; hence, difficult school subject causes anxiety for the learners. When they have problems with the subjects in the classroom, they feel not relaxed.

Finally, writing long articles and classroom activities make the students have a feeling of apprehension in the classroom. They do not like writing long articles when they especially write the articles from the board during their break time. Besides, classroom activities play a big role for the students' FLA. The activities of speaking, making sentences, and translation into Turkish, cause apprehension for the learners into the classroom. Likewise, Worde (2003) identifies the factors which may contribute to the anxiety and speaking

activities are reported as anxiety-provoking activities for the students. Instead of these activities, the students prefer having games, completions, online games, group activities, and song into the classroom; and they feel better and relaxed with these activities in the language class.

Considering all the results, several reasons might trigger FLA among young learners, and the results of FLCAS indicate that young learners suffer mostly from fear of negative evaluation, which is indicated with the interview results. It might be stated that fear of negative evaluation is a significant matter for young learners in the classroom during the language learning process. Also, FLA might be affected from different variables such as students' academic achievement, parents' education level, parental expectation, and learning experience while the interview results present the sources of FLA for young learners as not being able to answer the questions, suddenly being asked questions by the teacher, having low grade, teacher, difficult subjects, writing long articles, and activities.

To sum up, this study aimed to research the level of FLA from the perspective of young learners who study in secondary schools and the sources of FLA among young learners by applying Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS) and interviewing the anxious students. After the FLCAS was applied to the young learners, anxious students were defined to have interviews with them, and the results of the study were presented below.

Firstly, the results indicated that the young learner had a moderate level of FLA at the class. In terms of the sub-factors of the FLCAS, the anxiety level of the students differs and they had a moderate level of communication apprehension and a low level of test anxiety and they felt anxious due to the fear of negative evaluation. Considering the sub-factors of the FLCAS, the fear of negative evaluation caused more anxiety for the young learners in the classroom. Secondly, gender was not a determinant factor on young learners' FLA; however, it was a determinant factor for test anxiety and the fear of negative evaluation; thus, male young learners' have a higher test anxiety than females whereas female young learners feel more anxious in the fear of negative evaluation.

Also, while age was not a significant factor for young learners' FLA in the study, the anxiety level of the students aged 12 was higher than the students aged 11 in regards to communication apprehension sub-dimension of FLCAS. This result might be concluded

that students aged 12 are at the age of puberty, which might cause more apprehension for the students.

Moreover, there was a negative relationship between language anxiety and academic achievement; thus, as young learners' academic achievement increases, their anxiety level decreases in the classroom.

In terms of young learners' economic situation, their anxiety level did not differ and the economic situation did not have any effect on the anxiety level of the students.

Furthermore, young learners' FLA showed a significant difference in test anxiety sub-factor of FLCAS according to father education level and the young learners' FLA in test anxiety was higher when their father's education level was university; thus, when the parents have a high level of education, their children might show a higher test anxiety while learning a foreign language.

Considering the parental expectation and students' learning experience, there was a positive relationship for the young learners. For example, young learners showed a high level of when their parents had more expectations from their students and when the students have more experiences with the foreign language, they feel more worried in the classroom.

All in all, according to the interview results, anxious young learners stated that suddenly asked questions by the teacher, not being able to answer the questions, having low marks, teachers, difficult subjects, writing long articles, and some classroom activities cause FLA among the young learners.

Furthermore, considering these presented results of the study, several pedagogical implications are presented to language teachers; for example, FLA is an important issue in the classroom in order to create an effective and relaxing atmosphere for the students; hence, teachers should be made aware of the FLA in the classroom during the in-service training. Also, as it was indicated the study, communication apprehension, fear of negative evaluation, test anxiety, gender, age, academic achievement, economic situation, parents' education level, parental expectation, and learning experience might have effects on the FLA of the young learners; thus, teachers and teacher candidates should be informed about these effects.

Moreover, teachers should be aware of the fact that their students might feel highly nervous and worried in the classroom and they should observe their students how they

behave when the students feel anxious. This observation will give clues for the teachers to use anxiety-releasing activities. Also, teachers should learn more information about their students' educational background and they should have a talk with the students' parents about their expectations, economic situation, and education level in order to learn more information about the students; thus, this might help to take better precautions for anxiety. In addition, teachers should be aware that students feel worried when they are asked questions suddenly, and teachers should avoid asking immediate questions and provide more time for their students' preparations. In addition, when the students have low marks from their exam, the teachers should give encouragement to the students and try to make them feel successful since there is a negative relation between achievement and anxiety among students. Furthermore, teachers should know that the teacher himself/herself might be a source of anxiety for the students. If teachers are aware of this situation, they can present a more positive attitude to the students when the students show a high level of anxiety. Finally, the activities in the classroom play a big role for the students. It will be useful to use the activities such as competitions, group working activities, online games, and games during the foreign language process and students feel more enjoyment rather than anxiety with these activities.

5.2. Suggestions

5.2.1. Suggestions based on the study

This study represented the FLA level of young learners and anxiety sources for the young learners by collecting data with the questionnaire of FLCAS and semi-structured interviews.

Based on the results of the study and considering the literature reviewed, it is reasonable to suggest that the number of the participants may be increased in future studies in order to generalize the results more. Also, data collection instruments may be varied in order to have a deep understanding of FLA among young learners by including students diaries, observation check-list etc. as data collection instruments. Furthermore, the same study might be carried out with students who learn foreign languages in different countries to reach more generalizable data. In addition, the students might be interviewed with more in-depth questions to have a more comprehensive and detailed information.

5.2.2. Suggestions for future research studies

As for further recommendations for further studies, classroom observations and diaries might be used to collect the data deeply for a better understanding of the FLA among the young learners. The researcher had interviews with the anxious young learners in this study. It might be better to have interviews with teachers and analyze the sources of FLA and the FLA among young learners from the perspective of teachers. Also, the effect of students' parents might be inevitable on their children; thus, it may be interviewed with the parents of the students who feel anxious in the classroom in order to realize the sources related to out of school. Moreover, students might be observed a whole year during their education and their behavior change may give us more understandable and clearer data. Finally, this study presents the sources of FLA among young learners; hence, by regarding these sources, it might be useful to investigate how to decrease the anxiety among young learners.

REFERENCES

- Abu- Rabia, S. (2004). Teachers' role, learners' gender differences, and FL anxiety among seventh- grade students studying English as a FL. *Educational Psychology*, 24(5), 711-721.
- Aida, Y. (1994). Examination of Horwitz, Horwitz, and Cope's construct of foreign language anxiety: The case of students of Japanese. *The Modern Language Journal*, 78(2), 155-168.
- Alrabai, F. (2015). The influence of teachers' anxiety-reducing strategies on learners' foreign language anxiety. *Innovation in Language Learning and Teaching*, 9(2), 163-190.
- Alshahrani, M., & Alandal, A. (2015). An investigation of anxiety among elementary school students towards foreign language learning. *Studies in Literature and Language*, 11(1), 29-40.
- Andrade, M. & Williams, K. (2009). Foreign language learning anxiety in Japanese EFL University Classes: Physical, emotional, expressive, and verbal reactions. *Sophia Junior College Faculty Journal*, 29(1), 2009, 1-24.
- Aragão, R. (2011). Beliefs and emotions in foreign language learning. *System*, 39(3), 302-313.
- Ay, S. (2010). Young adolescent students' foreign language anxiety in relation to language skills at different levels. *Journal of International Social Research*, 3(11).
- Aydin, B. (1999). *A study of sources of foreign language classroom anxiety in speaking and writing classes* (Doctoral Thesis). Accessed from YOK Thesis Center database (Thesis Number: 92084).
- Aydin, S. (2008). An investigation on the language anxiety and fear of negative evaluation among Turkish EFL learners. *Asian EFL Journal*, 2008, 421-444.
- Aydin, S. (2013). Factors affecting the level of test anxiety among EFL learners at elementary schools. *E-International Journal of Educational Research*, 4(1), 63-81.
- Aydin, S., Yavuz, F., & Yeşilyurt, S. (2006). Test anxiety in foreign language learning. *Balikesir University Journal of Social Sciences Institute*, 9, 145-160.

- Aydin, S., Harputlu, L., Çelik, S. S., Uştuk, O., & Güzel, S. (2017a). Age, gender and grade effect on foreign language anxiety among children. *TEFLIN Journal*, 28(2), 133-154.
- Aydin, S., Harputlu, L., Ustuk, O., Guzel, S., & Celik, S. S. (2017b). The children's foreign language anxiety scale: Reliability and validity. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies*, 13(2), 43.
- Azher, M., Anwar, M. N., & Naz, A. (2010). An investigation of foreign language classroom anxiety and its relationship with student's achievement. *Journal of College Teaching & Learning (TLC)*, 7(11).
- Bailey, P., Daley, C., & Onwuegbuzie, A. J. (1999). Foreign language anxiety and learning style. *Foreign Language Annals*, 32(1), 63-76.
- Balemir, S. H. (2009). *The sources of foreign language speaking anxiety and the relationship between proficiency level and degree of foreign language speaking anxiety* (MA Thesis). Accessed from YOK Thesis Center database (Thesis Number: 240581).
- Barlow, D. H. (2004). *Anxiety and its disorders: The nature and treatment of anxiety and panic*. New York: Guilford press.
- Batumlu, D. Z., & Erden, M. (2007). The relationship between foreign language anxiety and English achievement of Yıldız Technical University School of foreign languages preparatory students. *Journal of Theory and Practice in Education*, 3(1), 24-38.
- Bekleyen, N. (2009). Helping teachers become better English students: causes, effects, and coping strategies for foreign language listening anxiety. *System*, 37, 664-675.
- Bekleyen, N. (2004). The influence of teachers and peers on foreign language classroom anxiety. *Language Journal*, 123, 49-660.
- Brantmeier, C. (2005). Anxiety about L2 reading or L2 reading tasks? A study with advanced language learners. *Reading*, 5(2), 67-85.
- Brown, H. D. (1994). *Teaching by principles: An interactive approach to language pedagogy*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall Regents.

- Brown, H. D. (2000). *Principles of language learning and teaching* (Vol. 4). New York: Longman.
- Cameron, L. (2003). Challenges for ELT from the expansion in teaching children. *ELT Journal*, 57(2), 105-112.
- Campbell, C. M., & Ortiz, J. (1991). Helping students overcome foreign language anxiety: A foreign language anxiety workshop. *Language Anxiety: From Theory and Research to Classroom Implications*, 153-168.
- Chan, D. Y. C., & Wu, G. C. (2004). A study of foreign language anxiety of EFL elementary school students in Taipei County. *Journal of National Taipei Teachers College*, 17(2), 287-320.
- Chastain, K. (1975). Affective and ability factors in second- language acquisition. *Language Learning*, 25(1), 153-161.
- Cheng, Y. S. (2002). Factors associated with foreign language writing anxiety. *Foreign Language Annals*, 35(6), 647-656.
- Cheng, Y. S., Horwitz, E. K., & Schallert, D. L. (1999). Language anxiety: Differentiating writing and speaking components. *Language Learning*, 49(3), 417-446.
- Cicek, L. (2015). *Language learning anxiety-causes and consequences* (Doctoral thesis, University of Zagreb). Access address: <http://darhiv.ffzg.unizg.hr/id/eprint/5900/>
- Craske, M. G., Rauch, S. L., Ursano, R., Prenoveau, J., Pine, D. S., & Zinbarg, R. E. (2011). What is an anxiety disorder?. *Focus*, 9(3), 369-388.
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research design: qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Curran, C. A. (1976). *Counseling-learning in second languages*. Apple River, IL: Apple River Press.
- Çağatay, S. (2015). Examining EFL students' foreign language speaking anxiety: The case at a Turkish state university. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 199(2015), 648-656.

- Çermik, E. (2015). *The role of foreign language anxiety in English lessons of 8th grade students* (Master's Thesis). Accessed from YOK Thesis Center database (Thesis Number: 391617).
- Dalkılıç, N. (2001). *An investigation into the role of anxiety in second language learning* (Unpublished Ph.D. thesis). Cukurova University, Adana.
- Denies, K. (2015). *Individual differences in second language learning: Educational studies on self-efficacy, gender, motivation and willingness to communicate* (Unpublished Ph.D. thesis, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven). Access address: <https://lirias.kuleuven.be/1664252?limo=0>
- Dewaele, J.-M. (2009). Why do some young learners drop foreign languages? A focus on learner-internal variables. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 16(6), 635–649.
- Dewaele, J. M., & MacIntyre, P. D. (2014). The two faces of Janus? Anxiety and enjoyment in the foreign language classroom. *Studies in Second Language Learning and Teaching*, 4(2).
- Dewaele, J. M., MacIntyre, P. D., Boudreau, C., & Dewaele, L. (2016). Do girls have all the fun? Anxiety and enjoyment in the foreign language classroom. *Theory and Practice of Second Language Acquisition*, 2(1), 41-63.
- Dewaele, J. M., Witney, J., Saito, K., & Dewaele, L. (2018). Foreign language enjoyment and anxiety: The effect of teacher and learner variables. *Language Teaching Research*, 22(6), 676-697.
- Dil, Y. (2009). EFL Learners communication obstacles. *Electronic Journal of Social Sciences*, 8(29), 84–100.
- Dörnyei, Z. (2005). *The psychology of the language learner individual differences in second language acquisition*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc., Publishers.
- Duxbury, J. G., & Tsai, L. L. (2010). The Effects of cooperative learning on foreign language anxiety: A comparative study of Taiwanese and American Universities. *Online Submission*, 3(1), 3-18.

- Elkhafaifi, H. (2005). Listening comprehension and anxiety in the Arabic language classroom. *The Modern Language Journal*, 89(2), 206-220.
- Ellis, R. (1994). *The study of second language acquisition*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Ergün, E. (2011). *An investigation into the relationship between emotional intelligence skills and foreign language anxiety of students at a private university* (MA Thesis). Accessed from YOK Thesis Center database (Thesis Number: 300724).
- Ezzi, N. A. A. (2012). The impact of gender on the foreign language anxiety of the Yemeni university students. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics & English Literature*, 1(2), 65-75.
- Fariadian, E., Azizifar, A., & Gowhary, H. (2014). Gender contribution in anxiety in speaking EFL among Iranian learners. *International Research Journal of Applied and Basic Sciences*, 8(11), 2095-2099.
- Gardner, R. C., Smythe, P. C., Clément, R., & Glikzman, L. (1976). Social and psychological factors in second language acquisition. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 32, 198 – 213.
- Gardner, R. C., & MacIntyre, P. D. (1993). On the measurement of affective variables in second language learning. *Language Learning*, 43(2), 157-194.
- Gerencheal, B., & Horwitz, E. (2016). Gender differences in foreign language anxiety at an Ethiopian university: Mizan-Tepi University third year English major students in focus. *African Journal of Education and Practice*, 1(1), 1-16.
- Greenberg, J. S. (2006). *Comprehensive stress management*. New York: Mc Graw.
- Gregersen, T., & Horwitz, E. K. (2002). Language learning and perfectionism: Anxious and non- anxious language learners' reactions to their own oral performance. *The Modern Language Journal*, 86(4), 562-570.
- Gursoy, E., & Arman, T. (2016). Analyzing foreign language test anxiety among high school students in an EFL context (Note 1). *Journal of Education and Learning*, 5(4), 190-200.

- Güzel, S. (2016). *The effect of second life as a virtual language learning environment on speaking anxiety* (MA Thesis). Accessed from YOK Thesis Center database (Thesis Number: 442869).
- Hashemi, M., & Abbasi, M. (2013). The role of the teacher in alleviating anxiety in language classes. *International Research Journal of Applied and Basic Sciences*, 4(3), 640-646.
- Hewitt, E., & Stephenson, J. (2012). Foreign language anxiety and oral exam performance: A replication of Phillips's MLJ study. *The Modern Language Journal*, 96(2), 170-189.
- Horwitz, E. (2001). Language anxiety and achievement. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 21(1), 112.
- Horwitz, E. K. (2012). *Becoming a language teacher: A practical guide to second language learning and teaching*. Pearson Higher Ed.
- Horwitz, E. K., Horwitz, M. B., & Cope, J. (1986). Foreign language classroom anxiety. *The Modern Language Journal*, 70(2), 125-132.
- Keramida, A., & Tsiplakides, I. (2009). Helping students overcome foreign language speaking anxiety in the English classroom: Theoretical issues and practical recommendations. *International Education Studies*, 2(4), 39-44.
- Khan, S. (2015). *Anxiety towards learning English: a study on secondary level students of bengali medium schools in Dhaka city* (Doctoral dissertation, BRAC University). Access address: <http://hdl.handle.net/10361/4897>
- Kitano, K. (2001). Anxiety in the college Japanese language classroom. *The Modern Language Journal*, 85(4), 549-566.
- Koch, A. S., & Terrell, T. D. (1991). Affective reactions of foreign language students to natural approach activities and teaching techniques. *Language Anxiety: From Theory and Research to Classroom Implications*, 109-126.
- Koçkar, İ. A., Kılıç, B. G., & Şener, Ş. (2002). Test anxiety among primary school students and academic achievement. *Çocuk ve Ergen Sağlığı Dergisi*, 9(2), 100-105.
- Krashen, S. (1982). *Principles and practice in second language acquisition*. California: Pergamon Press Inc.

- Levine, G. S. (2003). Student and instructor beliefs and attitudes about target language use, first language use, and anxiety: Report of a questionnaire study. *The Modern Language Journal*, 87(3), 343-364.
- Liu, M. (2006). Anxiety in Chinese EFL students at different proficiency levels. *System*, 34(3), 301-316.
- Liu, H. J., & Chen, T. H. (2013). Foreign language anxiety in young learners: How it relates to multiple intelligences, learner attitudes, and perceived competence. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 4(5), 932.
- Loo, D. B., & Kitjaroonchai, N. (2015). Gender, academic achievement and years of experience: Investigating potential reasons for foreign language anxiety among Thai high school students. *The New English Teacher*, 9(2), 73-92.
- Madsen, H. S. (1982). Determining the debilitating impact of test anxiety. *Language Learning*, 32(1), 133-143.
- MacIntyre, P. D. (1999). Language anxiety: A review of the research for language teachers. *Affect in foreign language and second language learning: A practical guide to creating a low-anxiety classroom atmosphere*, 24, 41.
- MacIntyre, P. D., & Gardner, R. C. (1989). Anxiety and second- language learning: Toward a theoretical clarification. *Language Learning*, 39(2), 251-275.
- MacIntyre, P. D., & Gardner, R. C. (1991). Methods and results in the study of anxiety and language learning: A review of the literature. *Language learning*, 41(1), 85-117.
- MacIntyre, P. D., & Gardner, R. C. (1994). The subtle effects of language anxiety on cognitive processing in the second language. *Language Learning*, 44(2), 283-305.
- MacIntyre, P., & Gregersen, T. (2012). Affect: The role of language anxiety and other emotions in language learning. In *Psychology for Language Learning* (pp. 103-118). Palgrave Macmillan, London.
- Madsen, H. S. & Murray, N. (1984). *Retrospective evaluation of testing in ESL content and skills courses*. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of TESOL, Huston.
- Mak, B. (2011). An exploration of speaking-in-class anxiety with Chinese ESL learners. *System*, 39(2), 202-214.

- Mandelson, L. R. (1973). Test performance on a verbal learning task as a function of anxiety-arousing testing instructions. *The Journal of Educational Research*, 67(1), 37-40.
- Marcos- Llinás, M., & Garau, M. J. (2009). Effects of language anxiety on three proficiency- level courses of Spanish as a foreign language. *Foreign Language Annals*, 42(1), 94-111.
- Marwan, A. (2016). Investigating students' foreign language anxiety. *Malaysian Journal of ELT Research*, 3(1), 19.
- Mesri, F. (2012). The relationship between gender and Iranian EFL learners' foreign language classroom anxiety (FLCA). *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 2(6), 147.
- Na, Z. (2007). A study of high school students' English learning anxiety. *The Asian EFL Journal*, 9(3), 22-34.
- Ohata, K. (2005). Potential sources of anxiety for Japanese learners of English: Preliminary case interviews with five Japanese college students in the US. *TESL-EJ*, 9(3), n3.
- Oxford, R. (1992). Who are our students? A synthesis of foreign and second language research on individual differences with implications for instructional practice. *TESL Canada Journal*, 30-49.
- Oxford, R. L. (1999). Anxiety and the language learner: New insights. *Affect in Language Learning*, 58, 67.
- Özkan, C. (2019). *The relationship between students' success and their level of foreign language anxiety and the primary sources of foreign language speaking anxiety* (MA Thesis). Accessed from YOK Thesis Center database (Thesis Number: 540943).
- Öztürk, G., & Gürbüz, N. (2014). Speaking anxiety among Turkish EFL learners: The case at a state university. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies*, 10(1), 1-17.
- Phillips, E. M. (1992). The effects of language anxiety on students' oral test performance and attitudes. *The Modern Language Journal*, 76(1), 14-26.

- Piechurska-Kuciel, E. (2012). Gender-dependent language anxiety in Polish communication apprehensives. *Studies in Second Language Learning and Teaching*, 2(2), 227-248.
- Putwain, D. W. (2007). Test anxiety in UK schoolchildren: prevalence and demographic patterns. *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, 77 (3), 579 – 593.
- Rabab'ah, G. (2005). Communication problems facing Arab learners of English. *Journal of Language and Learning*, 3(1), ISSN 1740-4983.
- Rasor, L. T. & Rasor, R. A. (1998). Test anxiety and study behavior of community college students in relation to ethnicity, gender, and age. Retrieved on September 15, 2010 from <http://www.eric.ed.gov/PDFS/ED415942.pdf>.
- Riasati, M. J. (2011). Language learning anxiety from EFL learners' perspective. *Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research*, 7(6), 907-914.
- Rotenberg, A. M. (2002). A classroom research project: the psychological effects of standardized testing on young English language learners at different language proficiency levels. Retrieved on September 15, 2010 from <http://www.eric.ed.gov/PDFS/ED472651.pdf>.
- Scovel, T. (1978). The effect of affect on foreign language learning: A review of the anxiety research. *Language Learning*, 28(1), 129-142.
- Scovel, T. (1991). The effect of affect on foreign language learning: A review of the anxiety research. In Horwitz, E.K. and Young, D. J. (eds.) *Language Anxiety: from Theory and Research to Classroom Implications*. (pp.15-24). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Seidlhofer, B. (2005). English as a lingua franca. *ELT Journal*, 59(4), 339-341.
- Selami A., Yavuz F. & Yeşilyurt S. (2009). Test anxiety in foreign language learning. *Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 146-160.
- Shohamy, E. (1982). Affective considerations in language teaching. *Modern Language Journal*, 66(1), 13 – 17.
- Sparks, R. L., Ganschow, L., & Javorsky, J. (2002). Déjà vu all over again: a response to Saito, Horwitz, and Garza. *The Modern Language Journal*, 84(2), 251-259.

- Spielberger, C. D. (1983). *State-trait anxiety inventory for adults*. Palo Alto, CA: Maid Garden
- Subaşı, G. (2010). What are the main sources of Turkish EFL students' anxiety in oral practice?. *Turkish Online Journal of Qualitative Inquiry*, 1(2), 29-49.
- Tashakkori, A., & Teddlie, C. (2003). The past and future of mixed methods research: From data triangulation to mixed model designs. *Handbook of Mixed Methods in Social and Behavioral Research*, 671-701.
- Thompson, A. S., & Khawaja, A. J. (2016). Foreign language anxiety in Turkey: The role of multilingualism. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 37(2), 115-130.
- Trang, T. T. T., Baldauf Jr, R. B., & Moni, K. (2013). Investigating the development of foreign language anxiety: An autobiographical approach. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 34(7), 709-726.
- Tsiplakides, I., & Keramida, A. (2009). Helping students overcome foreign language speaking anxiety in the English classroom: Theoretical issues and practical recommendations. *International Education Studies*, 2(4), 39-44.
- Unruh, S. & Lowe, P. A. (2010). The development and validation of a Spanish language version of the test anxiety inventory for children and adolescents. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Science*, 32(1), 164-183.
- Ur, P. (1996). *A course in language teaching*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Vogely, A. J. (1999). Addressing listening comprehension anxiety. In D. J. Young (Ed.), *Affect in foreign language and second language learning. A practical guide to creating a low-anxiety atmosphere*, 106-123. Boston: McGraw-Hill.
- Von Worde, R. (2003). Students' perspectives on foreign language anxiety. *Inquiry*, 8(1), n1.
- Wang, T. (2010). Speaking anxiety: More of a function of personality than language achievement. *Chinese Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 33(5), 95-109.
- Williams, K. E. & Andrade, M. R. (2008). Foreign language learning anxiety in Japanese EFL university classes: Causes, coping, and locus of control. *Electronic Journal of Foreign Language Teaching*, 5(2), 181–191.

- Wong, M. S. (2009). *Language anxiety and motivation to learn English: A glimpse into the form 4 classroom*. The UPALS International Conference on Languages, Malaysia.
- Yan, J.X., & Horwitz, E.K. (2008). Learners' perceptions of how anxiety interacts with personal and instructional factors to influence their achievement in English: A qualitative analysis of EFL learners in China. *Language Learning*, 58, 151–183.
- Young, D. (1986). The relationship between anxiety and foreign language oral proficiency ratings. *Foreign Language Annals*, 19, 439–445.
- Young, D. J. (1990). An investigation of students' perspectives on anxiety and speaking. *Foreign Language Annals*, 23(6), 539-553.
- Young, D. J. (1991). Creating a low- anxiety classroom environment: What does language anxiety research suggest?. *The Modern Language Journal*, 75(4), 426-437.
- Young, D. J. (1998). *Affect in foreign language and second language learning: A practical guide to creating a low-anxiety classroom atmosphere*. McGraw-Hill Humanities/Social Sciences/Languages, the USA.
- Young, D. (2000). An investigation into the relationship between L2 reading anxiety and L2 reading comprehension, and self-reported level of comprehension, topic familiarity, features of an L2 text and reading ability in the L1 and L2. *Current Research on the Acquisition of Spanish*, 15-33.
- Zhang, S. (2009). The role of input, interaction, and output in the development of oral fluency. *English Language Teaching*, 2(4), 91–100.
- Zhang, R., & Zhong, J. (2012). The hindrance of doubt: Causes of language anxiety. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 2(3), 27.
- Zhanibek, A. (2001). *The relationship between language anxiety and students' participation in foreign language classes* (MA Thesis). Accessed from YOK Thesis Center database (103655).
- Zhao, A. (2009). *Foreign language reading anxiety: Investigating English-speaking university students learning Chinese as a foreign language in the United States* (Unpublished doctoral thesis). Florida State University, Florida.

Zin, M. Z. (2007). *The relationship between reading anxiety and academic reading performance among ESL learners* (Doctoral dissertation, University Putra Malaysia). Access address: <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/42992003.pdf>



APPENDICES

Appendix 1. Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS)

ÇOCUKLAR İÇİN YABANCI DİL KAYGI ÖLÇEĞİ

Merhabalar Ben İngilizce Öğretmeni Elif KAYHAN. Sakarya Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü İngiliz Dili Eğitim Ana Bilim Dalı'nda Yüksek Lisans öğrencisiyim. Prof. Dr. Firdevs KARAHAN Hocam'ın danışmanlığında yürüttüğüm tez çalışmam için siz tatlı öğrencilerden ricam bu anketi doldurmanız. Soruları okuyup karşısındaki yüz ifadelerinden size uygun olanı işaretleyerek katılımınız benim için çok önemli. Şimdiden çok teşekkür ediyorum.

İSİM/SOYİSİM: YAŞ: CİNSİYET: SINIF:

KAÇ YILDIR İNGİLİZCE ÖĞRENIYORSUN:

DERS BAŞARINIZ NEDİR? : ☐ (100-85)

☐ (84-70)

☐ (69-60)

☐ (59-50)

☐ (49-0)

BABANIN EĞİTİM SEVİYESİ: ☐ ÜNİVERSİTE ☐ LİSE ☐ ORTAOKUL ☐ İLKOKUL

ANNENİN EĞİTİM SEVİYESİ: ☐ ÜNİVERSİTE ☐ LİSE ☐ ORTAOKUL ☐ İLKOKUL

EKONOMİK DÜZEY: ☐ YÜKSEK ☐ ORTA ☐ DÜŞÜK

AİLENİN İNGİLİZCE ÖĞRENME BEKLENTİSİ: ☐ YÜKSEK ☐ ORTA ☐ DÜŞÜK

	Çok Mutsuz	Mutsuz	Nötr	Mutlu	Çok mutlu
1.Daha fazla İngilizce dersine girsen ne hissedersin?					
2. İngilizce dersinin sınavlarında ne hissediyorsun?					
3.İngilizce dersine girince ne hissediyorsun?					
4.Derste İngilizce konuşurken ne hissediyorsun?					
5.İngilizce derslerinde öğretmen sana seslendiğinde ne hissediyorsun?					
6.İngilizce dersinde sana söz hakkı verildiğinde ne hissediyorsun?					
7.İngilizce konuşmak için öğrenmen gereken çok kural olduğunu gördüğünde ne hissediyorsun?					
8.Bir İngiliz'le konuşsaydın ne hissederdin?					
9.Arkadaşlarının önünde İngilizce konuşurken ne hissediyorsun?					
10.İngilizce derslerinde hazırlık yapmadan konuşman gerekince ne hissedersin?					
11.İngilizce derslerinde bildiğin şeyleri unuttunca ne hissediyorsun?					
12.İngilizce dersinde hata yapınca ne hissediyorsun?					
13.İngilizce derslerinde başarsız olursan ne hissedersin?					
14.Öğretmenin düzelttiği şeyi anlamadığında ne hissediyorsun?					
15.Öğretmenin İngilizce söylediklerini anlamadığında ne hissediyorsun?					
16.İngilizce öğretmenin çalışmadığın yerden soru sorunca ne hissedersin?					
17.İngilizce konuşurken diğer öğrenciler sana gülecek olursa ne hissedersin?					
18.İngilizce dersine çok iyi hazırlanınca ne hissediyorsun?					
19.İngilizce derslerinde parmak kaldırdığında ne hissediyorsun?					
20.İngilizce dersinin sınavına çok çalıştığında ne hissediyorsun?					

Appendix 2. Semi-Structured Interview Questions in Turkish

1. İngilizce dersini seviyor musun?

- Bu dersle ilgili neleri seviyorsun?
- Bu dersle ilgili neleri sevmiyorsun?

2. Ders sırasında nasıl hissediyorsun?

- Ders sırasında hangi durumlar seni hissettirir?

3. Ders sırasında kaygılı/stresli hissettiğin zamanlar oluyor mu?

- Derste hangi durumlar sende kaygı ve strese sebep olur?

4. Derste en büyük kaygın nedir?

5. Kaygılı/ stresli hissettiğin zaman derste ne yapıyorsun?

6. Ders sırasında ne yapmak senin rahat hissetmene yardımcı olur?

Appendix 3. Semi-Structured Interview Questions in English

1. Do you like English lessons?
 - What do you like about this lesson?
 - What don't you like about this lesson?
2. How do you feel during the class?
 - What situations make you feel during the lesson?
3. Are there times when you feel anxious / stressful during class?
 - Which situations cause you anxiety and stress in the lesson?
4. What is your biggest concern in the lesson?
5. What do you do in class when you feel anxious / stressed?
6. What will help you feel comfortable doing during class?

Appendix 4. Research Permission Paper of Provincial Directorate of National Education

T.C.
SAKARYA VALİLİĞİ
İl Millî Eğitim Müdürlüğü

Sayı : 29065503-605.01-E.16978428
Konu : Araştırma Uygulaması
Elif KAYHAN

20/11/2020

VALİLİK MAKAMINA

Sakarya Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü Müdürlüğü Yüksek Lisans Programı öğrencisi Elif KAYHAN'ın tez araştırması kapsamında "Young Learners Foreign Language Anxiety Level and Anxiety Sources" konulu araştırma uygulama talebi, adı geçen Üniversitenin 04/11/2020 tarihli ve 9979 sayılı yazıları ile bildirilmiştir.

Söz konusu araştırmanın, Müdürlüğümüz Karasu ilçesine bağlı ekte belirtilen okullarda, eğitim öğretimin aksamasına mahal vermeden gönüllülük esasına dayalı olarak, okul yönetiminin belirleyeceği zaman ve şartlarda 2020-2021 eğitim öğretim yılında uygulanması, çalışmada sadece ekteki mühürlü anket sorularının kullanılması ve yasal gerekliliğin ilgili okul müdürlüğünce yerine getirilmesi kaydıyla Müdürlüğümüzce uygun görülmektedir.

Makamlarınızca da uygun görülmesi halinde olurlarınıza arz ederim.

Fazilet DURMUŞ
İl Millî Eğitim Müdürü

OLUR
20/11/2020

Erdoğan ÜLKER
Vali a.
Vali Yardımcısı



Camili Resmi Daireler Kampüsü
B Blok 54290 Adapazarı / SAKARYA

Ayrıntılı bilgi için: C. TURAN
Tel: (0 264) 251 36 14
Faks: (0 264) 251 36 11

Bu evrak güvenli elektronik imza ile imzalanmıştır. <https://evraksorgu.meb.gov.tr> adresinden c281-ee09-3270-819e-9e60 kodu ile teyit edilebilir.